

KOMPARATĪVISTIKAS  
ALMANAHS

JOURNAL OF  
COMPARATIVE STUDIES

DAUGAVPILS UNIVERSITY  
ACADEMIC PRESS "SAULE"

2019

Kačāne I., Romanovska A. (red.) *Komparatīvistikas almanahs Nr. 12 (41)*. Daugavpils: Daugavpils Universitātes Akadēmiskais apgāds "Saule", 2019, 138 lpp.

Kačāne I., Romanovska A. (eds.) *Journal of Comparative Studies No 12 (41)*. Daugavpils: Daugavpils University Academic Press "Saule", 2019, 138 p.

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Ilze Kačāne, Daugavpils University, Latvia – editor

Alīna Romanovska, Daugavpils University, Latvia – editor

Elisa Bizzotto, Iuav University of Venice, Italy

Jian-bang Deng, Tamkang University, Taiwan

Stefano-Maria Evangelista, University of Oxford, United Kingdom

Sonia F. Farid, Cairo University, Egypt

Alena Fedorova, Ural Federal University, Russia

Tatiana Filosofova, University of North Texas, USA

Rolf Füllmann, University of Cologne, Germany

Benedikts Kalnačs, University of Latvia, Latvia

Ervand Margaryan, Russian-Armenian (Slavonic) University, Armenia

Kristina Mullamaa, University of Tartu, Estonia

James M. Nyce, Ball State University, USA

Irēna Saleniece, Daugavpils University, Latvia

Anita Stašulāne, Daugavpils University, Latvia

Geoffrey Swain, University of Glasgow, United Kingdom

Ryszard Wolny, University of Opole, Poland

The publication of the Journal has been approved at Daugavpils University Science Council meeting on 15 October, 2019, Minutes No 14.

Proof reader: Broņislava Kalniņa

Lay-out: Marina Stočka

All papers in the Journal are anonymously peer-reviewed.

DAUGAVPILS UNIVERSITY



INSTITUTE OF HUMANITIES  
AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

JOURNAL OF  
COMPARATIVE STUDIES

NO 12 (41)



# CONTENTS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| FOREWORD .....  | 6   |
| JELENA KOROŁOVA, OKSANA KOVZELE<br>Latvians', Latgalian's' and Russians' Paremijs about Life .....  | 10  |
| JIHAN ZAKARRIYA<br>Childhood and the Non-Human in Modern Scottish<br>Novels .....   | 26  |
| SILVIO TAMASO D'ONOFRIO<br>History and Historian: Yesterday and Today .....   | 48  |
| CAREN J. FROST, ASTER S. TECLE, SUAIVIS KANYANGE,<br>KILEE JORGENSEN, NATHAN P. DEVIR<br>Exploring Integration Issues for African Youth of<br>Refugee Backgrounds in Utah ..... | 66  |
| BURCU GUMUS<br>Examining Tattooing as a Form of Identity Expression<br>and Interaction Process – Atatürk Tattooing Case .....   | 94  |
| ANTRA MIEZE<br>Discourses of "Healthy" and "Unhealthy" Nutrition<br>Constructed by Pupils and Adults .....  | 122 |

# FOREWORD

Features of modern humanities are determined by efforts to overcome a long-term crisis, the reasons for which are extremely diverse. They are to be found in the trends for societal development and in the demand for the science that is rooted in reality and is related to real life, as well as in the inability of the humanities to resolve fundamental issues of the human world perception and the methodology of its exploration, and the overly excessive numbers of specialists with the education in the sphere of the humanities in the past and the reluctance of modern young people to acquire education in this sphere. The list of reasons can be continued, and they fully confirm the significance of the crisis of the humanities in public consciousness.

The strength of the humanities is in the focus on an individual and everything that shapes their world perception. An individual is a universe formed by the environment but the one who is capable of developing and influencing that environment. The humanities understand an individual and the space of their existence in interaction; the human activity is analysed as a projection of opposite vectors, that is, both emphasizing the impact of an individual on the environment and the impact of the environment on the individual. Focus on an individual is an important feature of the humanities, which ensures the existence of the science for as long as the humanity exists.

Modern trends in the global development have proved the need for transformations in the humanities. One type of this transformation is interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary research that examines an individual from the perspective of different sciences, providing a link to actual real-life events and offering new, unconventional ways of solving complex problems. Research papers included in this collection offer a deep scientific study and examination of various spheres of society (language, literature, history, art, culture, etc.) and other urgent issues in the transdisciplinary perspective, which allows finding innovative solutions to the problems of co-existence and interaction between an individual and the environment.

Using the techniques of comparative paremiology Jelena Korošova and Oksana Kovzele focus on the Latvians', Latgalian's and Russians' paremias that are believed to constitute a spiritual triangle "myth – language – culture". The researchers present a comparative analysis of Russian and Latgalian paremias, primarily proverbs, about life in the context of Latvian proverbs recorded previously and included in folklore collections and phraseological dictionaries by Latvian folklorists. The uniqueness of the empirical linguistic material lies in the fact that the entire corpus of the Russian paremias contains more than 7,000 units having been recorded since 1977 from the Old Believers living in the south-eastern part of Latvia – Latgale and from the Orthodox living in the former territory of Latvia – Pytalovo (currently the territory of the Russian Federation).

A literary vector of the issue is presented by Jihan Zakarriya who provides as postcolonial ecocritical reading of two Scottish writers' novels while focusing on the concepts of childhood and identity and analysing the children characters depicted in a constant state of query and dissidence. The formation of identity in the confrontational framework of the Self and the Other provoked by the traumatic past is based on the aspiration for deeper understanding the present.

Following the idea that past experiences shape our identities and affect what we are today, Silvio Tamaso D'Onofrio reflects on the concept of History in antiquity and nowadays to contribute to a critical re-reading of historiographic bases and to foster a critical discussion that also gives investment in the teaching of History in classroom. The study emphasizes that it is the past that has answers to the questions of the present; hence, the mission to build the future may be successfully accomplished only when the past has been critically re-considered.

The success or failure of integration can affect the future identities of children and young people, therefore a critical and open dialogue is crucial among all members of the society, especially schools, students and teachers. By employing ethnographic approach, the issues of identity, integration and acculturation among African refugee youth in Utah (the United States) have been analysed in the article by Caren J. Frost et. al. Based on data obtained during the interviews, among the central themes that are closely related to the integration process in its connection to the school experience and to notions of belonging are: frustration with ineffective language-learning frameworks, unclarity in the school system processes, importance of religious affiliation and extracurricular activities, and notions of alterity.

Individuals have a choice to create their identities according to their own beliefs about the world. The meaning of the concept of identity cannot be considered as full-bodied without its constituent part – the “other”. Burcu Gumus explores tattooing as a means for not only expressing individual beliefs and opinions, but also for demonstrating a group identity. Her study based on the analysis of the data from in-depth interviews and participatory observations carried out in İstanbul (Turkey) is aimed at understanding the social construction of the human body through tattoos as a means of self-expression. The author examines the processes of owning and exhibiting of Atatürk tattoos (signatures, portraits) and their impact on the individuals’ experiences.

Personal, social, and cultural experiences can also be reflected via dietary practices and eating habits that are interpreted in complex and diverse ways. Antra Mieze analyses the concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition and investigates pupils’ eating habits in Latvia’s schools focusing on their understanding of “healthiness” and “un-healthiness” of food. The results of multiple case studies reveal that while reflecting upon and defining these concepts pupils most often use adults’ pre-constructed interpretations but at the same time they actively re-contextualize and transform them.

Editors of the collection:

Ilze Kačāne

Alīna Romanovska



# LATVIANS', LATGALIANS' AND RUSSIANS' PAREMIAS ABOUT LIFE

**JEĻENA KOROĻOVA**

**OKSANA KOVZELE**

Jeļena Koroļova, Dr. philol., researcher, associate professor  
Centre of Cultural Research  
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences  
Daugavpils University, Latvia  
e-mail: jelena.korolova@du.lv

Oksana Kovzele, Dr. philol., researcher  
Centre of Cultural Research  
Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences  
Daugavpils University, Latvia  
e-mail: oksana.kovzele@du.lv

Dr. philol. Jeļena Koroļova is a researcher and associate professor of the Centre of Cultural Research at Daugavpils University Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences. She is an expert of the Latvian Council of Science, Member of the Promotional Council in Comparative and Contrastive Linguistics and the author of more than 160 scientific articles. Her main field of research is the Latvian Old Believers' language and culture, ethnolinguistics and dialectology.

Dr. philol. Oksana Kovzele is a researcher of the Centre of Cultural Research at Daugavpils University Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences. She is the author of more than 40 scientific articles and the editor and member of the Scientific Boards of 15 scientific journals and conference proceedings. Her main research interests are comparative literature, comparative linguistics and cultural studies. Currently she is implementing a postdoctoral project "Transformations of Festive Culture in the Borderland: the Case of Latgale and Pskov Regions" supported by EU ERAF.

## ABSTRACT

The paper presents the analysis of 95 Latgalian and Russian paremias (proverbs, sayings, comparisons, and idioms), the bulk of which are proverbs. The entire corpus of the Russian paremias analysed contains more than 7,000 units. All of them were recorded by Jeļena Koroļova in the period 1977–2018 from the Old Believers of Latgale (they appeared in Latgale after the Church Schism of 1666) and in the period 1970–2015 – from the Orthodox living in Pytalovo (that territory was part of the first Latvian Republic from the 1920s to the 1940s). In order to compare them with Latvian proverbs, folklore collections, phraseological dictionaries, the dictionary compiled by Bernadeta Opincāne, as well as works of the Latvian folklorist Elza Kokare have been used. Modern Latgalian proverbs have been collected in recent years by Oksana Kovzele.

In the research development, the techniques of comparative paremiology have been used to determine the existence of the two nations' traditions in the comparative aspect.

Paremias, proverbs above all, reflect the interaction of cultures and languages in the religious, national and regional aspects. The interaction of cultures in the sphere of the existence of paremias is of a two-sided nature. Borrowed proverbs testify to the fact that culture is a unifying factor for different ethnic groups living in the same state. The origins of popular conceptions of philosophical understanding of life should be sought either in Christianity or in the mythological views of ancient people.

**Keywords:** proverbs, paremias, variants, feature, adjective, comparisons, dialectal words

## INTRODUCTION

In the era of the priority of anthropological research, interest in proverbs as a source of popular wisdom is quite natural. Proverbs summarize popular beliefs and opinions as the result of the people's intuitive philosophy and centuries-old everyday experience. It should be added that most often a proverb has a rhythmically organized and rhymed structure, which contributes to its acquisition, even if it is borrowed, which is important for the oral acquisition of paremias, as is our case.

Proverbs may be either figurative or literal. Most often, literal proverbs serve only for edification and teaching, while figurative ones – apart from edification and teaching, are poetic means of decorating speech, i.e. they perform aesthetic and poetic functions. At the same time, proverbs may have mutually exclusive meanings thus reflecting the dialectic of real life, different views on the same events and situations of representatives of various social groups of a society.

A proverb is a judgment; it is built according to the rules of logic; that is why proverbs always have the structure of a sentence.

Proverbs function as concise texts because there is some sort of life situation behind them. Proverbs are signs of situations, i.e. they have semiotic meanings. At the same time, "the very situations refer to all proverbs that designate them as invariants to their variants" (Jankovichova 2008, 432). Moreover, proverbs are a way of "storing and transmitting culturally significant information" (Semenenko 2008, 404), i.e. they act as culturally significant signs. They are an important element in the definition of folk consciousness and psychology, although, of course, they can hardly be considered a textbook on folk psychology. However, they adequately reflect the worldview of a dialect society.

The main function of proverbs is the pragmatic one, "Пословица к слову молвится" [the proverb is called forth by the word]. Proverbs may be considered a kind of code of a people's life. They "are not created, but are compelled by force of circumstances" (Dal' 1984, 11). Svetlana Tolstaja holds that proverbs and sayings "preserve the relative freedom of the pragmatic goal: depending on the situation, one and the same proverb may be a reproach, a consolation, a moral, a justification, a prescription, a piece of advice, etc." (Tolstaja 2008, 56–57). Edification is an important property of proverbs. They are

“both moral law and common sense expressed in a brief maxim, which ancestors bequeathed as instructions for their descendants” (Buslaev 1854, 37). Exactly because they perform the function of prohibition and prescription within the transfer of accumulated knowledge, abilities and skills to future generations, proverbs are widely distributed and used in dialectal discourse. We are interested in the folklore discourse of the Russians and the Latgalians living together in Latgale since the end of the seventeenth century, after the appearance of migration flows of the Russian Old Believers fleeing persecution for their faith from within the Russian state. At that time, the territory of today’s Latgale was part of the Polish state of Rzeczpospolita, which then urgently needed an influx of human resources due to the war and the plague epidemic.

In this paper, we study the paremias, but the main focus is on proverbs. Thus, the study involves a wider range of phenomena (not only proverbs) with common pragmatics. These are proverbs and sayings, maxims and aphorisms, phraseology and comparative constructions. Thus, an important aspect of paremiological studies within the comparative analysis of languages is the search for invariants, or “universal atoms of meaning” (Anna Wiezhebicka), on the basis of which they are combined into common blocks, thematic groups, and parallels (Elza Kokare). This approach allows for the identification of the common, the universal, the typological and the specific national in the paremias of two peoples.

The source of the research is the material collected by the authors from the Russians and the Latgalians in Latgale, as well as the published sources on Latgalian, Latvian and Russian materials. The Russian material has been recorded by Jeļena Koroļova since 1970 in Pytalovo and since 1977 – in Latgale. This material demonstrates paremias as they are used in real life. In addition, we make use of Lithuanian Old Believers’ proverbs (these also are Old Believers – Bespopovtsy of the Pomeranian branch of the same migration flow as the Old Believers of Latgale), since they are recorded in Zarasai, which is located about 30 kilometres from Daugavpils. Live Latgalian material has been recorded nowadays by Oksana Kovzele. The Russian respondents from today’s Latgale are Old Believers, but the respondents from Pytalovo, which was part of Latgale in the period 1920–1940, are Orthodox; the Latvians, whose proverbs have been extracted from the monographs by Elza Kokare, are in most cases Protestants; the Latgalians representing the main population of Latgale are Catholics. In addition, we use published sources, from which we have extracted the material recorded in different years throughout the territory of Latvia, including also Latgale. Thus, we

combine written and oral sources recorded from Russians, Latgalians and Latvians, Orthodox, Old Believers, Catholics and Protestants, which have been collected nowadays and at the end of the twentieth century, the sources published in the past, as well as very recent ones.

In recent studies (Bobkina 2010; Orlova, Kolosova, Medvedev, Barov 2018, and others), proverbs and sayings are mainly considered as language elements, in which the particularities of thinking, cultural experience and the system of values of a separate society are presented in a concentrated form. Such an approach makes it possible to distinguish and analyse the fundamental concepts (spatial, temporal, and anthropological) on the basis of the material under study. A number of studies touch upon the issue of borrowing and influences (Iakovleva and Nikolaeva 2016), as well as offer a comparative-contrastive analysis of proverbs and sayings, as a rule, by using the example of two unrelated languages (Ionescu 2017; Mosiashvili 2015, and others).

The study has been developed by using the techniques of comparative paremiology, designed to determine, if possible, the genesis and the existence of the folklore tradition of two peoples in a comparative aspect. The authors attempt to trace the historical-genetic and contact parallels of the paremias of two peoples. Such an approach is found in the works of Boris Putilov (the development of the methodology of comparative folklore; Putilov 1976) and Elza Kokare (the comparative historical study of Latvian paremias, the nature of international parallels and national paremias and their share in the common repertoire of Latvian paremias; Kokare 1978, 1988), the representatives of the paremiological school of Valeriy Mokienko (the comparative study and lexicographical description of the paremias of different nations; Mokienko 2008).

## “TO LIVE A LIFE IS NOT AS TO SEW A SACK”

Man and the surrounding world appear in the proverbs of Latvians and Russians in a very multifaceted way. The philosophical view of life is presented in proverbs with the keyword *life*. The maxim *life is difficult* is reflected in the Latvian-Russian parallel: “Mūžu dzīvot ne maisu šūt” [to live a life is not as to sew a sack] (Niedre and Ozols 1955, 281). A calque from the Latvian language is fixed in J. Koroljova’s “Dialektnyj slovar’ odnoj sem’i – 2”: “Да, жизнь прожить – не мех шить” [yes, to live a life is not as to sew a sack], “Век сжить – не мех шить” [to live a life is not as to sew a sack] (the dialectal мех – ‘sack’) (Koroljova 2013, 97). The proverb is wide-

spread in the Russian oral use in the territory of Russia and is very popular in all strata of society, but it is known in another variant: “Жизнь прожить – не поле перейти” [to live a life is not to cross a field]. The widespread use of this proverb by the Russians in Russia makes it possible to consider this particular variant as the primary source. The comparison with other variants widespread in the whole space of Russian folklore allows for the identification of four stages corresponding to the main periods of the human life cycle. First, these are simple housekeeping concerns related to the home: weaving *lapti* (‘bast shoes’), sewing, and cooking: “Жизнь изжить – не лапоть сплести” [to live a life is not to weave a bast shoe] (Dal’ 1984, 225); “Жиру вести – не лапоть плести” [to keep the house is not to weave a bast shoe] (Nefedova 2008, 220); “Век изжить – не рукавицей тряхнуть” [to live a life is not to shake a mitten] (Dal’ 1984, 225); “Жизнь прожить – не мех сшить” [to live a life is not to sew a sack]; “Жизнь прожить – не ниткой шить” [to live a life is not to stitch a thread] (Kartoteka...); “Жить – не лукошко шить” [to live is not to craft a basket] (Anikin 1988, 99); “Жизнь прожить – не сермягу (‘caftan of coarse homespun cloth’) пошить” [to live a life is not to sew a caftan] (Gudonene 2007, 385); “Жизнь прожить – не мутовку (‘a whisk for whipping sour cream’) облизать” [to live a life is not to lick a whisk] (Anikin 1988, 99).

Second, there are activities outside the home, focused on the locus typical for a peasant farmer – a field: “Жизнь прожить – не поле перейти, не поле переехать, не поле перебежать, не в поле ехать, не поле ехать” [to live a life is not to cross a field, not to drive over a field, not to run over a field, not to go to/into the field] (Kartoteka...). All of these are variants of the prototypical proverb of the whole nation “Жизнь прожить – не поле перейти” [to live a life is not to cross a field]. The great number of variants testifies to the high degree of frequency of the use of the proverb. Field has a specific semantic function in the organization of the folklore space (cited from Bajburin 2005, 18). Let us recall Russian folk tales, spells, and songs in which the epic part of the narrative often unfolds in an open field.

Third, the Arkhangelsk proverb “Жизнь прожить – не волок переехать” [to live a life is not to cross a portage] (the space between water bodies, along which boats and cargo are dragged over the ground) (Kartoteka...). Here, it is the semantics of transition that is important.

Fourth, crossing a body of water: “Жизнь прожить – не реку брести” [to live a life is not to wade across a river] (Kartoteka...); “Жизнь прожить – не море переплыть” [to live a life is not to cross

the sea] (Zimin and Spirin 2006, 150). Villages were usually located on the banks of rivers. In addition, the path to the underworld in European culture is associated with crossing an underground river. Besides, water organizes the folklore space, too.

Thus, the sphere of life is the spatial area between one's home, a field, a path to water and a river, the crossing of which marks the end of the life cycle. The four loci of the proverb correspond to the four age periods of human life: childhood (1), mature age (2), elderly (3), old age and death (4) (Koroļova 2008, 58–60).

Latgalian compare a human's life cycle with different moments of the day and it consists of three stages: "Reitam cereiba, dinai dorbs, vokoram mīrs" [hope – for the morning, work – for the day, rest – for the evening] (Opincāne 2000, 66). For this reason there are so many proverbs with the lexeme *day* in Latgalian folklore, for example: "Kotrai dīnai sovas ryupes" [each day has its own concerns] (Opincāne 2000, 38); "Kotrai dīnai sovs vārds" [each day has its own name] (Opincāne 2000, 38); "Kotrai dīnai sova nakts" [each day has its own night] (Opincāne 2000, 38); "Nav dīnas bez nakts" [there is no day without night] (Opincāne 2000, 53); "Kotra dīna nav svātdīne" [not every day is Sunday] (Opincāne 2000, 38), etc.

The same range includes also the association of life with the seasons, which, according to mythological conceptions, were two – *winter* and *summer*. In Latgalian proverbs, the transitional seasons are particularly significant, i.e. spring and autumn, which are very important for farmers. "Pavasars sūla – rudiņš izpylda" [spring promises, autumn performs] (Opincāne 2000, 62). That is why exactly these seasons are also often featured in Latgalian proverbs. "Rudinī i bōba gudra, pavasarī i vecs duraks" [in the autumn even a woman is smart, in the spring, even an old man is a fool] (Opincāne 2000, 67); "Rudinī ganeņš gudrōks par orōju pavasarī" [in autumn a young shepherd is smarter than a ploughman in the spring] (Opincāne 2000, 67). A strong member of the opposition is *autumn*: "Rudiņš – myusu barōtōjs" [autumn is our breadwinner] (Opincāne 2000, 67); "Rudiņteņš – bogōts veirs" [autumn is a rich man] (Opincāne 2000, 67).

The conceptions about life are based on binary oppositions. Life is inextricably linked with death: "Молодой ждѣт жизни, а старый – могилы" [a young man is waiting for life, an old man – for the grave] (Shifrisova). The conceptions about life are related not only to the opposition of life and death, but also to the opposition of the younger generation to the older generation.

One observes also the opposition of the sky (sacred space) and the earth, which is associated with a farmer's everyday life.

“Na ar debesim ļaudis dzeivoj, bet ar dorbu” [people don’t live by heaven, but rather by work] (Opincāne 2000, 53). The main appeal to work is contained in the proverb “Nu zyļa gaisa nivīns navar dzeivōt” [none can live from the blue air] (Opincāne 2000, 59). The Russian parallel sounds like this: “Воздухом сыт не будешь” [you can’t be satiated with air], therefore “Dorbs dora dzeivi soldu, slynkums – ryugtu” [work makes life sweet, laziness makes it bitter] (Opincāne 2000, 16); “Syuram dorbam soldi augļi” [hard work brings sweet fruit] (Opincāne 2000, 68). Thus, the proverb “Reitam cereiba, dīnai dorbs, vokoram mīrs” [hope – for the morning, work – for the day, rest – for the evening] (Opincāne 2000, 66) determines the vector of man’s vital interests throughout the whole of their life. Each of the vectors is represented by a huge number of paremias, but in this research paper we will not dwell upon them.

The life code can be briefly reduced to several postulates. Every person has their own destiny, every person lives their own way and occupies their own social niche in society. In the linguistic structure of paremias, this is manifested in the frequency of the presence of the possessive pronoun *свой* (one’s own (his, her, their)): “Kotram sova dzeive jōdzeivoj” [every man has to live his own life] (Opincāne 2000, 37); “Nivīns nu sova liktiņa naizbēgs” [nobody will escape their fate] (Opincāne 2000, 57); “Na pēc vīnas receptes dzeivojam” [we don’t live according to one recipe] (Opincāne 2000, 54); “Na vysim putnenim vīnā bērztolā dzīdōt” [not all birds will sing in the same birch grove] (Opincāne 2000, 54); “Nu vōrnas laksteigolas naiztaiseisi” [you can’t make a nightingale out of a crow] (Opincāne 2000, 59); “Palākam putnam palāka dzīsmē” [a grey bird has a grey song] (Opincāne 2000, 62).

However, in every person’s life there is a place for happiness: “Nav dzeives bez laimes” [there is no life without happiness] (Opincāne 2000, 53); “Kotram mōkūņam ir sova sudorba maleņa” [every cloud has a silver brim lining] (Opincāne 2000, 38).

There is a call to an ascetic way of life encountered: “Ēd syuru, dzer skōbu, tod i zemē napyusi” [eat bitter, drink sour, then you won’t rot in earth] (Opincāne 2000, 19). “Āt speķi, vairōk spāka byus” [eat lard and you’ll have more strength] (Krāslava district, Skaista). In Russian folklore, there is a corresponding proverb “Живи просто – выживёшь лет со ста” [live simply, then you will live to a hundred] (Dal’ 1984, 544); “Живи просто – проживёшь лет со ста” [live simply and you’ll live a hundred years] (Blagova 2000, 114).

Life is diverse; in the Latgalian proverbs, the main means of organizing this diversity of life in paremias is a *feature*, primarily an

adjective as a part of speech, which is specifically designed to convey the semantics of the feature. Taking into account that the “identification, comparison, classification and evaluation of objects are performed by means of features; and feature is the most important tool for the acquisition and categorization of the world” (Tolstaja 2002, 8), this is quite natural. In the oral use among the Russians, there is a common expression “Жизнь в полоску: то чёрная полоса, то белая” [life is striped; a black stripe is followed by a white one]; “Это всё в жизни переплетено – чёрное, белое” [all in life is intertwined – black, white] (Daugavpils). It is echoed by the Latgalian proverb “Myužā joredz gon boltas, gon naboltas dīnas” [one should see both white and black days in life] (Opincāne 2000, 51). Nouns can enter into antonymic relations, too: “Dīvs laidis cylvāku pasaulē prikim un bādom” [God let man into the world for joy and misery] (Opincāne 2000, 15). In the opposition *black – white*, the strong member of the opposition is *black*. Contextually, *black* is synonymous to the adjective *heavy/hard*: “Gryutas dīnas par akmini gryutōkas” [heavy days are heavier than a stone] (Opincāne 2000, 21) and the adjective with the meaning of taste *syurs* (‘bitter’): “Myužs syurs kai vērmeles” [life is as bitter as wormwood] (Opincāne 2000, 51).

In Latvian paremias, the main property of life, i.e. its diversity, is transmitted by the keyword *raibs* – ‘motley, colourful’. There are several variants of such proverbs: “Cilvēka mužs raibs kā pupas zieds” [human life is as motley as a bean’s flower]; “Cylvāka myužs raibs kai dzeņa vādars” [man’s life is as colourful as the woodpecker’s belly] (Opincāne 2000, 12); “Cilvēka mūžs tik raibs kā dzenis” [human life is as colourful as a woodpecker] (Niedre and Ozols 1955, 45), “Dzenis raibs, bet cilveka mūžs vēl raibāks” [a woodpecker is colourful, but man’s life is more colourful] (Niedre and Ozols 1955, 282), “Dzeņš raibs – cylvāka myužs vē] raibōks” [the woodpecker is colourful – human life is even more colourful] (Opincāne 2000, 17); “Mūsu dzīvība raibāka nekā puķu ziedi” [our life is more colourful than ablooming flower] (Niedre and Ozols 1955, 64); “Dzīve raiba kā cimds” [life is as colourful as a mitten] (Niedre and Ozols 1955, 282), “Nekur neiet tik raibi kā pasaulē” [nowhere is more colourful than in the world] (Niedre, Ozols 1955, 282). However, the national specificity is most vividly reflected in the proverb “Dzīve raiba kā cimds” [life is as colourful as a mitten], because Latvian mittens are knit with a national ornament of multi-coloured threads. In this case, the folk motive is confirmed at the level of the object code.

In Latgale, Elza Kokare has recorded the following proverbs with the lexeme *raibs* (‘motley, colourful, speckled’): “Vai viens suns

vien raibs!" [Is only one dog speckled!] (Daugavpils, Ilūkste); "Vai viens vien suns raibs!" [Is only one dog speckled!]; "Na tev viņam raiba gūvs" [not only you have a spotted cow] (Rēzekne) (Kokare 1988, 216). A proverb recorded from the Latgalians in Latgale "Jo raibōks, jo smukōks" [the more colourful, the more beautiful] (Opincāne 2000, 28) includes an aesthetic component, which makes it possible to conclude that proverbs with the word *raibs* reflect the national specificity of the Latvian proverbial discourse, because the national component is reflected in proverbs with an aesthetic component.

In the Russian dialectal language and the urban colloquial speech in Latgale, the word *рябый* ('speckled') is frequently encountered in the oral use. The word is of Indo-European origin. Its preservation in the dialect language of the Old Believers of Latgale is apparently supported by the Latvian and the Lithuanian languages, including the mentioned paremias: "Рябые такие (олени)" [So speckled (deer)] (Rēzekne district, Zuji); "Коровки такие сортовые – все рябые, все рябые" [cows are so pedigree – all speckled, all speckled] (Rēzekne district, Malta); "Не люблю эти рябые тряпки" [I do not like these speckled rags] (Daugavpils). A derivative of this adjective is recorded in the name of the cow *Рябёха*: "Одна была с цепью – Рябёха" [only one had a chain – Ryabyoha] (Rēzekne district, Zuji). However, the dialect word *рябый* ('speckled') does not occur in the Russian proverbial discourse; instead, the antonymous pair of colour adjectives is used *white – black*, which has a symbolic evaluative meaning. This testifies to the selectivity of the language of culture.

In Russian, paremias about life may overlap with other genres of folklore, primarily songs. Life itself can be compared with a song: "Жизнь прожил, как песню сложил" [one lived his life as if composed a song] (Gudonene 2007, 385); with a road: "Вот и жизнь вихлястая, как дорога" [life is twisty like a road] (Daugavpils); with snow: "Век прошёл, как снег сошёл" [the life passed as the snow melted] (Gudonene 2007, 385); with a wheel: "Вот жизнь-то как идёт, разным колесом она идёт" [this is how the life goes, it goes with a different wheel] (Preiļi district, Shnitkino); "Эта жизнь так и идёт, как в телеге колесо крутится" [this life goes on like the wheel spins in a cart] (Rēzekne district, Malta), "Жизнь как колесо катится и по воде, и по грязи" [life spins as a wheel, both by water and mud] (Gudonene 2007, 414); with the vortex ('whirlpool, swirling movement of air'): "Жизнь коловертью крутится – тяжело жить стало" [life is spinning – it has become hard to live] (Eglaine), with a raspberry: "Жизнь – не малина" [life is not a raspberry] (Līvāni);

with a river: “Жизнь быстро проходит, года текут рекой” [life passes quickly, years flow like a river] (Koroļova); with the sea: “Жизнь прожить, что море переплыть: побарахтаешься – и ко дну” [to live a life is like swimming across the sea: you flounder a bit – and to the bottom] (Fjodorovs 2008, 98); with flowers: “Я гляжу на него: ну как цветок цветёт, а ещё эта военная вся блестит, и все награды наденет, чтоб погордиться” [I’m looking at him: he’s blooming like a flower, and that military uniform is all shiny, and all the awards are put on to boast and take pride] (Preiļi district, Sanauža); with a ladder: “Живёт человек – что денёк, то ниже – что по лестнице” [thus man lives – with every day lower – as if by a ladder] (Preiļi district, Sanauža); with a sack and a poke (торба – ‘bag, package’, borrowed from Polish): “Всяко на веку наживёшься – в торбы и в меху” [one sees everything in life – both poverty and wealth] (Koroļova 2013, 152); with sleep: “Как во сне живём, а на яву умрём” [we live as if in a dream, but we’ll die in reality] (Gudonene 2007, 387), “Дети, не жалеите, кто долго живёт, то самое: 105 лет отжил, а что я видел, что раньше, как сон прошёл” [children, do not pity the one who lives for a long time, the very thing: I have lived 105 years, and what have I seen, it passed like a dream] (Krāslava district, Kalishevo); with a drawbar (‘a wooden rod for attaching a plough to the shafts’): “Жизнь как дышло, куда повернул, туда и вышло, сама понимаешь” [life is like a drawbar, where you turn it, there it goes, you understand it] (Daugavpils). This proverb is an alteration of the widespread Russian proverb “Закон, что дышло: куда повернул, туда и вышло” [law is like a drawbar: where you turn it, there it goes] (cf. every law has a loophole). The Old Believers’ life is strictly regulated; therefore it is connected with the law, i.e. the system of prohibitions and instructions. And the following paremia sounds as a testament to the descendants: как Иисус Христос должно жить староверу – ‘an Old Believer must live as Jesus Christ’: “Старовер должен жить, как Иисус Христос” [Old Believer should live like Jesus Christ] (Daugavpils district, Judovka).

Figurative comparisons of life with a *wheel*, *raspberries*, *a song*, *a field flower* (about a girl), *a dream* (Mokienko 2003, 177, 234, 315, 473, 406–407) have become stereotypes in Russian.

Comparisons are not so numerous among Latgalians. They rarely intersect with Russian paremias. A happy life is as if in the ear of God, or of a bear: “Dzeivoj kai Dīva ausī” [lives as if in God’s ear] (Opincāne 2000, 18); “Dzeivoj kai lōča ausī” [lives as if in a bear’s ear] (Opincāne 2000, 18); like a thumb in fat: “Dzeivoj kai eikss taukūs” [lives as if a thumb in the fat] (Opincāne 2000, 18); as

if a bird on a branch: “Dzeivoj kai putyns iz zora” [lives as if a bird on a branch] (Opincāne 2000, 18); as if in fog: “Dzeive it kai pa myglu” [life goes on as if in fog] (Opincāne 2000, 18); as if in sheep’s wool: “Dzeivoj kai pa jāra vylnu” [lives as if in a lamb’s wool] (Opincāne 2000, 18); “Dzeivoj uz cyta rēkina kai vuts vuškas vylnā” [lives at the expense of another, as if a louse in sheep’s wool] (Opincāne 2000, 18); like being naked in nettle: “Dzeivoj kai plyks pa nōtrem” [lives as if naked in nettle] (Opincāne 2000, 18); like a rose garden: “Dzeive nav rūžu dōrzs” [life is not a rose garden] (Opincāne 2000, 18); like a potato field: “Dzeive ir lels kartupeļu lauks, kas lelōks cyuka, tys vairōk izrūk” [life is a big field of potatoes, who is a big pig, he digs more] (Opincāne 2000, 18); like wormwood: “Myužs syurs kai vērmeles” [life is bitter like wormwood] (Opincāne 2000, 51).

It is obvious that the paremias of the two nations have almost no common points of contact. The exceptions are the paremias “Live like in God’s bosom” (Rus.) – “Like in God’s ear” (Latg.); “Like in a dream” (Rus.) – “Like in fog” (Latg.). However, these comparisons of the two peoples are based on archetypal images. These figurative comparisons have conceptual meaning and at the same time they reflect the concrete life of peasants and the dialect society’s philosophical-aesthetic attitude to life.

## CONCLUSION

The origins of popular conceptions of philosophical understanding of life should be sought either in Christianity (“Dīvs laidis cylvāku pasaulē priķim un bādom” [God let a man into the world for joy and misery]; “Старовер должен жить, как Исус Христос” [an Old Believer should live like Jesus Christ]), or in the ancient people’s mythological views. The analysis of the proverbial specifics allows for the identification of the ancient mythological foundations of the worldview of contacting peoples who have been living in the same territory since the seventeenth century, because the mythological is inseparable from everyday life. Proverbs provide a spiritual link between myth, language and culture.

The prototype of the whole series of proverbs about life is the Russian proverb “Жизнь прожить – не поле перейти” [to live a life is not to cross a field], occurring among the Russians of Latgale in the Latgalian variant “Жизнь прожить – не мех сшить” [to live a life is not to sew a sack]. In the light of mythological conceptions, the prototypical proverb reflects man’s entire life cycle from birth to

death. The proverb has three corresponding proverbs in Latgalian. One proverb represents life from the point of view of a Latgalian peasant who traditionally is engaged in potato cultivation and pig breeding: “Dzeive ir lels kartupeļu lauks, kas lelōks cyuka, tys vairōk izrūk” [life is a big potato field; who is a big pig, he digs more] (Opincāne 2000, 18); the second compares human life with the key points of the division of a day – morning, noon and evening: “Reitam cereiba, dīnai dorbs, vokoram mīrs” [hope – for the morning, work – for the day, rest – for the evening] (Opincāne 2000, 66); and the third – with two seasons – spring and autumn: “Pavasars sūla – rudiņš izpylda” [spring promises, autumn performs] (Opincāne 2000, 62). Thus, according to the mythological conceptions, man’s life cycle may be divided into four – three – two segments. The proverbs discussed are the expression of the global popular ideologems that lie in the basis of the Balto-Slavic folk calendar, which testifies to the linearity and cyclicity of life time in the conception of the Balts and the Slavs.

Feature is an important component of the numerous paremias about life in Latgalian folklore. The Latgalian paremias about life manifest binary oppositions of the archaic worldview: *black – white*, *bitter – sweet*, *old – young* and *life – death*, *sky – earth*, *day – night*, *spring – autumn*, *work – laziness*, *joy – trouble*, and *nightingale – crow*. In general, they feature the symbolism traditional for European culture.

An example of a feature that organizes the folklore space of the Latgalian proverb is the semantically saturated lexeme *raibs* (‘motley, colourful’). It is the neutralizing member of the opposition *black – white* and at the same time it carries specifically national senses, expressed at the level of the zoomorphic (*woodpecker*, *flowers*, *beans*) and the object (*mittens*) codes. The diversity of the life of both nations is demonstrated in figurative comparisons (another embodiment of the feature), though having a few parallels, but in both cultures they express conceptual meaning and reflect the philosophical and aesthetic attitudes of each dialect society to life in general.

Images of paremias are typical of a dialect society: this is the surrounding world of animals, plants, peasant life and human production activities. It is in this sphere that lexical dialectisms are often used. In some proverbs, there predominates specific vocabulary, in others – abstract vocabulary. Abstract vocabulary forms a layer of literal paremias, the main purpose of which is edification.

Definite vocabulary forms figurative paremias with vivid visual images, possessing figurative potential; it develops metaphorical

meanings that allow the conveying of allegorical meanings. In Latgalian proverbs, adjectives are often used to create imagery. Antonyms with pronounced evaluative symbolism may be used as well. In addition, Latgalian proverbs may contain contextual compatibility of adjectives and nouns: "Pēc dorba i maizeite solda" [after work even bread is sweet] (Opincāne 2000, 62). Colour adjectives that are not typical of Balto-Slavic folklore: *rose garden*, *blue air*, *silver cloud* refer to the sphere of the sublime. At the other extreme one finds a *grey bird singing grey songs*. The repetition has an intensifying meaning; tautology is typical of Latgalian paremias: "Gryutas dienas par akmini gryutōkas" [heavy days are heavier than a stone] (Opincāne 2000, 21). However, the choice has been made by a person, because "Kotram sova dzeive jōdzeivoj" [everyone has to live his own life] (Opincāne 2000, 37).

Latgalian and Russian paremias about life have a pronounced national character. This is confirmed by the previous studies by Elza Kokare (Kokare 1978, 167). These paremias reflect the interaction and the opposition of cultures and languages in the national and the regional aspects and their commonality in historical and genetic terms.

## REFERENCES

- Anikin, V. P. (ed.) (1988). *Russkie poslovice i pogovorki*. Moskva: Hudozhestvennaja literatura.
- Bajburin, A. K. (2005). *Zhilishhe v obrjadah i predstavlenijah vostochnyh slavjan*. Moskva: Jazyki slavjanskoj kul'tury.
- Blagova, G. F. (2000). *Poslovica i zhizn'*. Moskva: Vostochnaja literatura RAN.
- Bobkina, J. (2010). "Clothing, Sayings and Proverbs Taken through the Prism of the Russian Old-Believers." *4<sup>th</sup> Interdisciplinary Colloquium on Proverbs*. International Association of Paremiology. Tavira, Portugal (conference paper). Available at: <[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/270449372\\_CLOTHING\\_SAYINGS\\_AND\\_PROVERBS\\_TAKEN\\_THROUGH\\_THE\\_PRISM\\_OF\\_THE\\_RUSSIAN\\_OLD-BELIEVERS](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/270449372_CLOTHING_SAYINGS_AND_PROVERBS_TAKEN_THROUGH_THE_PRISM_OF_THE_RUSSIAN_OLD-BELIEVERS)> (accessed March 2019).
- Buslaev, F. I. (1854). *Russkie poslovice i pogovorki, sobrannye i objasnennye*. Moskva: v tipografii Aleksandra Semena.
- Dal', V. I. (1984). *Poslovice russkogo naroda*. V dvuh tomah. T. 1. Moskva: Hudozhestvennaja literatura.

- Fjodorovs, F. (ed.) (2008). "Poslovici i pogovorki." *Russkij fol'klor v zapisjah studentov Daugavpilsskogo universiteta (1963–1991) Komparativistikas institūta almanahs* 10 (4) / *Russian Folklore in the Recordings of the Students of Daugavpils University (1963–1991). Almanac of the Institute of Comparative Studies* 10 (4). Daugavpils: Daugavpils Universitātes Akadēmiskais apgāds "Saule", 98–100.
- Gudonene, V. (ed.) (2007). *Fol'klor staroobrjadcev Litvy. Teksty i issledovanie. Skazki. Poslovicy. Zagadki*. T. 1. Vil'njus: Vilniaus pedagoginio universiteto leidykla.
- Iakovleva, E. A. and Nikolaeva, O. V. (2016). "Chinese Proverbs in American Verbal Culture." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 7 (1), 284–292.
- Ionescu, D. C. (2017). *Food Idioms and Proverbs in English and Romanian – A Cross-linguistic and Cross-cultural Approach*. Bucharest: OSCARPRINT.
- Jankovichova, M. (2008). "Jekvivalentnost' vs idiomatichnost' russkikh i slovackikh poslovic." *ROSSICA OLOMUCENSIA XLVI–II*, 429–433.
- Kokare, E. (1978). *Internacional'noe i nacional'noe v latyshskih poslovicah i pogovorkah*. Rīga: Zvaigzne.
- Kokare, E. (1988). *Latviešu un vācu sakāmvērdi paralēles*. Rīga: Zinātne.
- Koroļova, J. (2013). *Dialektnyj slovar' odnoj sem'i – 2 (Pytalovskij rajon Pskovskoj oblasti)*. Daugavpils: Daugavpils Universitātes Akadēmiskais apgāds "Saule".
- Koroļova, J. *Dialektnyj slovar' odnoj sem'i – 3 (Pytalovskij rajon Pskovskoj oblasti)*. Daugavpils. Manuscript.
- Koroļova, J. (2008). "Russkie poslovicy o zhizni (jetnolingvisticeskij aspekt)." *Humanitāro Zinātņu Vēstnesis* 14, 51–63.
- Mokienko, V. M. (2008). "O principah sostavlenija slovarja 'Poslovicy v sovremennom russkom jazyke'." *ROSSICA OLOMUCENSIA XLVI–II*, 375–379.
- Mokienko, V. M. (2003). *Slovar' sravnenij russkogo jazyka*. 11 000 edinic. Sankt-Peterburg: Norint.
- Mosiashvili, N. (2015). "The Semantic Structure of Words Denoting Color in English and Georgian Proverbs." *Humanities and Social Sciences Review* 4 (2), 301–306.
- Nefedova, E. A. (2008). *Mnogoznachnost' i sinonimija v dialektnom prostranstve*. Moskva.
- Niedre, J. and Ozols, J. (comp.) (1955). *Latviešu sakāmvērdi un parunas*. Rīga: Latvijas Valsts izdevniecība.
- Opincāne, B. (comp.) (2000). *Latgaļu parunas un sokomvōrdi*. Rēzekne: Latgolas Kulturas centra izdevniecība.

Orlova, T. G., Kolosova, A., Medvedev, Y. S. and Barov, S. A. (2018). "Expressing of National and Cultural Identity in English and Russian Proverbs." *RUDN Journal of Language Studies, Semiotics and Semantics* 9 (2), 320–334.

Putilov, B. N. (1976). *Metodologija sravnitel'no-istoricheskogo izuchenija fol'klora*. Leninigrad: Nauka.

Semenenko, N. N. (2008). "Bazovye semanticheskie svojstva russkih paremij v svete kognitivno-diskursivnogo podhoda." *ROSSICA OLOMUCENSIA XLVI–II*, 403–407.

Shifrisova, F. F. *Fol'klor russkih Litvy*. Manuscript.

Tolstaja, S. M. (2002). Kategorija priznaka v simvolicheskom jazyke kul'tury. *Priznakovoe prostranstvo kul'tury*. Moskva: Indrik.

Tolstaja, S. M. (2008). *Prostranstvo slova. Leksicheskaja semantika v obshheslavjanskoj perspektive*. Moskva: Indrik.

Zimin, V. I. and Spirin, A. S. (comp.) (2006). *Poslovice i pogovorki russkogo naroda*. Bol'shoj objasnitel'nyj slovar'. Rostov-na Donu: Feniks, Moskva: Citadel'-trejd.

#### **Archive materials**

*Kartoteka i arhiv Arhangel'skogo oblastnogo slovarja*, hranjashhajasja v kabinetu dialektologii Moskovskogo gosudarstvennogo universiteta im. M. V. Lomonosova.

# CHILDHOOD AND THE NON-HUMAN IN MODERN SCOTTISH NOVELS

**JIHAN ZAKARRIYA**

Jihan Zakarriya, Dr., lecturer  
Department of the English Language and Literature  
Beni-Suef University, Egypt  
e-mail: [jihan\\_zakarriya@hotmail.com](mailto:jihan_zakarriya@hotmail.com)

Dr. Jihan Zakarriya is a lecturer at Beni-Suef University and an assistant professor at Dhofar University. She completed PhD in English literature at Cardiff University (2015) and a Fulbright fellowship at the University of Michigan (2016–2017). Dr. Zakarriya's research interests include postcolonial studies, comparative literature, ecocriticism, and gender studies.

## ABSTRACT

This paper provides a postcolonial-ecocritical reading of Scottish novelists Neil Gunn's "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" (1944) and Sue Sexton's "Mavis's Shoes" (2011). It specifically focuses on the representation of the concepts of childhood, identity and space in the two novels as symbolized in the experiences of nine-year-old Art in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and nine-year-old Lenny in "Mavis's Shoes". The paper argues that since "Mavis's Shoes" and "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" represent the psycho-cultural, environmental and social effects of the Clydebank Blitz and Nazi violence against Scotland during the Second World War, they not only question Scotland's position as a distressed nation recovering war traumas and mobilizing a palpable resistance against obvious forms of colonial violence, but also explore the complicated, hierarchical relationship between human beings and authorities on the one side and between human beings and nature on the other. This paper examines Gunn's and Sexton's representations of the Nazi violence and atrocities experienced by Scottish characters in the selected novels. It argues that the two novels memorize the victims and their personal sufferings as a shared memory resistant to erasure and offer a public reading of Scottish national experience and of changes under Nazi attacks. It argues further that although the two novels deal with the Nazi violence differently as Sexton's narration of Nazi attacks on Clydebank Blitz resonates with contemporary participation of Scottish troops in wars on Iraq and Afghanistan while Gunn uses myth to reflect on Scottish cultural identity under intense forms of imperialist competition between the UK and Germany, the two novelists articulate a particular awareness of the everlasting, devastating effects of western imperialism on the environment and human relations in modern Scotland.

**Keywords:** postcolonial ecocriticism, Scottish novel, environment, non-human, childhood, identity, space

## INTRODUCTION: NAZI VIOLENCE, SCOTTISH IDENTITY AND POSTCOLONIAL- ECOCRITICAL CONCERNS

In “Culture and Imperialism”, Edward Said reflects on identity formation in modern societies from a postcolonial-ecocritical perspective. Said argues persuasively that “none of us is completely free from the struggle over geography. That struggle is complex and interesting because it is not only about soldiers and cannons, but also about ideas, about forms, about images and imaginings” (Said 1993, 5–6). For Said, imperialism develops from being an act of direct violent territorial invasion of a foreign land into globalized, systematized processes of securitized spaces, political hierarchy and patriarchal control over people, resources and environments that affect western and eastern contexts, though at varying degrees. Although modern societies and histories are multicultural, interdependent and intertwined, Said explains, they could not escape imperialist heritage of essentialist identity oppositions of the self and the other, the male and the female, the poor and the rich, culture and nature, the rural and the urban, and the civilized and the primitive. In this way, for individuals, groups and nations to realize (nationalist) recovery and overcome these essentialist oppositions, Said continues, the human relationship to the more than-human world, to their places and to their past must be reached for, reimagined and reconceived devoid of established preconceptions, affiliations or filiations (Said 1993, 78).

In “Postcolonial Ecologies: Literatures of the Environment”, Elizabeth DeLoughrey and George B. Handley support Said that imperialism is “not a history relegated to the periphery of Europe and the United States, but rather a process that also occurred within and that radically changed the metropolitan center” (DeLoughrey and Handley 2011, 10). DeLoughrey and Handley define postcolonial ecocriticism as “a complex epistemology that recuperates the alterity of both history and nature, without reducing either to the other” (DeLoughrey and Handley 2011, 4). Like Said, DeLoughrey and Handley frame postcolonial studies ecologically, positioning it as a universal process of recovery, rethinking, and historical evaluation of the relationships between human beings and their environments on the one side and between human beings and structures of authority on the other. They emphasize that “deterritorialized forces of present-day globalization that deny local land sovereignty worldwide,

and validate aspects of pollution, desertification, deforestation, climate change, militarized fights over resources, and other forms of global environmental degradation” are forcefully related to and informed by “traditional ideologies of imperialism” (DeLoughrey and Handley 2011, 6). They all are different forms of “colonial encounters” (DeLoughrey and Handley 2011, 6). In this sense, within postcolonial ecocriticism, DeLoughrey and Handley persist, a renewed sense and understanding of place is necessary since “the landscape (and seascape) area participant in the imperialist historical process rather than a bystander to human experience” (DeLoughrey and Handley 2011, 6).

Taking a cue from Said’s, DeLoughrey’s and Handley’s argument that space, place and human-environmental relationships within western and eastern contexts are corrupted by imperialist ideas, this paper argues that Neil Gunn’s “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and Sue Sexton’s “Mavis’s Shoes” employ Nazi violence against Scottish cities and peoples in order to rethink Scotland’s inferiorized cultural-political positions within the British empire. It aims at achieving two goals. First, this paper examines Scottish settings and peoples in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and “Mavis’s Shoes” within postcolonial lenses. It argues that although the conflict between the UK and Germany within WW2 can be seen as the clash of two Empires, and so Nazi Germany was not attacking Scotland as a specific region/nation but as a part of their rival empire, the UK, this conflict perfectly exposes the inherent western racial, class, gender and environmental discriminations and injustices Scottish people experience on the interpersonal, cultural, environmental and socio-political levels. For example, Scottish metropolitan landscape and people in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and “Mavis’s Shoes” are victims to and resist the Nazi violence. They undergo an intense, continuous state of geographical, physical and psychological violence and aggression that cause instability, fear and resistance. While in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep”, Young Art and Old Hector escape “brutalities in this land of our own in the times of the evictions” and “concentration camp” (Gunn 1944, 4), Lenny, her sister Mavis, her mother and the whole Clydebank community in “Mavis’s Shoes” experience “the bombers shouting down at us and tearing everything to pieces, even the trees and the hills” (Sexton 2011, 25). Scottish characters in the two novels go through collective processes of internal and external displacement, war crimes and systematic violations of child and human rights that are pertinent to colonial violence (Said 1990, 72). Moreover, Leo Taylor underscores two factors that endorse Scotland’s colonized position during the

war; the first is that German bombers and airships that raid Scotland and other parts of Britain become “terrible new strategic weapon shocked people because it implied that innocent civilians were to be considered legitimate targets in any future war. Nobody would be safe” (Taylor 2010, 1). Taylor indicates that the estimated figures of casualties in Scotland caused by German bombing between 1939 and 1945 are 2,298 people killed, 2,167 seriously injured and 3,558 slightly injured (Taylor 2010, 4). The second factor, according to Taylor, is that “uniquely in the history of war, the strategy was a deliberately class-based one”:

“In every city that was attacked, it was the working-class people who always suffered most, because almost without exception they were crammed into row after row of poor-quality housing where one hit could kill hundreds. [...] An undamaged factory full of lathes is useless if the skilled lathe operators have all been killed, wounded or rendered homeless and distressed.” (Taylor 2010, 4)

Attacks on the Scottish city of Clydebank in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and “Mavis’s Shoes” are motivated by “Clydebank’s production of ships and munitions for the allies” and its economic importance as a centre of “factories, coal mines, engineering works and shipyards” (Hughes 2001, 25). Peggy in “Mavis’s Shoes” is a factory worker who, like thousands of workers, is left disabled and dismembered by the attacks. The classed bodies of Scottish workers, considered inherently dangerous, are othered and made vulnerable. Scottish characters’ distressful experiences of displacement and insecurity in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and “Mavis’s Shoes”, then, Bill Ashcroft asserts, resonates with “the special post-colonial crisis of identity [that is] the concern with the development or recovery of an effective identifying relationship between self and place” (Ashcroft 2002, 8). For Ashcroft, political and cultural analysis of identity and place in Scotland “has found a new dimension in post-colonial theory” (Ashcroft 2002, 201). In “The Green Isle of the Great Deep”, Art and old Hector, feeling depressed and estranged by the war, escape their highland village while Lenny and Peggy in “Mavis’s Shoes” live in distraught and uncertainty after their displacement. In both novels, white Scottish characters are forced to rethink their attachments to their land and identity.

Nonetheless, the identity crisis of Art and old Hector in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and Lenny and Peggy in “Mavis’s Shoes” is further deepened by unjust internal socio-political structures within the British empire. Here, Scotland’s postcolonial associations as colonized by Britain, though are controversial, are growingly validated through a series of serious and sustained studies. For example, in

Scottish Literature and Postcolonial Literature, Michael Gardiner argues that Scotland's "nationless state was seen to be shared with postcolonial critique" and that the context of political devolution in the UK can be seen as a "postcolonial process" exerting sustained pressure on "a heritage-based historical-constitutional unity that absorbed the British empire, in a double movement" (Gardiner 2011, 3). Gardiner traces how Scottish literature shows a persistent concern with "the representations of Scottish national identity that Scotland has been given, divided, and rendered incohesive as a result of English colonisation" (Gardiner 2011, 16). Seen within a postcolonial perspective, Scottish characters in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes" are resisting a colonial heritage of systematic cultural and physical violence. Graeme Macdonald, Paul Riggs and Silke Stroh argue for the validity of an ongoing process of postcolonial resistance in Scotland. Macdonald states that "political devolution may eventually lead to independence for the devolved nations and the dissolution of the UK structure – political, monarchic, military, fiscal and economic – is a point often and forcefully made in Scottish postcolonial criticism" (Macdonald 2011, 6). Riggs supports Macdonald that political devolution is a "nationalistic resistance to assimilation, preserving the autonomy of Scotland within the British state" and as "an assessment of inequitable material conditions in Scottish society" (Riggs 2005, 10).

For Riggs and Macdonald, the history of Scottish people shows that Scottish people experience and resist obvious forms of discriminations and hierarchy within the UK that negatively affect ethnic relationships and cultural identity in the country. Stroh supports Riggs and Macdonald that extending the field of Postcolonial Studies beyond Europe's former overseas colonies, to also include margins, minorities and emerging nations within (white) Europe, Europe itself has developed "invaluable tools for studying thematic patterns pertaining to the relation between culture, subalternity, power and national or ethnic identity" which all are urgent issues in modern Scotland (Stroh 2011, 22). Macdonald, Riggs and Stroh indicate that modern and contemporary Scottish writers tackle issues with evident similarities with postcolonial ones such as hegemonic relations between "centre" and "periphery", cultural representation and colonially produced concentration of power and wealth in the hands of specific elite classes.

Seen within this context, the second aim of this paper is to examine childhood in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes" as attempts of Scottish resistance against external and internal processes of colonial injustices and violence through what Said,

DeLoughrey and Handley describe above as reimagining and rebuilding connections with Scottish past, landscape and cultural identity. In this sense, although "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes" were written at very different historical, cultural, and political contexts since the first was written during the Scottish literary renaissance that celebrates Scottish cultural nationalism and identity while the second was written in post-devolutionary Scotland that commands Scotland's internal political sovereignty, this paper maintains that the two novels place Scotland within the postcolonial-ecocritical concerns with identity formations as the product of the interconnections between local environmental, cultural and socio-political beliefs and ethics on the one side and the attitudes towards different cultures, environments and peoples on the other.

In the dominantly white, civilized Scottish communities in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes", people, nature and places are still categorized, classified and discriminated against according to their production mode and cultural/racial backgrounds. For instance, in *Green Isle*, the Questioner and his administration distinguish between "their higher culture" that produces "the individual capitalist, the pattern of the corporate state. The evolution of a corporate mind" (Gunn 1944, 209) and "primitive pattern of culture [such as] the peasant type. They are conservative in their habits as animals are. Fear is a more potent force in their lives than any other. Use fear. Defeat their violence with a greater violence" (Gunn 1944, 47). Since Art lives in wilderness and disobeys the rules of *Green Isle*, he is immediately stereotyped as "primitive" and inferior and hence deserves punishment. Regardless of his young age, Art is exposed to psychological and physical pressure and terrorization. Art is not only threatened by police that "Mary was taken away and would never come back, unless Art came with me" (Gunn 1944, 119), but also is chased and hunted as a symbol of "a lower, animal culture" (Gunn 1944, 119). He is forced to hide in the woods, and is deprived of basic needs of food, care and security. This politicized process of animalizing and inferiorizing certain (Scottish) classes, like peasants shows space as calculable tool of political subjugation, exclusion and inclusion that determine who enjoy the entitlement to security and acceptance within the higher culture and who does not. Othering and the inferiorization of difference run on the gender level as well. Since Mary and other women in *Green Isle* sympathize with Art and defend him against authorities, women are accused of "getting fancies. The boy left a strong impression on them" (Gunn 1944, 59). Mary faces mental torture at the hands of "bullies or psychologists at the atomic psychology room" (Gunn 1944, 259).

In "Postcolonial Ecocriticism: Literature, Animals, Environment", Graham Huggan and Helen Tiffin argue that assuming "a natural prioritisation of humans and human interests over those of other species on earth means generating and repeating the racist ideologies of imperialism on a planetary scale: [...] people [who are] often regarded as part of nature are treated instrumentally as animals" (Huggan and Tiffin 2015, 6). In *Green Isle*, civilization and high culture is related to industrial urbanization and privatization of lands and resources. Consequently, the Questioner's plan to detach inhabitants of *Green Isle* from their natural environment by forbidding the fruit and designating certain products as exclusive and nature and wilderness as dangerous and primitive not only deprives humans from enjoying and connecting spiritually and physically with the diversity of natural products and elements, but also underestimate the non-human world as inferior. Moreover, the superior administration in *Green Isle* inevitably denotes, like in imperialist projects, "a superior Western knowledge and a Western representation of events and processes" (Thomas 2001, 168). The Questioner's "flawless style of reasoning is a universal reason" (Gunn 1944, 208) and hence he thinks "that in another millennium it mightn't be convenient to extend the green isle any farther. The idea of a lack of living room in a thousand years haunted us more than if the lack was to be next week. It caused a tremendous amount of talk" (Gunn 1944, 94). The Questioner's spatially expandable, globalized, westernized (neo-imperialist) plans to extend his order and authority to other spaces and peoples unavoidably entail not only transmitting the inequitable distribution of resources to the potential new spaces, but also exemplify the deterritorialized forces of modernism and globalization. Imperialist Militarism is replaced with globalized forms of broad political-economic alliances and interests.

In a similar way, Sexton's "Mavis's Shoes", published in 2011, retells the shocking Nazi cruelties and bloody atrocities against the inhabitants of the Scottish city of Clydebank at the backdrop of the contemporary Anglo-American war in Iraq and Afghanistan. The huge human and environmental loss in both wars not only problematizes Scotland's double position as a colonializing nation as well as subordinate to British central authority and Nazi violence, but also exposes how in the contemporary globalized world, economic interests, decision making processes and the distribution of wealth and recourses, such as Iraqi oil, are still governed by Eurocentric and imperialist ideas and interests. Sexton exposes Scottish ambivalence and double standards. Scotland participates in contemporary colonizing, democratizing missions in Iraq, while Scottish people

resist the assimilation and the subordinate position of Scotland within the British state that lead to two devolution referenda in 1979 and 1997 (Leith and Soule 2011). Moreover, Scotland still suffers dominant forms of political patriarchy, the unequal distribution of resources and the concentration of power and wealth in the hands of elites.

Witnessing and surviving the horrific destruction of her hometown of Clydebank at the hands of the Nazis, working-class nine-year-old Lenny in "Mavis' Shoes" is in a continual state of fear, doubt and instability. Like other children in the novel, Lenny is first shocked with the level of physical destruction caused by the war. She hears the "shouts and people sleeping in death, separated from their feet or their hands, no longer whole, unable to complete themselves" (Sexton 2011, 11). Lenny's mother, Peggy, is in hospital since her legs are crushed and Rosie, a four-year old girl, loses all her family members. Children feel cold, afraid and "could hear the inside of their stomach" (Pancake 2011, 13). Gradually, Lenny realizes that destruction is all-inclusive: "grown-ups are crying. Most of us filthy and grey. A lady fell over suddenly and an old man too" (Pancake 2011, 11). Human violence reaches out to the natural world as "the sky was filled with still more drops of fire, little drops flying all around, and all the laws of nature and gravity that I had learnt at school had all been lies and were of no use now" (Pancake 2011, 5). Within this cruel war, childhood is violated on all levels. So, Lenny and thousands of children are orphaned, terrorized and starved. As their secure worlds fall down, children ask: "why do grown-ups do that?" (Pancake 2011, 28). Since children never get a satisfactory answer to their question, Lenny has to find the answer herself.

Like in all (post) colonial societies, Scottish characters in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes" need, then, to re-establish their demolished worlds. However, Edward Said argues that "a changed ecology also introduced a changed political system that seemed retrospectively to have alienated the people from their authentic traditions" (Said 1993, 77). Nature's alterity and processes of regeneration bury or remove the detrimental practices and damaging effects of the postcolonial or violent histories introduce new or alternative milieus. Scottish nature, like Scottish people in the two novels, plays a complex, dual role during and after the geographical violence. Landscape is an active participant in shaping, sharing and witnessing the violent historical experiences of its populations. Scottish landscape in the two novels helps its traumatic inhabitants to recover the effects of aggression, violence and disturbance and to question their identity patterns and historical situations. Yet, nature and non-human species are also victims of the violence. Scottish villages,

cities and hills in the two novels are attacked by Nazi bombs, but they become the safe resort for Clydebank people to rebuild their demolished community and to heal their psychological and physical injuries as in Carbeth. Nonetheless, Carbeth is rural and primitive and its new urban inhabitants or refugees from Clydebank struggle to urbanize the place according to their capitalist vision. Likewise, Art and Old Hector in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" need to give up their rural culture and conform to oppressive, globalized forms of capitalism and neo-imperialism in Green Isle. They need to compromise between their difficult realities and the rules of the newly established orders that reintroduce discriminatory binaries. Lenny and Art feel out of place in Clydebank and Green Isle because of their difference and spatial-cultural backgrounds.

This paper is divided into two parts. The first examines the concepts of childhood, space and action in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes" within postcolonial-ecocritical concerns. It argues that Green Isle in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and Clydebank in "Mavis's Shoes" are examples of globalized, modern, and civilized cities with order and high cultures, but their landscape and human relations are still formulated by a long and complex history of European imperialism that render urbanization, technology, and natural and spatial control as basic determinants of modern life. Yet, young Art in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and Lenny in "Mavis's Shoes" offer alternative stances and solutions to the deterministically rules of the orders they inhabit. The second part discusses the concepts of the non-human and God in the two novels.

## CHILDHOOD, SPACE AND ACTION IN "THE GREEN ISLE OF THE GREAT DEEP" AND "MAVIS' SHOES"

Childhood has been established as one of the major themes in the modern and contemporary Scottish novel. It usually symbolizes "innocence, morality and authentic, pure Scottish identity" (Riach 2005, 93) and "the power to connect one generation to the next" (Bennett 2013, 7). However, in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis's Shoes", childhood is used to achieve two ecocritical aims. Firstly, childhood offers an ecologically-oriented form of resistance against different forms of repression and oppression. The war experiences of Art in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and Lenny

in “Mavis’s Shoes” provide a spatial lens that recognises what Abigail Hackett and Lisa Procter call “the non-linearity of children’s lives, by bringing to the fore the complex ways that children’s meaning-making unfolds in dynamic exchange with the spaces and places they inhabit” (Hackett and Procter 2015, 1). For Hackett and Procter, examining the entanglements between children and the worlds in which they are situated offers new perspectives on how “knowledges come from the betweenness of spatial experience, where children bring knowledges generated through their familiarity with one setting into those which are unfamiliar” (Hackett and Procter 2015, 5). Children’s ways of knowing, then, “go beyond spoken or written knowledge, to include what is remembered or imagined by the body as well as the mind, and to a certain extent, is therefore unshareable and unknowable” (Hackett and Procter 2015, 5). In this sense, Art, who is described by Old Hector and people in Green Isle as “strange and wild and fearless, extraordinary, something fabulous” (Gunn 1944, 202) and as attaining “the immortal three – knowledge, wisdom, and magic” (Gunn 1944, 241) uses nature as a force to form his own knowledge and interpretations of his worlds. In Green Isle, Art holds the position of a refugee and an outsider. He is sometimes a helpless and miserable-looking refugee and sometime is a menacing figure or outsider that disturbs established orders and rules. Art, like thousands of exiles, émigrés, refugees worldwide, feels insecure and estranged. Yet, he adopts a highly politicized, skeptical and self-conscious attitude, seeking answers to theoretical questions such as problems of identity, authority and individual agency. Here, environment and open spaces, despite maintaining indissoluble links with time, are empty of any reductions, restrictions, and manipulations that are destined to capture Art in a specific nation or group.

In this way, for Art to eat the “forbidden fruit, nuts of knowledge and salmon of wisdom” (Gunn 1944, 15) and to sleep in open spaces not at the Inn are not only an obvious expression of distrust of the authorities in Green Isle but also deconstruct their rhetorical strategy that establishes nature and natural products as privatized, exclusive, and inferior entities. The importance of the union with nature or reclaiming the natural-human connections through sympathetic analogy and spiritual empowerment gives Art a new sense of identity and productive power. It is not merely linguistic or diasporic or nostalgic. Rather, nationalism is action against repression. The difference between the new generations of Scottish people and the old one is striking. While Old Hector and inhabitants of Green Isle bear on their faces the marks of uncomprehended subjugation, helplessness and guilt that render nationalism as “the dead-end of political

life, demanding endless sacrifices and the abrogation of democracy for the sake of national security" (Said 1999, 36), Art sees the world as expendable, impermanent, and unstable.

Art's view of space that is indefinably open, Bertrand Westphal argues, "deploys itself beyond immediate perception. Covered with a veil of intelligibility, it escapes first from human understanding. A desire that engenders excitement and chills is superimposed onto space, and the excitation is itself an incitement to mobility" (Westphal 2013, 4–5). Thus, Art's explorations of open spaces intimidate authorities as different, unexpected and unrefined. As Art inscribes and is inscribed by the wild, free nature in a mobile perspective, he stands for wisdom not as accumulation of experiences, but rather as his ability to use his personal awareness and intuition to transform his historical vulnerability, fear and subjugation into acts of magic which are resistance and being different. Moreover, Art's courage exposes the drawbacks of early twentieth century Scottish nationalism. In the imagined world of post-war Green Isle in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep", then, like in imperialist orders, power and knowledge inform culture. People in Green Isle believe that "man's curse has been the curse of disobedience" (Gunn 1944, 94). Consequently, they follow strict and sometimes unreasonable rules of their system, for example, a rule that prevents them from eating fruits "so that man would be restored to his original innocence" (Gunn 1944, 93). People in Green Isle follow these rules "not of fear but a profound belief in the efficiency and power of the Administration" (Gunn 1944, 179). They come to believe that security requires obedience and subjugation to authority. Consequently, inhabitants of Green Isle impliedly consent over a security state that controls and securitizes public spaces. So, visitors of the city are watched, need to register their names and personal details once they enter Green Isle, need to sleep in the Inn and all people in Green Isle conform to rules with "automatic obedience" (Gunn 1944, 201). Under the pretext of protecting the national identity, many modern postcolonial and Western political systems operate security policies and measures that prioritize not only the national interests over individual rights but also ignore the demands for individual freedom. This increased perception of security justifies state domination over public places while free mobility inevitability designates heightened levels of danger and fear.

In a similar way, Lenny in "Mavis' Shoes" neither fully conforms to the established laws and rules of the different communities she inhabits, nor feels threatened by wild spaces or the new environments she explores. Rather, Lenny, like Art in "The Green Isle of the Great

Deep", holds an evasive place where idealistic notions of childhood, obedience, innocence and protection are consistently challenged. The fundamental challenge for Lenny is therefore that the chaotic and violent Nazi attacks in "Mavis' Shoes" shake her established knowledge and destroy her traditional perceptions of the concepts of security and belonging attached to a home, a group and a nation. As Lenny's defined territories and home collapse, the boundaries between the cultural and the natural spaces, between the individual and the state and between the self and the other collapse as well. Being deliberately deprived of the natural, peaceful maturity from childhood to adulthood out of war and violence, then, Lenny symbolizes peculiarity. To reconstruct her worlds and knowledge in the post-attack time, Lenny, unlike her community that is still loyal to the laws and rules of the demolished order, is suspicious of established knowledge. She is partially inside and partially outside the newly established order in Carbeth. As Scottish people resort to the hills and the countryside to escape the Nazi violence, and re-establish their community in Carbeth, they, unlike Art's Green Isle, descended from an urban, higher culture to a primitive, rural one. They live in huts and tents like refugees; there is no sanitation or water, they do not have enough food and shelters and so the Salvation Army interferes and gives people blankets and food. However, being equal in their grief and suffering, Scottish people in Carbeth foster their feelings of solidarity, mutual care, understanding and human sympathy missed in Clydebank. For instance, in Carbeth, Lenny sees that native farmers are sometimes upset with the lack of supplies, but they are kind. Clydebank people accept each other's differences and deal intuitively and humanly. Maimed and disabled war victims like Penny are offered help and care.

In *The Plausible World*, Bertrand Westphal argues that "nationalism and ethnotyping often go together because the nationalist desire, manifest or not, sustains selected ethnotypes. The ethnotype reinforces a desirable self-identity in opposition to neighbouring entities, regarded as irrevocably other (a pejorative ethnotype)" (Westphal 2013, 144). As Clydebank inhabitants settle in Carbeth, they, like Old Hector and inhabitants of Green Isle, attempt to nationalize and modernize the place. Mrs. Mags tells Lenny that she needs to go to village school "because the law says she has to go to school" while Mr. Tait says that "we have to work and study too, to keep this country on its feet" (Westphal 2011, 42). They politicize Carbeth as an alternative political-institutional ensemble of Clydebank that is inevitably governed by processes of identity stereotyping and forced integration. Consequently, Penny plans to resume her

old plans of immigrating to America: "I still have all the papers, the birth certificates and the photo of your dad and me on our wedding day, and the America money! What a relief! Thank goodness I did what the government said and kept it" (Pancake 2011, 56). Conversely, Lenny regards her community and her mother as trying to project order and fake normality and security at the time when no place is secured. Lenny, similar to Art, learns to critically rethink all her beliefs and relationships. Through the war and its traumatic effects, Lenny learns to overcome her fears, to deal with realities and to integrate with nature through trial and error rather than any preconceived ideas or stereotypes. She resists fear and oppression through action: "I couldn't go to school and see all those kids I didn't know and a new teacher who might not be nice, and no-one would even have heard of Mavis or my mum" (Pancake 2011, 34). She keeps looking for her mother and her sister till she finds them.

In "Mavis's Shoes", like in "The Green Isle of the Great Deep", national identity becomes a problematic ideological, as well as socio-political, enterprise that renders subjugation and reintroduce essentialist notions and binary oppositions of the self and the other, the male and the female and the privileged and the subordinate. In modern, civilized Clydebank, like in Green Isle, Scottish people are hard-working but are dehumanized, repressed and categorized. For example, Mrs. Mag believes that "strictness is a good thing. Everybody knows where they are with strictness" (Sexton 2011, 67) and Miss Weatherbeaten is a "serious and grim teacher" (Pancake 2011, 32). Mr. Tait is seen as a "gaffer" (Pancake 2011, 23). Lenny feels inferior because of her accent while her mother plans to immigrate to America to escape jealous sniping and sexual accusations: "the rumours began because the shift organizer likes her and gave her extra shifts to help her make more money. Someone was not happy about this – first they invented nasty stories about her and then they made an official complaint" (Pancake 2011, 99). Peggy's husband goes to the war and as a working, single mother, Peggy challenges what Lucelrigaray calls "the desubjectivized social role of the mother, which is dictated by an order subject to the division of labour – he produced, she reproduces – that walls us up in the ghetto of a single function" (Irigaray 1987, 18). Peggy's economic independence and her ability to support herself and her daughters alone endorse the image of new women who successfully fulfil many functions and rights that have been forbidden to them for centuries. Thus, she is punished through sexual stereotyping. Nevertheless, Peggy's independence brings stress. Lenny tells how her mother changes after being a single mother: "she was patient when I lost things and told

us stories about 'home', her home which wasn't Clydebank" (Sexton 2011, 71). Controlling the productive and mental forces of women and men in Clydebank through law and order is an essential element in creating the collective subjects in Scotland. In Green Isle and Clydebank, like in many postcolonial societies, nationalist interests and security are a means of silencing difference and dissent. Inhabitants of Green Isle are silenced, deprived and repressed but justify their subjugation that "we suffer here but we do not die" (Gunn 1944, 64).

Furthermore, Lenny, like Art, empowers her resistance through uniting with open spaces and wilderness. For them, nature is not scary, but is regenerative and resistant. Lenny notices how the "hills rose up, solid, silent and surely indestructible, and trees shifted by the path – pictures of a quiet country life of hard work and peace, a life my dad always wanted but couldn't persuade my mother" (Pancake 2011, 22). Lenny, like thousands of Clydebank children and adults, feeds on fruits and vegetables in Carbeth and enjoys daffodils and green spaces that help them ease their tragedies. The natural environment in Carbeth becomes a balm to their troubled hearts, minds and bodies. The trees, the hills and the river all give adults and children a sense of security, shelter and unconditional substance. Unlike her mother, who wants to escape to America, Lenny has a different plan:

"Mavis and I would catch fish in the river and play with the other kids, and we'd find ourselves a proper house and stay forever, and my dad would come home and bring lots of medals and presents for us all. [...] No-one would ever mention the Germans because we'd have forgotten all about them. We'd all be far too busy being happy." (Pancake 2011, 70)

Lenny neither asks about the causes of the Nazi war nor enemies them as permanent others. To the contrary, Lenny, similar to Art, develops realistic, sensitive ecological-human balances for her future survival and new identity. In "Wild Democracy: Ecofeminism, Politics, and the Desire Beyond", Catriona Sandilands argues that nature's moments of wildness and humanity's need for humility within them "suggests a politics oriented to the preservation of the possibility of relations to the Real against the trend toward ideological totality" (Sandilands 1997, 149–150). Art's and Lenny's humble, intuitive connection with nature can be seen as a resistance against totalitarian productive ideologies of capitalism, and imperialism.

Secondly, Art's and Lenny's spatial, ecologically-oriented processes of regeneration, recovery and action against repression render the issues of identity and power that are intertwined with the per-

formance of gender and nature in the two novels as illogical and unthinkable. An essential part of Art's and Lenny's peculiarity is their performative silence. Their behaviours elude interpretation and hence resist domination. In "The Green Isle of the Great Deep", Art's boyhood arouses controversy. For example, Christopher Whyte argues that Gunn propounds a "myth of masculinity" (Whyte 1995, 68) that assigns men and women traditional socio-cultural roles, with the male Art as the leader of freedom. However, this paper argues that Gunn represents a progressive ecological-gendered perspective on the productive force of men and women in modern Scotland as a means of promoting the possibility of gender justice by incorporating feminist reflections, analyses and activities within the broader framework of Art's resistance discourse. Art is not the typical city adventure boy who civilizes and urbanizes spaces and places he encounters. Rather, Art is a rural, simple boy who intrudes and disturbs the urban order that alienates and inferiorizes him. Art is silent but his body and actions assault and threaten the hierarchical political sight in Green Isle. In addition to this, in Green Isle, women are able to read Art's silence and to affect his resistance plan. Mary finds the herbs and makes the herb jelly that neutralized the effect from eating the processed fruit. She helps Art to hide: "the fruit has brought back life into her again, just as the boy Art brought back the memory of her son – who was destroyed on earth" (Gunn 1944, 92). In this sense, Mary's love of Art is unusual. She is not the traditional protective mother or woman. Rather, she is a rebellious mother. Her motherhood feelings do not deny her individuality and agency. Moreover, women in Green Isle defend Art against the police: "the interference of some women who blocked the men's way. The women objected. There was a small riot" (Gunn 1944, 182). Their bodies become a practice of their repressed subjectivity.

Unlike Art, however, Lenny in "Mavis' Shoes" challenges obvious forms of gender duality inherent within her society and worldwide. In an interview with Jim Murdoch, Sue Sexton reveals that "Lenny tried very hard to be a boy, which is probably why she has a boyish name. But I had to insist! There are lots of boys' adventure stories, less for girls" (Murdoch 2011, 1). Throughout "Mavis' Shoes", Lenny is missed for being a boy because of her free performance and courageous, physical adventures that are usually restricted to boys. Mrs. Mag says, "Lenny is the bravest little girl I've ever come across, to tell the truth" (Sexton, 2011, 22). Thus, Sexton's Lenny not only challenges the purposeful literary silencing and marginalization of the female adventurer, but also deconstructs "the so-called domestic sphere of women's work and activities across many

times and cultures, includes caring for children, the elderly, and the sick and working close to the land. This has traditionally been regarded as less 'civilized' and therefore lesser in value, than the public sphere of men's work and activities" (Lahar 1991, 32). Lenny, like her mother, is not confined by these biologically determined gender roles. While her mother works and supports her family, Lenny is not afraid to explore public and war spaces. They are strong women, but they are humans too, and so they cry, feel upset or need comfort. In Carbeth, Lenny gets rid of stereotypes between women and primitive nature on the one side and men and the civilized society on the other. She offers a possibility of staying in Carbeth and building her own Scottish identity devoid of stereotypes. Moreover, Lenny, unlike Art, is exceptionally talkative. Her language gives substance to her dreams and defines the inner ways which lead to the cultural identity she seeks for herself and her family. Lenny refuses to be silenced or controlled by the war or stereotypes. Art and Lenny, then, expand the spaces of political action in the form of plural perspectives on the issues of gender roles and individual agency in their societies. Yet, only when Art and Lenny develop an ecological understanding of their lives, do they refuse the linguistic and/or cultural archetypes of their home cultures and are able to think and act differently. They are not isolated or alienated. Rather, Art and Lenny, coming from rural backgrounds, succeed in defending their rights of equal treatment and equal share within their civilized, urbanized political structures.

## GOD AND THE NON-HUMAN IN "THE GREEN ISLE OF THE GREAT DEEP" AND "MAVIS' SHOES"

In "Nature's Economy", Donald Worster argues that "Christian imperialism stripped from nature all spiritual qualities and rigidly distanced it from human feelings – promoting a view of creation as a mechanical contrivance" (Worster 1994, 29). Inhabitants of Green Isle are forced into a new ontological relation in which "Green Isle and the administrators who have to rule. The scientists at the seat were, absolutely or mathematically, given. The rationalist philosophers at the seat accepted them as given for all time everywhere. That being so, they were given also for God" (Gunn 1944, 96). Within the secular order in Green Isle, then, politicians render God and his sacred spaces and creations like nature, plants, animals and open spaces as privatized entities that favour and are informed by

their authority and ideologies. Thus, authority is established as absolute and rigid, while nature and the non-human are stabilized as aliens, peripheries, and others standing outside the human discourse. They are to be controlled and modernized as a means of serving God. Consequently, Art's integration with the natural order and animals as "they make friends and Art could have no better guard in the world than the dogs" (Gunn 1944, 90) signifies a redefinition of authority and a challenge to its established socio-cultural and linguistic ideologies. Art's encounter with nature and the dogs, for example, transgresses the human/non-human or animal boundary but could not bring either to fit in Green Isle. The fruit, nature and animals have active and influential presence in Art's resistance plan, but this presence is not translatable into human speech since it is based on innate spiritual and emotional bonds not mechanical or scientific calculations. Thus, Art and the natural/non-human worlds in Green Isle become threatening others; they are uncontrolled, spontaneous, and hence their free presence and agency have to be limited by the administrators in Green Isle. Art's otherness in Green Isle denotes the contrast between a limited anthropocentric sphere of language and culture and an expanded ecological sphere that acknowledges the earth as homes to human beings. It also helps inhabitants of Green Isle to realize their inferior positions. Humans share same experiences and problems with nature and other non-human beings. The marginalized voices belong to both the human and the non-human spheres, and both define each other.

In a similar way, Lenny's traumatic encounters with humans, nature and the non-human mark new perceptions of her identity and her relationships with god and authority. God occupies a central position in Lenny's distressing war experience. At first, Lenny is confused with the massive destruction of the human, the non-human and the natural environments that she believes "God being angry, shouting down at us and tearing everything to pieces, even the trees and the hills [...] sheep hiding against walls and cows huddled against the farm buildings" (Sexton 2011, 27). For Lenny, all-inclusive incidents of death and damage with so many bodies and so many people losing limbs caused by the unexplainable war exceed human power. Gradually, however, Lenny realizes that "humans are playing war" (Gunn 1944, 51). For Lenny to strike a balance between human responsibility towards other beings, nature and creatures on the one side and her confused perception of God's absolute sovereignty on the other, she needs to understand the secular realities and unexplained facts she lives in. Then, she needs to know her needs. These two goals are realized through Lenny's integration with nature and

the non-human. In Carbeth, Lenny realizes that all laws and knowledge become uncertain and nobody claims to know the truth. All human beings are helpless, and nature is neither inferior to human beings nor a symbolic system through which God speaks to them. Rather, nature and the non-human creatures are important in their own terms, as having their own processes of regeneration and resistance and as saving and helping human beings with shelter and substance like bananas and peaches. Lenny's new perception of home in Carbeth is not limited by material possessions of a specific building or conforming to a group of people as in Clydebank. Lenny understands home as a multiplicity of options and alternatives traversed by different, strange and incomplete, yet equal natures, creatures, races, genders, and personal backgrounds.

In this way, Gunn and Sexton deconstruct the traditional view of the place of natural elements as resources, as passive, static recipients for a system of human use or abuse. In "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis' Shoes", marginalized and helpless humans like Art and Lenny restore their agency and spiritual power through nature. Non-human elements like animals, plants and landscapes are allowed the possibility of a self-sufficient ontology and regeneration, undetermined by any human interference. Put this way, Art's sensitive, humble encounter with the non-human and nature, then, as Catriona Sandilands writes, "this encounter with an ineffable nature signals an encounter with the Real as it appears within both human and nonhuman life. The Real is discursively impossible, always something other than the language that attempts to domesticate it" (Sandilands 1997, 138). Art's explorations of the non-human and the natural worlds indirectly expose the limitations of the imperialist binaries of the linguistic, socio-cultural, economic and political structures in Green Isle. They also show nature as a socio-cultural product of power and politics. Thus, human beings in Green Isle, like nature, are active participants in their own oppression or resistance. While nature resists oppression through its free, spontaneous, unconditioned, physical, enjoyable and rich alterity and productivity, Art resists through his dissidence and unpredictability. As a result, although Art's motives to live in wilderness and hid disobedience of patriarchal authorities remain enigmatic, he leaves noticeable marks on Green Isle people's life and thinking. He shows common human beings as able to survive freely on the margins of the capitalist economy. Here, Art represents secular politics as declaring "oneself for difference (as opposed to sameness or homogenization) without at the same time being for the rigidly enforced and policed separation of populations into different groups"

(Said 1985, 40). Art repudiates the search for a false, hierarchical purity or assimilation of thought, race or nation.

Lenny, like Art, achieves inner growth and spiritual connection with God that she understands that human beings are responsible for corrupting their own worlds. Human inward corruption like hatred, discrimination and greed experienced in Clydebank is reflected in the world's outward corruption like war, the destruction of the non-humans and the pollution of nature. This is the real fact why Lenny's spiritual renewal and wisdom need also environmental action to live in the countryside and to be happy and peaceful. To break away from the traumatic, corrupt past and present, Lenny realizes that violence is already present in her society not only with the Germans. In this sense, God and politics are two separate spheres. While politics is degraded and unethical, God's power is spiritual and physical. Lenny says: "Dear God, please make my mum better and find Mavis and take us all back home soon. [...] Please God, put love in that beaten heart" (Pancake 2011, 40). She asks for God's help but acts to change her realities. Additionally, Lenny realizes God's economic power as reflected in nature and its rich, diverse products and milieus. Lenny, then, disrupts the ideological limits of her urban society precisely in relation to non-human nature. An ecological understanding of her situation as a homeless refugee who lacks feelings of security, equality and family and who needs a sense of peace and gratification, Lenny reaches a form of political remembrance of her trauma that fosters the autonomous appearance of nature as acting against human violence.

## CONCLUSION

"The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis' Shoes" suggest a decade of political transformation in Scotland as a postcolonial nation in which politics, nature and human rights are inextricably entangled. They clearly adopt a shared progressive and supportive view of ecological-human justice in modern, post-colonial Scottish societies. Both Gunn and Sexton show an early belief in the rights of environment as a precondition to political and social change in Scotland. The two novels certainly relate literature and nature. They explore the ideology and the everlasting effects of neo-colonization, highlighting the specific characteristics of childhood. In "The Green Isle of the Great Deep" and "Mavis' Shoes", the contact between the Self and the Other is direct, confrontational and non-human. Despite the different perspectives espoused by Gunn and Sexton,

they present children that exist in a perpetual state of query and dissidence. Art in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and Lenny in “Mavis’ Shoes” aspire to understand their traumatic past and present and to understand the politics of their identity formation. They show patience, endurance, and above all persistence in resisting all forms of oppression and in seeking to change the customs that discriminate against them. Unlike the majority of adults in “The Green Isle of the Great Deep” and “Mavis’ Shoes” whose search for economic security and social stability meant that they are caught within the framework of autocratic politics, Art’s and Lenny’s main challenge is a purely ideological fight for recognition of their humanness. Their environmental awareness interweaves their personal interests and aims with the political conditions of their societies.

## REFERENCES

- Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G. and Tiffin, H. (1989). *The Empire Writes Back*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Routledge.
- Bennett, M. (2013). “The Roots of Living Tradition.” In: Dunningan S. & Gilbert S. (eds.) *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Traditional Literatures*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- DeLoughrey, E. and Handley, G. B. (2011). *Postcolonial Ecologies: Literatures of the Environment*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gunn, N. (2006). *The Green Isle of the Great Deep*. Edinburgh: Ploygon.
- Hackett, A., Procter, L. and Seymour, J. (2015). “Introduction: Spatial Perspectives and Childhood Studies.” In: Hackett A., Procter L., Seymour J. (eds.) *Children’s Spatialities: Studies in Childhood and Youth*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Huggan, G. and Tiffin, H. (2015). *Postcolonial Ecocriticism: Literature, Animals, Environment*. London: Routledge.
- Hughes, A. (2001). *Gender and Political Identities in Scotland, 1919–1939*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Irigaray, L. (1987). *Sexes and Genealogies*. Trans. G. C. Gill. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Lahar, S. (1991). “Ecofeminist Theory and Grassroots Politics.” *Hypatia* 6 (Spring), 28–45.
- Lehner, S. (2011). *Subaltern Ethics in Contemporary Scottish and Irish Literature*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Leith, M. and Soule, D. P. J. (2011). *Political Discourse and National Identity in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

- Macdonald, G. (2010). "Scottish Extractions: Race and Racism in Devolutionary Fiction." *Orbis Litterarum* 65 (Spring), 79–107.
- Murdoch, J. (2011). "Mavis's Shoes: An Interview with Sue Sexton." *The Truth about Lies* (6 March). Available at: <<http://jim-murdoch.blogspot.com/2011/03/maviss-shoe.html>> (accessed January 2019).
- Riach, A. (2005). *Representing Scotland in Literature, Popular Culture and Iconography: The Masks of the Modern Nation*. London and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Riggs, P. (2005). "How Scotland Became Postcolonial." *Journal of Commonwealth and Postcolonial Studies* 12 (Fall), 9–23.
- Said, E. W. (1993). *Culture and Imperialism*. London: Vintage Books.
- Said, E. W. (1985). "Race, Writing, and Difference." *Critical Inquiry* 12 (Autumn), 38–58.
- Said, E. W. (1999). "Unoccupied Territory: A New Opening for Palestinians and Israelis." *London Review of Books* 17 (January), 35–37.
- Said, E. W. (1990). "Yeats and Decolonization." In: Eagleton, T., Fredric, J. and Said, (eds.) *Nationalism, Colonialism, and Literature*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 69–95.
- Sandilands, C. (1997). "Wild Democracy: Ecofeminism, Politics, and the Desire Beyond." *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies* 18 (Spring), 135–156.
- Sassi, C. and van Heijnsbergen T. (2013). *Within and Without Empire*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Sexton, S. (2011). *Mavis's Shoes*. Glasgow: Waverley Books.
- Taylor, L. (2010). *Luftwaffe over Scotland: A History of German Air Attacks over Scotland, 1939–45*. London: Whittles Publishing.
- Thomas, C. (2001). "Global Governance, Development and Human Security: Exploring the Links." *Third World Quarterly* 22 (Spring), 159–175.
- Westphal, B. (2013). *The Plausible World*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Whyte, Ch. (1995). "Fishy Masculinities: Neil Gunn's the Silver Darlings." In: Ch. Whyte (ed.) *Gendering the Nation: Studies in Modern Scottish Literature*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 49–68.
- Worster, D. (1994). *Nature's Economy: The Roots of Ecology*. San Francisco: Sierra Club.

# HISTORY AND HISTORIAN: YESTERDAY AND TODAY

**SILVIO TAMASO D'ONOFRIO**

Silvio Tamaso D'Onofrio, Dr., independent researcher  
São Paulo, Brazil  
e-mail: opeltrezero@gmail.com

Silvio Tamaso D'Onofrio holds a Doctor of Science in Social History (2017) from the University of São Paulo, Brazil. Leader of the research group "REGIONEM – Regional Multidisciplinary Studies", he is also a member of the research group "Nucleus of Studies of Epistolography", of the Institute of Brazilian Studies, at the University of São Paulo. Born and raised in Brazil, the years of college have led Silvio D'Onofrio to Literary and Linguistic studies. In his graduate studies, he also approached other sciences, especially History and Archives – at this segment, his research helped in the constitution of a Public Archive in a State University. His Doctoral research contributed to the understanding of the spaces of action of young intellectuals in times of dictatorial political regime, through the analysis of a social collective based around the 1940s journalists and critics of the arts. Using state-of-the-art computerized resources, it attempted to investigate the extent to which cross-referencing a large amount of information can be indicative of social meanderings. Additionally, it analyses the symbol initiative of the group, a cultural weekly.

## ABSTRACT

The article investigates some notions of the origin of universal historiography and promotes a reflection on the concept of History in antiquity and today, especially in classrooms of juvenile education. For that, a basic, exploratory, subjective, and inductive bibliographical research was carried out within the scope of the written production of classical and contemporary authors, with a view to contributing to a critical re-reading of the historiographic bases, something that is necessary given a characteristic of the constant evolution of science, which demands more and more technicality and specialization – and this happens to the historical discipline too. The purpose of reflection is to foster a critical discussion that contributes to the teaching of History in the classroom, in the present day, since the world today seems less and less prone to the study of the humanities, for several reasons. The conclusion is that we cannot forget the past teachings, much less how humanity faced and overcome its problems and challenges, with confrontations and solutions that transformed the past into a present, and from here arises the mission of building the future, aware that we will not evolve if we are not very clear about the notion of the human condition at all times.

**Keywords:** history, pedagogy, classics, teaching, humanities, historiography

## INTRODUCTION

A frequent question among the educators of the area of History, which many ask themselves is: after all, what is it to teach History? This question, whose simplicity lies only in its appearance, can lead to other questions beneficial to the general understanding of the subject. Among them, the quest for prime issues, what was history to the earliest known thinkers? What are its characteristics and objectives? How should it be done? These are just a few questions that could be investigated in an attempt to improve the classroom teacher's performance. Once again, here too is the common sense of the study of history: who knows by studying and understanding the past, has answers to the questions of the present, and can thus better design future actions.

## US AND THEM

Teaching History in class or defending an academic thesis on History may lead to the traditional questioning about the definition of the concept of History, about what it is and how History is made, in addition to the important question regarding the writing of History.

The historian Paul Veyne (1982) has already observed that the capacity of the present man to know history is much greater than that of the men of the ancient civilizations, like the inhabitants of classical Greek and Roman antiquity, for example. And this characteristic does not stem from the simple fact that millennia have passed, therefore more events have occurred, facilitating to the current observer a greater amount of information available.

According to Veyne, the ancients lacked experience because to them History seemed to be something monolithic, closed, which did not accept criticism, questioning or new versions if it had already been established previously.

What makes present man be able to know History more than the man of old times is his lack of naivety in front of History. He no longer believes that a story told, or a historiography, or what one seeks to know, is exactly what really happened, the true historical process – the actual process experienced – something which could be called the true History. Thus, probably the explanation of the clear distances, for the contemporaries, between History and Story.

It means that the present man is aware that the production of knowledge is inexorably dependent on multiple conditions, which makes this knowledge marked by different views and conceptions of the world and society – that is why it is said that there is always a theory chronologically before the historical fact, theory that would be elaborated, when it seeks to problematize the knowledge, or imposed, when one does not question the facts but only seeks a preconceived version. In addition, the present man is more aware of the injunctions to which scientific production is subjected because the scientific doing itself is not free from questions about its presuppositions and purposes. Brazilian researcher Déa Felon approaches this from the perspective of the very subjection of historical science to a debatable model of understanding of thought:

“In the present context of the organization and division of intellectual work, the position of History expresses a hierarchy and classification of the sciences corresponding to a conception of knowledge legitimating social division into watertight compartments.” (Felon 2008, 25)

Another aspect of the social division pointed out by Felon is the institutionalization of the University as a unique and privileged place for the production of knowledge. The author concludes, gravely, by pointing out that science can often hinder the understanding of thought rather than facilitating it because, at the limit, it may be at the service of interests, as Hobsbawm (1998) summed up, referring specifically to History: if there is no satisfactory past, it is always possible to invent it.

Done due reservations, however, man of the present day seems far more apt to construct historical knowledge than the man of earlier eras. And if it is true for these women and men of today, that to evoke the past is a condition for culturally orienting the human being in order to broaden his prospects for action in the future (Rüsen 2001), in a synthetic and elegant definition, it does not seem to be the historical knowledge that is being developed within the classrooms. Initially, due to the scarce supply of History classes at primary and secondary schools, so busy that these appear to be with the diffusion of contents related to the mathematical and Grammar sciences.

The original record of Jörn Rüsen, it is worth mentioning, is as follows:

“[the historical knowledge] encompasses the cultural practices of directing the actions of humans in time [...] places men in the temporal changes in which they have to suffer and act, changes that – in turn – are (co) determined and effected by the own act and to suffer humans. The historical culture is able to guide when it

allows that experiences with the human past be interpreted in such a way that, through them, one can understand the circumstances of the present life and, based on them, to elaborate future perspectives.” (Rüsen 2001, 217)

It is possible to make a brief digression about what was written immediately above because Mathematics and Grammar, elementary, are of absolute and recognized priority in the teaching of the human being. However, merely making math accounts and mastering grammatical rules do not guarantee the development of other important intellectual capacities that are also fundamental for the proper formation and emancipation of the human being, such are the arts of narrating, of understanding, of reasoning discursively, among many that make of the human being what he is in its integrality.

In addition to the limited supply of classes, the difficulty in modernizing curricula and customs, with prevailing of the permanence instead of innovations – what some call a tradition, seems to transform the activity of the History teacher into a mere parade of facts and dates, without criticism, reflection or attempt to approximate the practical life of students, which causes two immediate consequences: the content becomes meaningless for the needs of the student; the class becomes boring and here, the tragic corollary of the situation happens: in this context, a good teacher is the one who can teach students to memorize more and more quickly. Hence the contribution of the historical discipline to school failure, and immediately thereafter, the promise of the digital Pandora box appears: the wonders of the technological world of the twentieth century to aid the gritty lessons and disinterested students.

By the way, the historian Leandro Karnal comments on the use of the new resources and their relationship with History:

“A few decades ago, there was an expressive misunderstanding in the modernization of teaching. It was thought necessary to introduce machines to have a dynamic class. Multiplying back-projectors, slide projectors and, later, movies in the classroom. [...] It is needed to be said and repeated to exhaustion: a classroom can be extremely conservative and outdated with all the most modern audio-visual means. A classroom can be very dynamic and innovative using chalk, teacher and student. In other words, we can use new means, but it is the very conception of History itself that must be rethought.” (Karnal 2009, 9)

At the heart of the question seems to be a notion that History, as it is transmitted or assimilated, seems something immutable and indisputable that would just be enough to memorize to know, becoming something unnecessary and tiring. The fundamental notion

of how human problems, and the resulting solutions and confrontations, have been transformed from the past to the present, is being taken from the student's life as a primordial issue, and for which neither the Grammar nor even Maths can help to build the awareness of the human condition.

A first attempt at coping with the complex seems to be necessarily a search for a better definition of what History is for the teacher and what History is for the student. The mission of the well-trained teacher, aware that his discipline generates possibilities of actions and practices historically founded, for the present and future times, consists in helping his or her student leave the outdated conceptions of History in the past, so to speak. Students need to be encouraged to integrate the teaching-learning processes, as only then can they produce meanings.

There is an old adage, which is very conducive to this reflection, it says more or less the following: "Tell me what should be done and I will forget. Show me and I'll be interested, but only if I get involved will I understand".

Therefore, it is important to remember the origins of the historical discipline, even as an additional effort to get students involved, and to be able to evolve safely in Science. In this case, it may be useful again to return to the historian Paul Veyne, so the contemporary educator can face the difficulties to the understanding of History, those proposed by Veyne (1982): historical event is rupture, denoted by values contained in actions, not words. Moreover, the event usually entails a multitude of paradox, to which the historian must return infinitely in his quest for truths or appearances. One must be aware that historical facts and events are multidimensional and carry fragments of a kaleidoscopic image of the world: they are social, economic, cultural, etc.

## STORY OR HISTORY?

The presented panorama suggests that the return to the origins, in terms of historical knowledge, in terms of first postulates about the office of the historian, can still yield fruitful reflections since the situation of academic everyday life is always different, it moves in perpetual transformation, and can generate a departure from the bases of historical knowledge by the specialization and increasing technicality – and increasingly demanded by Science.

In the light of the foregoing, it is worth raising some authors and works that may serve as a complementary reflection. It seems

consensual that, in the Western world, the Greeks Herodotus, Hesiod, and Thucydides, together with the Latins Salustius and Livy, are identified as responsible authors for what can be called the origin of Historiography, so it's worth to review questions and procedures adopted by the discipline's pioneers in classical antiquity. Tensioning the original meaning proposed by Walter Benjamin in his sixth thesis on the "Philosophy of History", his formulation "To articulate the past historically does not mean to recognize it 'the way it really was'. It means to seize hold of a memory as it flashes up at a moment of danger" (Benjamin 1969, 258), in the context of the present work, could mean that the moment of danger would not be the moment in which one tries to glimpse the past as it actually was, in this sense following the German master's warning, but the moment when one tries to glimpse how one imagines it could have been, which is doubly inaccurate because it is where personal opinion arises, the inexorably limited reading of the observer when it tries to make sense of something in the past and of which only traces are known. It is like when one tries, through these rare signs, to give meaning to something that is not well known or comprehended how, in fact, it happened. It is at this moment that it may be useful to return to the earliest initiators, the first formulators, those who have encountered these and other questions at the primeval time, because they have tried to fill in gaps to give consistency to their work. It is to this type of situation that the scholar of Oral History, Paul Thompson, referred when he approached interpretive operations in the construction of History, with the difference that his method simulated an optimal situation in which the historian would have all the available sources: "The evidence is now collected, sorted and prepared in an accessible way: the sources are at our disposal. But how to articulate them? How to build the story from them? [...] How to evaluate and test our evidence?" (Thomson 1992, 299–300). These are key questions and for which, at the present time, one can only produce interpretations for meanings, rather than answers, as Geertz proposed, besides dealing with ethnography, in the chapter entitled "Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture": "Doing ethnography is like trying to read (in the sense of 'construct a reading of')" (Geertz 2001, 10).

One of the references to these efforts, subsequent to the cited Greek and Latin authors, is Lucian of Samosata, better known for his jocular dialogues with the dead in the so-called menippean satire, a subject of little interest for the present moment. More seriously, Lucian of Samosata has a book titled "How to Write History", important to understand how these writings were given in antiquity because

it contrasts with those coming from people pointed out as the historians of his time, that did nothing but the clear and simple compliment to the emperors. In his work, Lucian of Samosata preaches that History must be fair, corresponding to the truth, so that it is lasting, thereby distinguishing very clearly History from Poetry – that the latter would allow the flow of feelings and fable, but the former, the History, would not. Lucian defended a history of scientific character, something away from the simple storytelling, thus posting himself as a continuator of Thucydides. And to avoid the fable, one must return to the question of what the truth is or how to write the truth of facts, a point alluded to by Walter Benjamin a few lines before this. Lucian of Samosata also invokes the image of danger, in this case referring to the moment in which the writer decides to undertake the historiography. According to him, the ideal of this writer would be to remain in a safe place so that the arrows of the critics did not reach him. Thus, the author recommends amidst the dialogues he builds:

“I shall prudently beware of those dangers and solitudes to which historians are exposed, and content myself with only giving a little advice to authors, and subjoin a few cautions, in order to have at least some share in the edifice they are raising [...] Most of them indeed fancy they have as little need of good advice in this business, as in walking, eating or drinking. They imagine nothing is easier than to write history. Everybody can do it, that can put on paper whatever comes into his head. But you, my friend, know better, that it is not a matter of such extreme facility, and does not admit of being treated so negligently. On the contrary, if there be any department in literature that demands great abilities and much consideration, it is this; if a man would produce a work, which, as Thucydides has it, shall remain an everlasting possession of its author.” (Lucian 1820, 44–45)

## IN THE BEGINNING WAS HOMER

It is also to be considered that, even before the authors known as the first historians, Herodotus, Thucydides, among others, there is Homer, from the eighth century BC. Although he wrote his great works, “Iliad” and “Odyssey”, in verse, Homer is taken as reference even for those historians, possibly as historiographical inspiration. It is not by chance that Herodotus, for example, wrote in Book II of his “History”: “Hesiod and Homer are my Seniors” (Harrison, 1927). It seems acceptable to consider, therefore, the line “In the beginning was Homer”, which graciously comments the notorious opening of

the first chapter of the "Gospel of John" "In the beginning was the Word", signifying that everything, even historiographical writing, would have been initially focused by Homer. It is as if to everything that was discovered, thought, proposed, it would always be possible to add "But this was already in Homer". Plato, in "The Republic" (1991, 283), in the same sense, states that the *Paideia* [formation], therefore tradition and history too, of Greek man is made up of two authors: Homer and Hesiod.

Although Homer's work is not proposed as historiographical writing, it is still relevant to early historians, Herodotus in his "History", Thucydides in his "History of the Peloponnesian War", and Polybius in his "Histories", for example, because all will be discussing the story since Homer, often reverberating the Trojan war, first sung by Homer in the "Iliad" and the "Odyssey", but especially with these same historians commonly comparing themselves or approaching Ulysses, or Odysseus, a central character of the "Odyssey". Herodotus, for example, calls himself "companion" to Odysseus, in a frank attempt to increase the authenticity of the narrative. Polybius, for his part, argues that the good historian is not the one who travels through the books, in the comfort of the pillow, in the home environment or in the library – he is not the cabinet researcher at all, but on the contrary, is the one who goes to the field, "A historian needs to have been drenched by the sea-spray and been present in the fields of battle" (Hartog 2001, 164). He quotes the proposition of the "Odyssey" to show Odysseus as the first historian.

Thus, in antiquity itself, and among those who are now known as the earliest historians, there was already the discussion of the historiographical character in Homer. Concerning the testimonies, why does Herodotus claim to be a companion of Odysseus? And what does Polybius cite in defense of his argument that Odysseus was the first historian? The answer to these questions is pointed out in the opening of Homer's work. The proposition of the "Odyssey" occupies the first ten verses of this work, it is the place where Homer invokes the Muse so that it helps him with the content of the narrative, and says that he will talk about this man, Odysseus, a cunning man, and that its citadel of Troy was taken by the Greeks in the famous war:

"Sing to me of the man, Muse, the man of twists and turns  
driven time and again off course, once he had plundered  
the hallowed heights of Troy.  
Many cities of men he saw and learned their minds,  
many pains he suffered, heartsick on the open sea,  
fighting to save his life and brings his comrades home.

But he could not save them from disaster, hard as he strove –  
the recklessness of their own ways destroyed them all,  
the blind fools, they devoured the cattle of the Sun  
and the Sungod blotted out the day of their return.  
Launch out on his story, Muse, daughter of Zeus,  
start from where you will – sing for our time too.” (Homer 1996, 77)

Already the third verse of the “Odyssey” says that Odysseus knew the spirit of many men and saw the city. It is embedded in this idea the concept of the traveler who saw many places but not merely passed through them: investigated these cities, observed, knew and narrated these places.

In the eighth book of the “Odyssey” this question of testimony, of the necessary experience, returns to the discussion. Before returning to his home, Odysseus goes to the land of the Phaeacians and talks to King Alcinous. When Odysseus arrives at the palace of the king, the king offers a banquet to the visitor even though he does not know who he is, just another manifestation of the traditional custom of hospitality, so valued in other times. The king then summons a subject, a singer (poet) called Demodocus to sing and rejoice the banquet. The first thing that Demodocus sings is the dispute between Odysseus and Achilles in the Trojan War. Odysseus hears the song, he is the object and receiver of this song, and he, more than anyone else there, is able to know whether singer says the truth or not. At the end of the speech, Odysseus says:

“[...] surely the Muse has taught you, Zeus’s daughter, or god Apollo himself. How true to life, all too true [...] you sing the Achaean’s fate, all they did and suffered, all they soldiered through, as if you were there yourself or heard from one who was.” (Homer 1996, 547–551)

That is, it is as if Odysseus has said, “It is true what the singer sings, it was just as it happened”. At that moment, the “Odyssey” itself seems to address the question of truth and fiction, a pertinent theme in the discussion of Historiography. It occurs as an attempt to distinguish a fictional text, such as the “Odyssey”, from what would be a true text. That is, it gives the impression that the “Odyssey” itself already poses this problem. The character Odysseus testifies that the narrative of the singer is true because he is a character in that song and he has lived what happened in the narrated facts. The singer does not know what he sings because, as a medium, he needs someone to tell him what happened, this someone is the inspiration, the Muse, daughter of Memory (Mnemosyne, in mythology). This testimony, to gain authenticity, to be true and to have its *ethos* updated from inspiration, or to go from story to History, this testimony

requires the seal of someone who saw what happened, a witness, which was present. This is when the word of Odysseus renders the account truthful, it is the value of the testimony.

Therefore, from the beginnings of western culture the idea of the vision is taken as a fundamental point for the historiographic writing. There is a first opposition between the singer, who has not seen the events and tells what the muses have told him, and the character (in this case, Odysseus) who saw, witnessed, lived the facts.

Continuing the investigation, in this masterful situation constructed by Homer, in which a character appears within the narrative to assert authenticity to a story that in principle would be fanciful, Odysseus then suggests that the singer sings the third song, which is the episode of the horse of Troy, another moment where Odysseus is a character in the action and therefore a witness. He wants to see if what singer is going to tell is true. After the singing, Odysseus really confirms that singer sings the truth and goes on to tell the story – he gives his testimony, and then his words are confronted with other sources if they are available: in the conflict between the sources the researcher seeks History, although the source necessarily acquires a value that “at least in part”, depends on the very social and historical position of the researcher (Le Goff 1990, 547).

## THE TRUTH AND THE APPEARANCE OF TRUTH

In Homer, when Odysseus confirms the story of the singer, the narration now given is no longer in the voice of the poet-singer, but is made in and by the voice of a participant in the action. At one point of the eleventh book, King Alcinous interrupts Odysseus' speech to state: “we know that you are no one who would cheat us – no fraud [...] what grace you give your words, and what good sense within! You have told your story with all a singer's skill” (Homer 1996, 412–418). That is to say, what he narrates, tells with truth, narrates in such a convincing form that it has to be true. At this point, another fundamental problem of the historian seems to have been posed: how can we distinguish the truth, on the one hand, from what is not the truth but, on the other, holds the appearance of one truth? With evidence? Trace elements? When someone records, for example, in memorialistic writings, that a certain thing happened, with no one else able to corroborate the information, how to confirm it?

If, however, all this is no more than supposition, speculation as to where the origin might be, and the possible unfolding of the writing of History, it is worth insisting on the ancestral investigation: after Homer there is Hecataeus of Miletus, from the sixth century BC, therefore a little before Herodotus. Unlike Homer again, Hecataeus wrote in prose. Also, unlike Homer, Hecataeus of Miletus claims for himself the authorship of his work, initiating his "Genealogies" in this way: "Hecataeus of Miletus thus speaks: I write what I deem true; for the stories of the Greeks are manifold and seem to me ridiculous" (Shotwell 1939, 172). Homer, on the contrary, affirmed himself a poet, or a singer, and the one who only registered what the inspiring Muse made him write. In that sense he refused the authorship of his own texts, putting himself as ignorant of the story that he narrated, so that even the figure of Homer (if he really existed – because even his existence is controversial), who is said to have been a man deprived of the capacity to see, blind, therefore deprived of the meaning that symbolizes the foundation of the search for knowledge, as it would be in the case of the person of the historian.

Hecataeus of Miletus is not considered the "father of history", because only fragments of his works have remained. None of his works arrived intact until our days, for this reason Herodotus ends up being known as the initiator of the historiographic writing.

It is not known whether Herodotus was aware of the work of Hecataeus of Miletus, however, it is perceived that he begins his work "History" in the same way Hecataeus began his "Genealogies", that is, claiming for himself the authorship of the book already in the words that begin the volume, making it very clear, from the very beginning, who the author of the work is: "This is the exposition of the investigation of Herodotus of Thorium" (Herodotus 1988, 16). It is interesting to note that the term "investigation" is spelled out in the Greek original transliterated into Western characters in the form of "history", which is quite symptomatic because it is the first action of this author in the work – to investigate. The Greek term "history" is also connected to two other Greek terms – "to see" and "to know". Therefore, the historian, the investigator, is also, and perhaps mainly – at that time, the one who sees and knows, not the one who is influenced by muses and only declaims what they inspire him with, thereby ignoring the content of what he declares: this is the model of Homer in his "Iliad" and "Odyssey". Therefore, to historicize is also to see and to know, according to the tradition of the time of Herodotus, who is the one who travels a lot, sees many cities and knows them. Ulysses, also known as Odysseus, is the main character of Homer's "Odyssey". This is the model for Herodotus. Because to

write his stories Herodotus traveled to many cities, saw many cities and when he could not see what he reported about, he reported it from someone who had seen, witnessed the facts reported. When it was not possible for Herodotus to witness events, or to rely on the testimony of those who had witnessed the events, Herodotus also used witnessing writings. It is evident, therefore, why Herodotus calls himself “companion” of Odysseus, since as in this example, he also traveled and knew, thus being authorized by this travel and knowledge to tell what he saw, what he knew, because what he writes about is not from hearing, saying, but from proving, experiencing it himself. Again, it is not for another reason that Polybius, a Greek historian of the second century BC, chose Odysseus as the first historian.

## THE SEARCH FOR TRUSTWORTHINESS

In his work, in case Herodotus does not know the details of a certain fact or event, in the most impartial way he tries to present the collected versions and, at the same time, exposes his own opinions and assumptions, pointing out, when there is a plausible one, presenting the reasons why he considers the chosen version to have the greatest chance of authenticity. In this sense, he addresses another of the primeval questions of the historian: the search for trustworthiness. By registering the various points of view, or the different versions of the events, the historian tends to value the neutrality, the impartiality that would give more authenticity to his production.

It is the emergence of the bases of History, the autopsy, that is, “to see for yourself”, in the free translation of the Greek word, and then report what has been seen. And the efforts to acquire this knowledge, the fatigue provoked by so many journeys, the toil in the search for the knowledge of the facts, must be constantly emphasized, as to give even greater authenticity to the accounts: thus, Herodotus in his “History”, at every moment (something which has a direct relationship with Odysseus), affirms what he had experienced in his various journeys. However, even if he remembers every moment of the fatigue, also to value the report, the search for the truth must be exempt of fatigue, because the historian must travel, must see, must make sure of the things that he claims to be true. As most turn to what is easier, that is, to sing what is heard or what is read, the path of the historian must be the opposite: the historian is the one who goes to the place and reports.

Herodotus presents these guidelines already in the prologue of his "History". The full content of this prologue is as follows:

"This is the exposition of the investigation of Herodotus of Thorium, lest the events caused by men in time be erased, nor the great and admirable works brought to light by both the Greeks and the barbarians, become without fame; and, in addition, to investigate also the cause by which they made war against each other." (Herodotus 1988, 16)

The prologue of Herodotus further highlights two other points: by exposing the investigation undertaken, it seeks to prevent events from being forgotten; then he also points out his interest in unraveling the causes that trigger events, which again brings him closer to the foundations of classical historiography insofar as it at the same time pays particular attention to the understanding of historical causes.

## INSTRUCT, TO HELP UNDERSTAND THE PRESENT

Another foundation of historiography, another common place, a *topos*, lies in the proposition that one of the functions of History would be to instruct, not to delight, as in the case of poetry. Apparently the first to raise this question would have been Thucydides, still in the fifth century BC, as he writes at the beginning of his work "History of the Peloponnesian War": "It may happen that the absence of the fabulous in my narrative seems less pleasing to the ear" (Thucydides 2001, 14), and he writes it to reference in this way the model of Odysseus, whom Homer posits as a narrator of fabulous passages, since this absence of the fabulous will seem unpleasant because it does not delight. But, more important, continues Thucydides, "Whoever wishes to have a clear idea both of the events that have occurred and of those which will someday occur in the same or similar circumstances as a result of their human content, will judge my history useful and this will suffice me" (Thucydides 2001, 14–15).

Therefore, Thucydides emphasizes the importance of the usefulness of the work, and not the delight it may provoke in the reader. And if the work is not useful for the present time, it will be for the future, for posterity, so that it can learn from the text: it is an acquisition forever, emphasized in the pages of his work.

Thucydides wants to put his work as exemplary, in a conception of History as something cyclical. If events recur, one learns to act from this account immortalized by him: this seems to be the pretense of Thucydides, which here points to another commonplace of the

work of the historian, that is, it is necessary to know the past because it is useful for understanding the present.

Recall also that the author opens his work with the following statement: "The Athenian Thucydides wrote the history of the war between the Peloponnesians and the Athenians" (Thucydides 2001, 1), something that the author does invoking for himself the authorship of the text, as seen previously. It is the model of Herodotus, which is the model of Hecataeus of Miletus, containing again the refusal of the inspiration of the muse when he points out the author of the work. Thus, from Thucydides it is clear that the author narrates what he himself had seen and experienced, since he had integrated one of the fighting armies in the Peloponnesian war, yet nevertheless he seeks the impartiality of the account, because he always tries to deal with both sides, tries to consider the two belligerent points of view to describe and understand the events. This dialogical relation, the confrontation between the sources, was sought since the beginning of time in History, the precedence of History before the opinions.

Another of the resources showing that the historian has to authenticate his narrative is the mention of geographical or historical landmarks that he may have seen in his research trips and search for information. And this reinforces the need for the description of what has been seen, that is, it is not enough to see but also to show, describe what has been seen, such is the meaning of the Greek noun *ekphrasis* [description], which means to expound in detail, to explain everything in detail, as well as is the verbal description of something through an exercise in rhetoric: a description that makes the reader see what is written. It is from the original Greek word *φράσις* *phrasis* [phrase] that, derived in Latin, gives rise to the word *evidentia*, evidence in English. Again, when the historian cannot see what he wants to describe, he seeks to hear the one who saw, seeks evidence, thus, the use of interviews is also justified.

Finally, on the return to the models of Herodotus and Thucydides, although Thucydides prime by the concision and Herodotus – by the abundance in the discourse; although Thucydides tells of his thinking to the posterity, it is a work for the future, and Herodotus tells the past to his contemporaries, they are writers and model works. Such conclusions could be drawn from the present article: the past is told to those present while counting from the present to the future.

## CONCLUSION

Thinking in a rather broad and general way, it can be said that everything that the human being wants to develop and cultivate, demands monitoring and evaluation. The work to be developed in the classroom, aiming to develop the historical discipline with the students, could not be different. Integrating the evaluation part of the work into the development, recalling the fundamental concepts of the discipline can give the teacher new reflections capable of subsidizing adjustments in their activity.

## REFERENCES

- Benjamin, W. (1969). *Illuminations: Essays and Reflections*. New York: Schocken.
- Fenelon, D. (2008). "A formação do profissional de História e a realidade do ensino." *Tempos Históricos* 12.
- Geertz, C. (2001). *The Interpretation of Cultures – Selected Essays*. USA: Basic Books.
- Harrison, J. (1927). *Myths of Greece and Rome*. New York: Forgotten Books.
- Hartog, F. (2001). *Memories of Odysseus – Frontier Tales from the Ancient Greece*. Trans. J. Lloyd. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Herodotus. (1988). *História*. Book I. Trans. M. Kury. Brasília: Editora da Universidade de Brasília.
- Hobsbawm, E. (1998). *On History*. USA: The New Press.
- Homer. (1996). *The Odyssey*. Trans. Robert Fagles. New York: The Penguin Group.
- Karnal, L. (2009). *História na sala de aula: Conceitos, práticas e propostas*. São Paulo: Contexto.
- Le Goff, J. (1990). *História e memória*. Tr. Bernardo Leitão. Campinas-SP: UNICAMP.
- Lucian of Samosata. (1820). *From the Greek – In Two Volumes*. With the comments and illustrations of Wieland and others by William Tooke. Vol. 2. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme and Brown.
- Plato. (1991). *The Republic of Plato. Translated, with Notes and an Interpretative Essay by Allan Bloom*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. USA: Basic Books.

- Rüsen, J. (2001). *Razão histórica: Teoria da História: Fundamentos da Ciência Histórica*. Trans. E. R. Martins. Brasília: UNB.
- Shotwell, J. (1939). *The Story of Ancient History*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Thompson, P. (1992). *A voz do passado: História oral*. Trans. L. Oliveira. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
- Thucydides. (2001). *História da guerra do Peloponeso*. Trans. M. Kury. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Brasília: EDUNB, Instituto de Pesquisas e Relações Internacionais; São Paulo: IMESP.
- Veyne, P. (1982). *Como se escreve a História*. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Brasília: UNB.



# EXPLORING INTEGRATION ISSUES FOR AFRICAN YOUTH OF REFUGEE BACKGROUNDS IN UTAH

**CAREN J. FROST**

**ASTER S. TECLE**

**SUAVIS KANYANGE**

**KILEE JORGENSEN**

**NATHAN P. DEVIR**

Caren J. Frost, PhD, MPH,  
Human Research Protection Program &  
Quality Compliance, Director  
Institutional Review Board, Co-Chair,  
Center for Research on Migration & Refugee Integration  
Former Director, Research Professor  
University of Utah, College of Social Work, Salt Lake City,  
Utah, United States  
e-mail: [caren.frost@socwk.utah.edu](mailto:caren.frost@socwk.utah.edu)

Aster S. Teclé  
University of Utah, College of Social Work  
e-mail: [aster.tecle@socwk.utah.edu](mailto:aster.tecle@socwk.utah.edu)

Suavis Kanyange  
University of Utah, College of Social Work  
e-mail: [skanyange1@gmail.com](mailto:skanyange1@gmail.com)

Kilee Jorgensen  
Division of Public Health, University of Utah,  
School of Medicine  
e-mail: kileejorgensen11@gmail.com

Nathan P. Devir  
Department of World Languages and Cultures,  
University of Utah  
e-mail: nathan.devir@utah.edu

Caren J. Frost, PhD, MPH is a Research Professor at the University of Utah's College of Social Work and the former Director of the Center for Research on Migration & Refugee Integration for the University of Utah. As a qualitative researcher with expertise in ethnographic and phenomenology, Dr. Frost's research expertise allows her to capitalize on mixed method frameworks emphasizing the importance of the qualitative components of a study. She designs and teaches courses on implementation science and evidence-based research, as well as on national and global issues related to women's health and human rights. As of 2019, Dr. Frost serves as the Co-Chair of the University of Utah's Institutional Review Board and as the Director of the Offices of Quality Compliance and Human Research Protections Program for the University of Utah.

Aster S. Teclé, PhD is an Assistant Professor in the College of Social Work at University of Utah. She teaches global community-based social work practice, global issues in women's health, and macro and diversity practice courses to BSW and MSW students. Her research focuses on forced migration and global justice, interpretive inquiry, and issues of diversity and macro social work practice in social work education.

Suavis Kanyange, MSW designs programs for older refugee population at the Salt Lake County offices. She has worked with refugees in the U.S. as well as in Italy. She was a student at the time of this project, and was instrumental in inviting participants and conducting interviews for this study.

Kilee Jorgensen, MPH works for the Utah Department of Health and was a student at the time of this project. She conducted the literature search, draft the literature summary, and reviewed interview data to develop the codes for this project.

Nathan P. Devir, PhD is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at the University of Utah, where he also serves as Director of the Middle East Center. He has published essays on Cultural Studies topics in venues such as the "Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion, Religion and the Arts", and the "Journal of the Middle East and Africa". His recent monograph, "New Children of Israel: Emerging Jewish Communities in an Era of Globalization", was published by the University of Utah Press in 2017.

## ABSTRACT

Utah is one of the principal destinations for refugee resettlement in the United States. Despite the relatively frequent coverage of refugee stories in local news media, very little in the way of scholarly research has been written about these refugees' integration and acculturation. Moreover, no research has yet dealt with the issues facing the youth of these refugee communities. In order to remedy this lack of knowledge about an important component of the populace in the state of Utah, this article uses an ethnographic approach to explore issues of integration and acculturation among African refugee youth. In addition to providing the aforementioned useful data on the status of immigration processes in Utah, it also contributes to the much-publicized international debate surrounding the integration of asylum-seekers from lower- and middle-income countries.

**Keywords:** refugees, Burundi, Somalia, resettlement, integration, acculturation

## PROBLEM STATEMENT

Youth from refugee backgrounds are a sector of the US population about whom service providers and educators need more information. As defined by the 1951 UN, a refugee is “someone who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war or violence. A refugee has a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, political opinion or membership in a particular social group” (UNHCR, 2019). Most often when people think of refugee communities, they see adults. However, over 50% of people from refugee backgrounds are youth under the age of 18. These youth have specific needs for integration in a host community, i.e., access to education and language courses, social skills development for interacting in a new culture, and creating social bonds and bridges with peers (Ager and Strang 2004, 2008).

As noted by Berry (1997), individuals who are able to continue identifying with their heritage and culture as well as with their host culture can integrate into the hosting society and have more positive life experiences as they resettle. Ensuring that systems are in place to support groups during the resettlement process is critical to assist newly arriving individuals and families in creating new and positive life experiences for themselves.

As one of the principal destinations for resettlement in the United States, the state of Utah accepts 1,100 individuals per year, individuals who have had a refugee experience (Canham 2015). Approximately 45,000 currently residing in the state come from twenty different countries. The majority come from Muslim-majority countries (i.e., Iraq, Somalia, and Syria); those from Christian-majority countries (i.e., Burundi, Congo, and South Sudan) are also significant in number (Refugee Services Office 2018). Despite the relatively frequent coverage of refugee experience stories in local news media, little exists in the way of scholarly research (Blair 2000; Geo-Jaja, Mangum 2007; Steimel 2010) to address these individuals’ integration in the US.

Moreover, there is a lack of research dealing with youth from these refugee experience communities, the sector of the population that may most likely be successfully integrating into the US. Only anecdotal evidence exists about how the most recent youth of refugee backgrounds in Utah perceive themselves and their hosts in the context of their new national, linguistic, and civil environments. In

order to remedy the lack of knowledge about an important component of the population in the state of Utah, this research will use an ethnographic approach to explore issues of integration among youth of refugee backgrounds from Burundi and Somalia.

## REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

High school age youth of refugee background experience additional difficulties adapting to cultures of their receiving country, affecting their performance in school as well as their mental health. In addition, other scholars indicate differences in school experiences and socio-cultural values as some of the stumbling blocks for such youth integrating into their new environments (Moskal and North 2017; Ngo, Rossiter and Stewart 2013; Xuemei and Grineva 2016; Heberbrand et al. 2016; Fruja Amthor and Roxas 2016; Colvin 2017; MacNevin 2012; Lincoln et al. 2016). However, according to Rubinstein-Avila, "there are many factors that determine the success of refugee youth integrating in the hosting country such as length of time a student has been in the new environment and integration policies" (Rubinstein-Avila 2016, 80). Current research highlights that the wider the cultural differences the harder it is for youth to integrate in their new environment and the more they suffer. These studies noted that these youth also suffer from discrimination and racism (Fruja Amthor and Roxas 2016; MacNevin 2012; Colvin 2017; Hess et al. 2014; Anagnostopoulos et al. 2016). Mental health focused studies examined refugee youth experience before flight, during migration, and when they settle in their host countries (Hess et al. 2014; Heberbrand et al. 2016; McGregor, Melvin and Newman 2015; O'Donnell and Roberts 2015; Lincoln et al. 2016; Betancourt, Frounfelker et al. 2015; Anagnostopoulos et al. 2016). Additional factors negatively impacting high school youth are language barriers, issues interacting with peers and teachers, inequalities in the provision of healthcare, and lack of access to other resources (MacNevin 2012; Ngo, Rossiter and Stewart 2013; Lincoln et al. 2016; Xuemei and Grineva 2016; Hastings 2012). Some of these problems lead to the youth performing poorly in school, dropping out of school, joining gangs, being bullied, and increasing risks of mental health issues (O'Donnell and Roberts 2015; Hess et al. 2014; Rubinstein-Avila 2016; Moskal and North 2017; Soennecken 2016; Fruja Amthor and Roxas 2016). In summary, there is a lack of literature about the challenges and successes of youth from refugee backgrounds as they are resettling into a hosting community.

In order to provide the context for our study, we focus on an in-depth consideration of education and school systems, language issues, the impact of racism and discrimination, and mental health service needs of such youth as they resettle in the host country. We also identify how these youth in high schools of a western state perceive their successes in educational settings, in the following sections.

## DIFFERENCES IN EDUCATIONAL SYSTEMS AND CULTURAL VALUES

Those of refugee backgrounds from countries affected by war experience difficulties because of cultural differences, clashes, and societal changes. Culture shock among such youth is very common especially if there are religious differences and wide cultural differences with host country communities (Ngo, Rossiter and Stewart 2013). These differences affect such youth as they spend a lot of time trying to develop an understanding of the new culture and their new peers. Some adapt easily, but others struggle depending on the culture they know and how large a divide there is between youth of refugee background and their hosting peers. The former take time to make sense of issues such as gendered interactions, sexual orientations, body language, dress codes, school discipline, and relationships between teachers and students.

Researchers focus on the need for inclusiveness in education to cater youth from refugee backgrounds, noting that even though some work has been done in this area, some inadequacies exist – including the lack of diversity and discussion about diversity in the curriculum (Moskal and North 2017; Rubinstein-Avila 2016; Xuemei and Grineva 2016; O'Rourke 2015; Fruja Amthor and Roxas 2016; MacNevin 2012). The authors further discuss the academic and social difficulties experienced by such youth in schools of hosting societies. Fruja Amthor and Roxas (2016) emphasized the need to provide multicultural education to meet the needs of these youth in schools. This same study noted that multicultural education, which refers to any form of education or teaching that incorporates the histories, texts, values, beliefs, and perspectives of people from different cultural backgrounds, has immensely contributed to equitable education.

Xuemei and Grineva (2016) considered academic and social adjustment of high school youth of refugee background in New-

foundland, Canada. Even though the city itself is not diversified, Newfoundland has experienced an influx of newcomers, most of them with refugee experiences, and the city has been increasing educational services to cater to their needs. The study indicated that respective educational authorities had taken steps to include immigrant students' backgrounds in their policies and curriculum, such as discussions on tolerance and awareness of world religions. However, researchers noted that more still needs to be done, including particular attention paid to the specific identities of the newcomers, as well as the option of alternative study assignments when newcomers feel that their cultural and/or religious values are not respected in the regular curriculum. In addition, this study found that regarding school, work, language barriers, and school culture, student participants experienced difficulties communicating with their peers and teachers since English is their second language. The same authors also argued that students did not understand school culture and the educational system, which slowed their academic progress. Students were also confused by the grading system and considered the school discipline methods too liberal compared to their strict backgrounds (Xuemei and Grineva 2016).

In the early stages of moving to a new environment, students of refugee backgrounds experience fear and loneliness. The students find themselves needing and obtaining help from other students, be it getting directions and/or trying to understand local life (Hastings 2012). The sense of fear is attributed to traumatic experiences they suffered in their own societies and in refugee camps. Hastings (2012) noted that teachers can play an important part in helping integrating youth of refugee background into their new schools. MacNevin (2012) further explored that student participants indicated that teachers made them feel welcomed, acted as mentors, and gave them a sense of belonging.

## LANGUAGE DIFFICULTIES

Studies on the experiences of refugee youth in hosting societies indicate significant language barriers as a negative factor hindering smooth integration into new environments. Not being able to communicate with peers or being misunderstood by teachers is difficult for the youth who in most cases already have other problems with which to deal (O'Rourke 2015). This issue contributes to high dropout rates and criminal activities, such as loitering with nothing to do and/or joining gangs (Ngo et al. 2017). There are mixed findings

about how and when youth of refugee background use English. In some settings, students avoided speaking in their own languages in an effort to practice English (Hastings 2012). However, Xuemei and Grineva (2016) noted that students of refugee background interacted mainly among themselves and avoided communicating with local youth because they either felt uncomfortable or did not understand their accents. Youth also thought that host country peers spoke too fast.

## RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION

Students with refugee experiences endure discrimination and bullying, especially in the early stages of their arrival in the host country. Victimization of such students is common in schools, mainly due to their different appearances, socioeconomic statuses, languages, accents, and religions (Hastings 2012; O'Donnell and Roberts 2015; MacNevin 2012). Discriminatory behavior has a negative effect on the youth's wellbeing, leading to feelings of powerlessness, low self-esteem, and self-blame. Discrimination also triggers recurring memories of the suffering they may have experienced in their heritage countries. Moskal and North (2017) described how youth of refugee backgrounds deserve a safe place to live, grow, and learn. They mention the right of youth to a fair education but also highlight the educational challenges faced by such youth, their teachers, and the social inclusion and exclusion that occurs.

According to Soenneken (2016), dealing with large numbers in refugee applications at the federal level remains a formidable public policy challenge for many nations to handle in a fair and equitable manner. Talking about integration problems, Betancourt, Frounfelker et al. (2015) stated that those with refugee experiences are discriminated against by their peers with similar experiences and/or by host country peers who are not receptive of and who may be very hostile to them. Although resettlement in the host country was often described as stemming from the motivation to seek safety and better opportunities for one's children, many parents of refugee background conveyed that a vast gap existed between those expectations and the realities they experienced (Betancourt, Abdi et al. 2015). They described resettlement as fleeing a "war from one country" only to face "another war in another country" (Betancourt, Abdi et al. 2015, 118).

## MENTAL HEALTH PROBLEMS

For youth, academic and social life is tough on its own; yet many youth suffer from mental health problems emanating from the trauma that began in their own countries during their flight and resettlement in hosting countries (Lincoln et al. 2016; Betancourt, Frounfelker et al. 2015; Heberbrand et al. 2016; McGregor, Melvin and Newman 2015; Anagnostopoulos et al. 2016). These problems worsen when youths are resettled in a new cultural and social environments because of the lack of understanding about the needs of those from refugee backgrounds and the disparities in delivering mental health and healthcare services to such youth.

In a study of Somalis who migrated to the United States, Lincoln et al. (2016) noted that Somalis who left their country because of war and persecution were traumatized by atrocities, and when they arrived in their new environment, post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and depression became apparent. Using Acculturation Stress Theory, the same researchers concluded that the youth who remained marginalized and failed to integrate suffered more emotionally than their counterparts who integrated more easily (Lincoln et al. 2016; Berry 1997). The same research indicated that the youth also experienced mental health issues mainly due to past traumatic experiences in their heritage native countries before migrating to new environments.

Heberbrand et al. (2016) also conducted a study using the Acculturative Stress Theory and described the acculturative style to explain the stresses that happen to these youth upon arriving in the hosting country, such as difficulties in fitting in and language barriers. The mental health of these youth deteriorates further upon arrival in hostile hosting countries when host communities are not receptive to resettlement of those from refugee backgrounds. Insecurities of the youth in the hosting countries worsen the state of their mental health as they change schools and relocate with parents who are struggling to find good paying jobs (Colvin 2017; Rubinstein-Avila 2016).

## SUMMARY

Published works highlight how youth from refugee backgrounds use avoidance-based mechanisms when dealing with stressors, avoid talking about emotionally uncomfortable topics, and keep everything inside instead of sharing or communicating their emotional needs

(McGregor, Melvin and Newman 2015). Further information is needed about situations where the youth are further exposed to unfair treatment and denied equal opportunities for education and language acquisition. As these issues are studied further, the needed resources can be developed to reach youth and their families (Hess et al. 2014). Cultural and linguistic diversity can be positive for youth in educational settings; however, as Colvin described, it can also be a “double-edged sword [...] having people from different cultures will always cause conflict, because they don’t trust [and understand] each other” (Colvin 2017, 226).

Students from refugee backgrounds experience hardships pre-resettlement and post-resettlement (Rubinstein-Avila 2016). It is incumbent upon researchers to provide more information about these hardships and youth perceptions about these challenges so that appropriate services can be introduced addressing the needs of the youth, easing their academic and social lives and helping them integrate more easily into their hosting communities. This study conducted in 2017 in a western refugee resettlement state considered the perceptions of youth of refugee backgrounds, from two communities, about their experiences in high school settings and their impact on integration into a new society. The research question is: Based on their school experiences, what are Somali and Burundian youth’s challenges and successes in integrating into the hosting society?

## METHODS

For this qualitative study, we used an ethnographic approach as described in Creswell and Poth (2018) and Aull Davies (2008) in order to obtain information about the experiences in schools of youth with a refugee background in the US. Specifically, we considered a critical ethnographic lens to ensure that we captured information related to “issues of power, empowerment, inequality, inequity, dominance, repression, hegemony, and victimization” (Creswell and Poth 2018, 94). This approach allowed us to understand the needs of youth from refugee backgrounds as they adjusted to life in a new country. We were especially interested in this area because not much work has been published about youth perceptions about the impact of school interactions on integration. In other words, by conducting interviews with youth we were able to identify some of the areas in which they are (1) struggling at school and (2) excelling at integrating into life in the US.

Between February and May 2017, we interviewed 29 youth from the Burundi and Somali communities from refugee background. These individuals had lived in the US less than 24 months, were new to the integration process, were between the ages of 12 and 20 years, and were enrolled in high school. In September and November 2017, we conducted four focus groups (n=23), two with female youth and two with males, from the same communities to augment the information gained from the interviews. Institutional Review Board approval was obtained for this study.

A convenience sampling strategy was used to recruit youth for the interviews and focus groups. One of the study team members had access to families from each of these communities and discussed the study with parents to determine if youth could participate. Once parents provided their permission, we conducted interviews with these youth.

All interviews and focus groups were audio-recorded with participant permission. We asked the youth which language they would prefer to be interviewed in, then conducted the interviews in English, Kirundi, or Somali. Translation was provided at the time of the interview so the audio-recordings had interviews in Kirundi and English or Somali and English. These audio-recordings were sent to a professional agency for transcription. Once the transcripts were returned, two of the study team members checked them for accuracy in English. The four focus groups were conducted in Kirundi and Somali. These discussions were audio-recorded and then transcribed by a community member who spoke English and the other language. Once the transcriptions were obtained, one of the study team members checked them for accuracy.

As transcripts became available, the study team reviewed the interview transcripts using in-vivo coding to identify themes that emerged from these discussions. These themes were used to frame the coding of the final interviews and focus groups. Once all the transcripts were coded, the study team reviewed them to ensure that these themes connected to the overarching concept of the study about how these youth perceived their challenges and successes in integrating into their host communities.

## RESULTS

Based on the breakdown of our qualitative data concerning the participants' sentiments about the integration process and its connection to the high school experience (taken from recurring statements, allusions, and points of emphasis that appeared throughout

the individual interviews and focus group sessions), we identified five central themes that appeared to be fundamentally tied to notions of belonging, from perceptions of experience to sentiments about integration processes and the connections to school experiences. These include: (1) frustration with seemingly ineffective English language-learning frameworks; (2) a need for greater clarity with regard to academic expectations, learning outcomes, basic procedural matters, and student-teacher contact in the American school system; (3) the importance of communal religious connections for mitigating feelings of isolation and vulnerability; (4) the role of extracurricular activities in bolstering the processes of integration and acculturation; and (5) the preponderance of lingering feelings of alterity, even after the attainment of basic scholastic, sociocultural, and/or language-based capacities in the new home environments. In the sections that follow, we highlight what the youth described in the interviews and/or focus groups and provide exemplar quotes to illustrate these themes and findings.

## THEME 1: ENGLISH LANGUAGE-LEARNING FRAMEWORKS

Excepting one participant, every person interviewed who did not know English prior to arrival in the United States expressed frustration over the perceived inadequacies of initial English language-learning frameworks. (Several of the youth of Somali origin had lived in refugee camps in Kenya before moving to the United States, where they were able to learn English; these few participants who expressed resentment at being obligated to attend English language-learning classes represent only a small fraction of all persons interviewed.) Participants who knew either little or no English indicated that, in spite of the best intentions of teachers and caseworkers to augment newly-arrived students' language skills, the English language programs did not function successfully. Several youth reported having better luck by picking up English from books and films. One person summed up this main stumbling block in the initial acquisition phase: "The main challenge for every refugee is the language."

According to the interviewees, the primary point of frustration surrounding language difficulty is the school classroom. One respondent, speaking of the difficulty that s/he encountered after being absorbed into the class following initial language instruction elsewhere, lamented, "I felt sad and I felt like I wasn't smart enough and I felt stupid." Another noted that, upon arrival in the school setting, "I didn't know anything and I didn't participate in class because I didn't understand anything because everyone in class kept talking

English and I was the only one sitting down not understanding.” Another concluded, “By the time you know the meaning of what they communicated to you, it will be too late for you to do something.” Several participants expressed frustration at the lack of empathy demonstrated by teaching staff. On the subject of the students’ language difficulties, one person mentioned, “I don’t feel comfortable because I feel embarrassed once I talk and the teacher rolls her eyes.”

Indicating that a lack of English language skills prevents even those students who know some English from performing satisfactorily in class, one participant mentioned: “When the teacher calls on us to answer questions, I just sit there and I don’t say anything because she uses big words that I don’t understand. I just feel awkward because my English level is pretty good but it’s not high enough to speak English to the kids who have been speaking English their whole life.”

Across the board, participants pointed out that the modest amount of language training they receive is not in congruence with the academic tasks expected of them. These language difficulties also extend to the students’ performance on written work assignments, as most of their parents do not know English well enough to assist them with daily homework. Several participants advocated that greater assistance be given to students of refugee backgrounds in this vein. One noted, “Probably just more assistance in school for refugees would make a difference. Refugee youth who don’t speak English well need help to understand homework instructions.” Although several individuals mentioned peer-mentoring programs or after-school assistance programs, it appears that these were carried out on an ad hoc basis. The same individuals expressed regret that these programs only lasted for a short while before they were inexplicably stopped. One person, so aggravated by the lack of assistance, said: “It was very hard sometimes [...] I didn’t even want to go ask the teacher because we couldn’t even communicate so I would write whatever and ended up with an F.”

## THEME 2: NAVIGATING US SCHOOL SYSTEM PROCESSES

Recurrent responses from participants point to the need for greater attention to articulating, in the scholastic vein, specific subject-based expectations and intended learning outcomes; improved student-teacher interaction; and, in the larger infrastructural sphere, greater clarity surrounding basic procedural matters.

One person, speaking of the difficulty in learning the ropes of a school system, noted: "I always thought refugees would get more help. That they would get someone who would help them through the school year, show them how to get to their classes and stuff." Another stated: "You don't have any help. The question which comes first in your mind is why they give me this [homework]. I don't understand what they want me to do." Without a support team to assist, participants reported feeling exasperation and confusion regarding assignment directions and expectations. On those points, one participant maintained: "It's stressful, there is a lot of class[es] and some of the work you don't know how to do it, and it's confusing to choose which [assignment] you have to do." Another student echoed this frustration, asserting, "It's hard because I would always wonder why they gave me this homework when I don't even know how to do it." Yet another declared: "Sometime I would ask myself why they gave me this homework when it was just my first day."

On the level of student-teacher interaction, many participants claimed to face either a lack of empathy from their teachers or even a willful discounting of difficulties. One person recounted: "I feel like the teachers are not nice. My teachers yell a lot and I don't feel comfortable asking them to help with homework or anything." Another stated: "My teachers have an attitude and refuse to help me when I ask them." Several participants reported getting a dismissive regard from the teachers after having asked for assistance. That "look," according to one person, "make[s] you feel like you were stupid, and you would feel bad, because it was just a question [that had been asked]." Another noted that her/his teachers' behavior creates such a feeling of disillusionment that "you stop asking questions" in light of the teachers maintaining that "I just told you everything about the homework."

Yet, several students are satisfied with the interaction with their teachers, when comparing that to interaction in the school system in Africa. One said: "Schools here are good [...] when you have a problem, they will help you until the problem gets solved. [...] Back in Africa, there are teachers who [...] will tell you, for example, that 'I am not your Teacher, I don't know you.'" Another expressed satisfaction that there was no "harassment" or "corporal punishment" like in Africa.

Two participants mentioned that after-school tutoring and youth leadership programs have been useful, the latter apparently even helping students with tasks such as "signing up for college." One person, however, maintained, "staying in an after-school program

is not an option for me" because "people are rude there [and] they ignore you all the time."

The lack of knowledge about how to initiate certain procedural functions, such as formal complaints ("I have one class, when I enter in the classroom they insulted me many times, simply because I am black"), is also a problem. For instance, one student reported that the process for registration to public school was cumbersome, claiming that "I was waiting to go to high school for like four months [...] Those people they didn't help us because they needed my mother to come with me [but] my mother needs to take care of the siblings."

### THEME 3: RELIGIOUS AFFILIATION

Participants expressed that maintaining a sense of religious community was helpful for adjusting to life in the United States, even if it did not necessarily mean mingling with those from outside their immediate ethnolinguistic groups. Religious affiliations of the participants interviewed included various Christian denominations (Pentecostal, Adventist, LDS, Catholic) as well as (Sunni) Islam.

When asked about the social effects of attending religious community gatherings, one person said: "I don't have too many friends at church but I'm happy to see people in the church. The only friends I have [are] there." Another expressed contentment that their friends at church "speak the same language." Another person, contrasting the atmosphere in church with that of the school setting, said: "The activities we have at church [such as sports and games] help us forget the things that happen at school. Because at church everyone is so nice and they help you feel like you belong." (One of the activities alluded to involves English language practice, about which one person said: "They help me learn English with their activities on Wednesday [and it] helps you feel comfortable and relax.") Another person, referring to fellow congregants, echoed the aforementioned sentiment concerning the welcoming atmosphere, saying, "At the church, they don't care about your color, they are very sweet people." This same person, referring to the church functions, maintained, "the activities at the church help you calm down."

With regard to any practical help given by community religious bodies that might aid in integration processes, several people indicated that church members were the ones who initially received them from the airport, and who subsequently showed them how to use public transportation and where to do their shopping. Monetarily, several participants report benefitting from the financial assistance

offered by their religious associations. One person said: “If you can’t pay bills, they help you. They give vouchers for D.I. [Deseret Industries, a low-income outlet].” Another agreed, noting, “If you have a bill you can’t pay they will help you. And if you don’t have food they will help you.” This support, however, is not true for all populations, as assistance is sometimes only advice-based. On this point, one person said: “[W]hatever the problem is, you go to the pastor of the church [...] He will help you as much as he can.” Another stated, emphasizing the difference in types of assistance: “The church helps, but it is not material stuff. It is spiritual help.”

Religion also plays a role in the manner through which participants view their identity paradigms in the United States setting. One person, indicating a persistent feeling of otherness, said of the place of religion in their home country: “I miss the fact that there weren’t a lot of questions about religion [because] everyone shared the same religion.” This feeling is especially relevant for female youth of the Muslim faith, as their vestimentary codes frequently come into discussions with peers and teachers as points of contention. One participant, speaking of the same kinds of expectations, stated: “I don’t like wearing pants, and if it’s something that requires me to wear pants, then I just choose not to do it.” Two youth rejected the idea that wearing the hijab (a veil mandated by some schools of Islam) would impede their participation in sports activities. According to one: “I don’t let my hijab hold me back, I do the things I want to do, I play everything I want”; according to the other, “I wear it and it’s not something that will stop me from doing the activities.”

#### THEME 4: EXTRACURRICULAR ACTIVITIES

Overwhelmingly, participants noted that taking part in extracurricular activities helped to bolster the process of integration. Most such activities were sports-related, and tended to be organized at least in part by the public school system. These activities differ from extracurricular activities organized by ethnic- and/or religious-oriented cohorts, which tend to preclude interaction with peers from dissimilar backgrounds. The extracurricular activity most male participants cited as having been involved with is soccer, followed by weight training and basketball. For female participants, the most common activities included volleyball and basketball, but also extended to weight training, yoga, and non-sport activities, such as acting and singing. One person explained that, in regards to social interaction, “last year I participated in the [school] musical and it helped me a lot.”

When asked about the general importance of extracurricular activities, one interviewee said: "I have a lot of friends because I play in the soccer team. So most of the kids in the soccer team, at lunch we sit together and we talk, we interact with each other [...] I'm kind of the only refugee in the soccer team. But I don't get treated differently, just like one of the team members. And we just talk and talk [...] We talk about American stuff, how it's different from Africa." Being on a team also seems to lead to other out-of-school social activities, which were uncommon for those whose interaction was limited to time on school grounds. For instance, the same person quoted above noted: "[S]ometimes we have team dinners and we go to one of their houses and we hang out sometimes. And sometimes we train as a group so we all go to one of our friend's houses." Another person who shared a similar experience advised other youth of refugee backgrounds to sign up for as many school-based activities as possible, in order "to be involved in [...] every activity that is going on in your school."

Several interviewees seemed to concur with this logic, expressing a desire to participate in such activities, but reported having either inadequate information about sign-up procedures and deadlines, or intimated that they were kept away from these activities for reasons that appear to be discriminatory in nature. For instance, one person said, in regard to signing up for the weight training team, that he missed the deadline; that person also asked if the interviewers could help to navigate the process for entering the soccer club. Another person wished to play soccer on the school team, but remained confused about why certain credits he was lacking were an impediment to that end. And yet another had hesitated to join due to racial discomfort because, as she said, "When I look at the soccer team at my school it's mostly White girl[s], and I would like some who has the same skin color as me to be there so they could pass the ball back to me. Sometime people assume just because you're black you can't play or you're not smart."

Several female interviewees of the Muslim faith expressed frustration that they were expected to wear pants during sports activities because, as one noted, "I don't like wearing pants, and if it's something that requires me to wear pants, then I just choose not to do it." Yet another stated that, although she saw wearing pants as an imposition, it is "not something that will stop me from doing the activities." Another stated, "the days I have volleyball games I [dress] different[ly] from other days." With regard to the wearing of the Muslim hijab (head covering) and its possible impeding on partici-

pation in such activities, another person said that she refused to let it “hold me back [from doing] the things I want to do.”

## THEME 5: NOTIONS OF ALTERITY

The final common recurring theme worthy of noting is the preponderance of lingering feelings of alterity, even after the attainment of basic scholastic, sociocultural, and/or language-based capacities in the new home environments. These sentiments are often linked to the suspicion that their exclusion stems from preconceived xenophobic notions held by Americans, whether those are religion- or race-based.

One person, when asked to describe impressions of the United States, said: “I don’t like anything about it because people are racist,” going on to describe an incident in which a man with a dog told this interviewee and a Muslim friend (both of whom were wearing hijabs) that “we are not allowed to touch the dog [because] he didn’t agree with our religion.” Another Muslim youth reported an incident in which she got on the bus “and the bus driver asked me to leave my bag under his [seat], as if I had a bomb.” This person chose instead to exit the bus.

Several youth feel branded by their racial and “outsider” status, even when they possess an advanced level of linguistic or cultural awareness. They reported that their American peers and teachers do not think them intellectually capable of performing in class, and that questions the youth pose are answered in such a way that “it makes you feel stupid.” One person said: “Everywhere I go, they are always calling me ‘refugee’ and it doesn’t always make you feel good [...] you could just say my name or something.”

Finally, many youth expressed general disappointment at the reluctance of American peers to engage them socially. For instance, one person complained, “If you stay after school there would be no point because no one will even talk to you, you would rather go home to your sibling than stay when no one will talk to you. And it’s really hard eating lunch by yourself or sitting alone.” Another commiserated: “When you don’t have friends at school, it is hard because you have no one, and then you go home sad and that makes it so you won’t want to come back. And I feel like no one likes me so I go home after school.” And yet another lamented that, because many American peers are rude to those who look different, “You’re always trying to make friends with the people who have your race.” This same person noted that she would, in principle, “like [to be] friends with everybody,” a sentiment that nevertheless proved

difficult when so many peers do not, in this person's words, "appreciate my race."

## DISCUSSION

Across the interviews and focus groups with students from Africa, students' senses of belonging in school settings are deterred by issues of language, lack of information regarding navigating school systems, religious affiliations, predetermined representations of individuals of refugee backgrounds, and a sense of isolation and exclusion. For students who joined the schools with relatively lower English-speaking capabilities in particular, inability to express their ideas in the classroom was responded to with acts that created sentiments of disregard, exclusion, and silencing from both teachers and classmates. The lack of understanding of what was going on in the classroom, on one hand; and the gestures, looks, eye rolling, tones, and lack of support and information, on the other hand, led to these youth asking themselves, "Why are we here?" instead of interrogating the school system. Subtle and blatant silencing messages in schools are more often than not the main triggers students of color experience leading them to confusion, isolation, and dropping out from school or finding alternatives to schooling. Waters (2000, 1994) asserts that students strongly affiliated with their ethnic communities gain confidence and graduate from high school at higher rates compared to those who are not associated with any support systems in their community. Likewise, discussing classroom climates and the condition of newly arriving foreign students, Castagno (2014) argues that the ways in which systems and students manifest the subtlety of racism include focusing on and joking about language and accent, mimicking pronunciations, making faces, and forcing the students to repeat themselves.

Moreover, lack of information and support, even in extracurricular activities that could have engaged the students further, distances them because it is hard for the students to navigate the school system. The common approach of "culture clash" should be interrogated so that students are not victimized based on their origin, as if lacking (Ngo 2008). Instead, the students find their places of worship – churches and mosques – to be spaces of comfort more than extracurricular activities. As Waters asserted (2000, 1994), engaging with people who look like them, understand them, and embrace the young students in their faith-based communities creates the hope students aspire to experience in this country, and in their

schools. Studies have also shown that Muslim students are forbidden from wearing the hijab in school, which stems from xenophobia (Windle 2004). Dress codes and host country fears have become issues for schools who deny students' identities and cultures. As other scholars have indicated (Stenvig et. al. 2018; Betancourt, Abdi et al. 2015), gaps exist between the expectations and the realities as students and parents transition to a new life in hosting countries. The question is: What does it mean when students are forbidden to freely share and practice who they are in a country that claims freedom of expression within its diversity? How can schools and host communities create a sense of belonging, and the assumed integration, when isolationist talks and images seem to be the everyday practice in schools? What can be done about it?

In response to such isolationist practices, the Burundian and Somali students tend to associate with students from other countries. The students try to replenish the void they experience in school by looking for students who look like them because non-black students do not "appreciate their race" regardless of how friendly they try to be with fellow students. Typical to what Tatum (2003) asks in her seminal book on manifestations of racism in schools, African students seeking acceptance look for students who are going through the same experiences. While these students worry about how their lack of communication with teachers might be misinterpreted as disrespectful, what they fail to capture is the power that underlies the denial of support from teachers, students, and the schoolsystem. These include Whiteness and the privilege to talk back, talk with foreign students, and react in ways that are belittling, ignorant, and dehumanizing toward foreign students. Such reactions are unwelcoming, racist, exclusionary, and dismembering, creating unfriendly classrooms and school environments.

Such acts are part of the implicit curriculum rarely talked about. Yet, implicit curriculum is only a piece of the puzzle. Historically, constructed images about those from refugee backgrounds hailing from Africa and the Middle East already exist (Said 1979) – based on their place of origin, religion, race, gender, and cultural practices – which predetermine those individuals' lives in the US. The representation of such individuals as backward, poor, deviant, and savage, disseminated through media and public institutions such as schools, perpetuates stories about the "Other's" deficiency as if natural, on one hand, and fears of the exotic in hosting societies, on the other. As the current supremacist events against Americans, Jews, African Americans, and Muslims in particular demonstrate, such constructed stories also apply to people who were born and/or raised

in the US for over half a century. Current students from Africa are facing similar but subtle atrocities based on stories constructed from neocolonial and racial lenses. As noted earlier, real-time discriminatory acts continue daily for students of such backgrounds (“I have one class, when I enter in the classroom they insulted me many times, simply because I am black”). Teachers and students manifest and repeat the stories in schools to the detriment of recently arriving students.

White students’ reluctance to engage with students of color in social activities is also associated with English language proficiency. For White students and teachers, “other” students’ lack of expressing their ideas is already associated with their physical and cultural traits that become the identifiers of difference and deviation. Taken as natural, the focus then becomes the need for students of color to catch up; and designing language skills programs becomes the priority thus centering students of color as the problem rather than structural and systemic factors. When diversity is perceived as cultural difference relative to an assumed centered/normative culture, diversity is portrayed as and equated with deficiency, thus necessitating interventions to “fix” the Other. In such cases, Whiteness is the assumed point of reference – an inherently privileged position that marks other cultures as deviant and/or deficit. Such an approach toward diverse students is applied not only to race, but also to students’ intelligence, behavior, appearance, performance, and other abilities and creativities.

Overall, African students socialize in schools whereby White students and teachers dominate. What students in this study are indicating is that White students’ and teachers’ perceptions and acts are part of the society’s fabric and therefore normalized because no one questions their attitudes and behaviors be it in classrooms, extracurricular activities, or other school environments. Neither students nor teachers seem to question their attitudes toward students of color because those attitudes seem natural. What’s more, they may respond that any perceived harm resulting from such attitudes is “unintentional” when interrogated. Teachers’ complacency in teaching, and blindness to color and power is not the answer to such a politically charged domain. Rather, what is needed is a critical reflection of the power and privilege teachers and students embody just because they are White (and/or members of other dominant social groups), and the power that informs their practice. Connecting individual experiences to structural and systemic analysis is key to better understanding students from refugee backgrounds. Acknowledging racial difference should also be connected to structural analysis.

Students of color need extracurricular activities, support systems, and socially engaging activities. However, the approach should be socially engaging, informative, and engaging in critical conversations with their fellow White students so that both sides are aware of African students' experiences. Schools need to open up, recognize, and acknowledge what is happening in classrooms and school compounds; address the power embedded in language and language proficiency; and dilute dominance among students so that education can lead them to better possibilities.

## LIMITATIONS

For this study, we would like to acknowledge a few limitations: population focus, language issues, and sampling strategies. Since we focused on refugee youth whose origins are in Africa, the study findings may not represent the experiences of refugee youth from Latin and South America, the Middle East, and/or Eastern Europe. In addition, we did not interview youth from other countries in Africa. As a consequence, the information will be pertinent for youth from Burundi and Somalia. Language is another area that is a limitation in our study. We had anticipated that these youth would speak enough English to participate actively in an interview and/or a focus group. However, what we found was that many of these youth did not have language skills that allowed them to fully participate in the discussions. Thus, we have missed some nuances inherent in the interviews and focus groups about the experiences of these youth. A third limitation was that the sampling strategy was a convenience sample, which provided opportunities for those youth known to some of the researchers to participate. Some youth who might have had different experiences did not have the opportunity to share their views, so their voices were not heard in this study.

## CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

African students, transitioning for a better life in the new environment of their hosting country, socialize in schools where White students and teachers dominate. Students in this study shared that White students and teachers' perceptions and acts toward these students are part of the society's fabric and therefore normalized. No one questions the majority attitudes and behaviors in classrooms, extracurricular activities, or the overall school environment. Nor do White

students and teachers question their attitudes toward students of color because inclinations seem natural. English language programs designed for newly arriving students could be technically supportive, yet authorities do not question what goes on in school environments that facilitate and/or deter students' learning be it in language or the sciences. For teachers to be complacent and blind to color and power is not the answer amid such a politically charged domain. Rather, what is needed is a critical reflection of the privilege teachers and students embody just because they are White (and/or members of other dominant social groups), as well as the power that informs their practice. Connecting individual experiences to structural and systemic analysis is key to better understanding students from refugee backgrounds and supporting them in their learning process. Acknowledging racial difference and engaging in conversations with the students is key to diluting the power embedded in school systems, classrooms, and student bodies.

There is a need to consider pre- and post-resettlement experiences of newly arrived students, their resilience, interrupted schooling due to forced displacements, acculturation and racism. Teachers and students need to learn about the historical and political conditions that forced students to migrate, as well as their cultural differences, so that students from Africa feel that they belong to the school, that they are members of the student body and the hosting society.

Students of refugee background need extracurricular activities, support systems, and engaging activities. However, the approach should be informative, constructive, and socially engaging in critical conversations about newly resettled students' experiences with their fellow White students and teachers so that both sides become aware of African students' experiences. Schools and teachers need to recognize and discuss what is happening on campuses and in classrooms, i.e., the implicit curriculum; address the power embedded in language and language proficiency; and dilute unequal power relations among students in order to enhance learning experiences.

The wealth of cultural knowledge, values, and experiences that students of refugee backgrounds bring to the school must be acknowledged, respected, and integrated in the curriculum. Existing efforts in multicultural education should not only entail recognition of cultural differences but also center and engage with the values new students bring to the community. In order to broaden their perceptions, students and teachers need to learn about refugee students' historical, social, and cultural backgrounds. Such new communal knowledge would also help African students experience healthy growth and progress in their education. Teachers' complacency could

be addressed through critical conversations and training that helps them realize their privilege and power, then engage with students, parents, and respective communities in order to learn the meanings of difference and to include what they have learned into practice – i.e., lesson plans.

As students in the study shared, gaps exist between students' and parents' expectations from hosting societies and their daily realities. As the newly resettled students reflected – noting their parents' engagement in minimum wage jobs and the barriers they encounter accessing healthcare and other services – the power and wealth of the host country has not materialized to change their lives as expected. Professionals with years of experience in their country of origin are denied jobs relative to their profession mostly because higher education institutions in the US do not recognize credentials from some countries in the global south. Parents are thus trapped in poverty, which directly impacts their children's academic performance. Nevertheless, they are resilient. The resilience that keeps them going stems from their traditional knowledge, harsh living conditions in displacement, and forced migration experiences, which rarely are recognized by schools and social science research. Refugees escaped harsh environments to face and engage in another struggle in the US to obtain quality education and jobs.

Lack of understanding and stigma to mental health is another barrier to accessing services. Often students and their parents do not talk about their mental health conditions that stem from harsh experiences amid migration and during resettlement. Such avoidance leads to internalizing the illness rather than seeking services. There is a need to explore how these families cope with odd environments, behaviors, and mental health issues traditionally and build upon their knowledge and practices to educate students and communities of refugee backgrounds so that they can formulate with new ways of addressing mental health issues and/or benefit from existing services that consider their values.

In cases whereby students find their respective religious practices to be spaces of comfort, religious institutions should be supported to cultivate the youth toward claiming their identities and cultural practices. Religious institutions can also introduce them to better ways of understanding hosting societies. Youth programs that mesh diverse cultural values must be designed and supported in line with youth interests and curiosities so that the students keep track of, and strategize, skills for their studies and daily lives. Deeper and critical discussions on cultural practices and values – including discussions about racism and ethnic differences – should be held in classrooms

to help students and teachers better understand each other. Students need to feel comfortable talking about who they are and discussing the challenges they face.

Sports and after-school activities allow students to mingle with students outside their ethnic group, and students of refugee background should be encouraged to participate in existing activities based on mutual and reciprocal respect, friendship, and collegiality. Community-based sports and activities should be introduced to schools so that students' perceptions and outlook toward non-traditional sports – and therefore the communities – could be enlightened.

Overall, broadening the schools', students', and teachers' views toward newly resettling students requires engaging in critical, open dialogues about what it means to be different – be it through art, sports, or conversation – so that all involved develop collective perspectives and responsibilities.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank Clara Valero, Andrew Tuller, the Somali and Burundian youth participants, and the staff at the Utah Refugee Education and Training Center for their assistance during the data collection phase of this study. We would also like to gratefully acknowledge seed funding received from the University of Utah Seed Grant Committee.

## REFERENCES

- Ager, A. and Strang, A. (2004). *Indicators of Integration: Final Report*. U.K. Home Office Development and Practice Report #28. London: Home Office.
- Ager, A. and Strang, A. (2008). "Understanding Integration: A Conceptual Framework." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 21(2), 166–191. Available at: <<https://doi.org/10.1093/jrs/fen016>> (accessed September 2019).
- Anagnostopoulos, D. C., Heberbrand, J., Eliez, S., Doyle, M. B., Klasen, H., Crommen, S., Cuhadarošlu, F. C., Pejovic-Milovancevic, M., Herreros, O., Minderaa, R., Karwautz, A., Svedin, C. G. and Raynaud, J. P. (2016). "European Society of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry: Position Statement on Mental Health of Child and Adolescent Refugees." *European Child and Adolescent Psychiatry* 25 (7), 673–676.

- Aull Davies, C. (2008). *Reflexive Ethnography: A Guide to Researching Selves and Others*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Routledge.
- Berry, J. W. (1997). "Immigration, Acculturation, and Adaptation." *Applied Psychology* 46 (1), 5–34.
- Betancourt, T. S., Abdi, S., Ito, B. S., Lilienthal, G. M., Agalab, N. and Ellis, H. (2015). "We Left One War and Came to Another: Resource Loss, Acculturative Stress, and Caregiver-Child Relationships in Somali Refugee Families." *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology* 21 (1), 114–125.
- Betancourt, T. S., Frounfelker, R., Mishra, T., Hussein, A. and Falzarano, R. (2015). "Addressing Health Disparities in the Mental Health of Refugee Children and Adolescents through Community-Based Participatory Research: A Study in 2 Communities." *American Journal of Public Health* 105, 475–482.
- Blair, T. (2000). "Speech on asylum and immigration." Available at: <<https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2005/apr/22/election2005.immigrationandpublicservices>> (accessed September 2019).
- Canham, M. (2015). "The Slow Migration: Syrians to Be Utah's Next Refugee Community." Available at: <<http://archive.slttrib.com/article.php?id=3134131&itype=CMSID>> (accessed September 2019).
- Castagno, A. E. (2014). *Educated in Whiteness: Good Intentions and Diversity in Schools*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Colvin, N. (2017). "'Really Really Different Different': Rurality, Regional Schools, and Refugees." *Race, Ethnicity, and Education* 20 (2), 225–239.
- Creswell, J. W. and Poth, C.N. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Designs: Choosing among Five Approaches*. 4<sup>th</sup>ed. Los Angeles: Sage.
- Fruja Amthor, R. and Roxas, K. (2016). "Multicultural Education and Newcomer Youth: Re-imagining a More Inclusive Vision for Immigrant and Refugee Students." *Educational Studies* 52 (2), 155–176.
- Hastings, C. (2012). "The Experience of Male Adolescent Refugees during Their Transfer and Adaptation to a UK Secondary School." *Educational Psychology in Practice* 28 (4), 335–351.
- Heberbrand, J., Anagnostopoulos, D., Eliez, S., Linse, H., Pejovic-Milovancevic, M. and Klasen, H. (2016). "A First Assessment of the Needs of Young Refugees Arriving in Europe: What Mental Health Professionals Need to Know." *European Child and Adolescent Psychiatry* 25 (1), 1–6.
- Hess, J. M., Isakson, B., Githinji, A., Roche, N., Vadnais, K., Parker, D. P. and Goodkind, J. R. (2014). "Reducing Mental Health

Disparities through Transformative Learning: A Social Change Model with Refugees and Students." *Psychological Services* 11 (3), 347–356.

Lincoln, A. K., Lazarevic, V., White, M. T. and Ellis, B. H. (2016). "The Impact of Acculturation Style and Acculturative Hassles on the Mental Health of Somali Adolescent Refugees." *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health* 18 (4), 771–778.

Geo-Jaja, M. A. and Mangum, G.L. (2007). *Struggling at the Golden Door: International Refugees in Utah*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Center for Public Policy and Administration.

MacNevin, J. (2012). "Learning the Way: Teaching and Learning with and for Youth from Refugee Backgrounds on Prince Edward Island." *Canadian Journal of Education* 35 (3), 48–63.

McGregor, L. S., Melvin, G. A. and Newman, L. K. (2015). "Differential Accounts of Refugee and Resettlement Experiences in Youth with High and Low Levels of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) Symptomatology: A Mixed-Methods Investigation." *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry* 85 (4), 371–381.

Moskal, M. and North, A. (2017). "Equity in Education for/with Refugees and Migrants – Toward a Solidarity Promoting Interculturalism." *European Education* 49 (2/3), 105–113.

Ngo, B. (2008). "Beyond 'Culture Clash' Understandings of Immigrant Experiences." *Theory into Practice* 47 (1), 4–11.

Ngo, H. V., Calhoun, A., Worthington, C., Pynch, T. and Este, D. (2017). "The Unravelling of Identities and Belonging: Criminal Gang Involvement of Youth from Immigrant Families." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 18 (1), 63–84.

Ngo, H. V., Rossiter, M. J. and Stewart, C. (2013). "Understanding Risk and Protective Factors Associated with Criminal Involvement in a Multicultural Society." *International Journal of Child, Youth, and Family Studies* 4 (1), 54–71.

O'Donnell, D. A. and Roberts, W. C. (2015). "Experiences of Violence, Perceptions of Neighborhood, and Psychosocial Adjustment among West African Refugee Youth." *International Perspectives in Psychology: Research, Practice, Consultation* 4 (1), 1–18.

O'Rourke, J. (2015). "Education for Syrian Refugees: The Failure of Second-Generation Human Rights during Extraordinary Crises." *Albany Law Review* 78 (2), 711–738.

Refugee Services Office, Utah (2018). "Refugee Services." Available at: <<https://jobs.utah.gov/refugee/>> (accessed September 2019).

Rubinstein-Avila, E. (2016). "Immigrant and Refugee Students across 'Receiving' Nations: To What Extent Can Educators Rely on PISA for Answers?" *Clearing House* 89 (3), 79–84.

- Said, E. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage.
- Soennecken, D. (2016). "The Paradox of Docket Control: Empowering Judges, Frustrating Refugees." *Law and Policy* 38 (4), 304–327.
- Steimel, S.J. (2010). "Refugees as People: The Portrayal of Refugees in American Human Interest Stories." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 23 (2), 219–237. Available at: <<https://doi.org/10.1093/jrs/feq019>> (accessed September 2019).
- Stenvig, T., Carson, P., Randall, R., and Bohn, M. (2018). "Transitions of South Sudanese Refugees: Reaching for a Better Life." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 31 (4), 664–686.
- Tatum, B. D. (2003). *Why Are All the Black Kids Sitting Together in the Cafeteria? And Other Conversations about Race*. New York: Basic Books.
- UNHCR (2019). "What is a Refugee?" Available at: <<https://www.unrefugees.org/refugee-facts/what-is-a-refugee/>> (accessed September 2019).
- Waters, M. C. (1994). "Ethnic and Racial Identities of Second-Generation Black Immigrants in New York City." Special issue. *International Migration Review* 28 (4), 795–820.
- Waters, M. C. (2000). "Multiple Heritage Families in the United States: Patterns and Puzzles in Identity Choices." In: Spickard, P. and Burroughs, J. W. (eds.) *We Are a People: Narrative in the Construction and Deconstruction of Ethnic Identity*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 23–40.
- Windle, J. (2004). "Schooling, Symbolism, and Social Power: The Hijab in Republican France." *Australian Educational Researcher* 31 (1), 95–112.
- Xuemei, L. and Grineva, M. (2016). "Academic and Social Adjustment of High School Refugee Youth in Newfoundland." *TESL Canada Journal* 34 (1), 51–71.

# EXAMINING TATTOOING AS A FORM OF IDENTITY EXPRESSION AND INTERACTION PROCESS: ATATÜRK TATTOOING CASE

**BURCU GUMUS**

Burcu Gumus, PhD, Assistant Professor  
Communication Science Department at Art and Science Faculty  
Doğuş University, Turkey  
e-mail: burcugumus@dogus.edu.tr; burgumus@gmail.com

Burcu Gumus is an Assistant Professor at the Dogus University Art and Science Faculty, Communication Science Department. She earned her Ph.D. degree in communication at the İstanbul Bilgi University in 2017. Her research interests include communication, social movements, and gender studies.

## ABSTRACT

Today, tattoos are used as a medium for reflecting individual opinions and ideas. Tattooing is perceived as a practice that differentiates individuals and demonstrates an identity or group affiliation. The main aim of this study is to understand the practice of tattooing Atatürk symbolisms in modern Turkey. The practice demonstrates and communicates the important ideology of Kemalism. Atatürk tattoos (signatures, portraits etc.) are a legitimate way of social and political identity expression. In other words, a symbolic reflection of the Kemalist or secular identity.

To better understand the relationship between meaning and interaction as it relates to Atatürk tattoos, twenty in-depth interviews were conducted with people in Istanbul. The focus of the study is to examine what impact having an Atatürk tattoo has on the individuals' experiences. Therefore, the main questions are focused on the process of acquiring, owning, and exhibiting of an Atatürk tattoo in a social milieu. The majority of interviewees were influenced about getting an Atatürk tattoo until it was brought to their attention by people close to them, or societies they are part of. Even though interviewees have stated that they do not care about other people's opinions, they especially have a tendency to conceal their tattoo in their business life and this practice indicates that the Atatürk tattoo bearer may be considered to possess a potentially discrediting or stigmatizing attribute.

**Keywords:** tattoo, Atatürk, identity expression, body politics, interaction process

## INTRODUCTION

The practice of tattooing has undergone an impressive transformation in recent years. Once considered a practice associated with lower classes of society, it is now practiced throughout a broad variety of social class. Independent from classes in societies or centuries, tattoos are a form of communication. Benson referred to tattoos as “scars that speak” (Benson 2000, 237). Tattoos are signs that give clues about one’s self to others. Further, when people notice a tattoo, they also respond to it, try to classify, interpret, and give a meaning to it. However, tattoos are also ambiguous. Hancocks identifies the ambiguity about the appearance and meaning of tattoos as “[u]nless the bearer actually speaks Ming Dynasty Cantonese, how can they be sure that the beautiful symbols actually convey greetings of harmony?” (Hancocks 2005, 357).

The aim of this paper is to understand the decisions revolving around why to get a tattoo, as well as where to get a tattoo on the body. Furthermore, the issues of becoming tattooed and how this decision impacts relationships with other people will be addressed. Since obtaining an Atatürk tattoo (portraits, his signature etc.) is new and popular in Turkey, Atatürk tattoos were selected as a specific case to be analysed. More importantly, and what this study desires to reveal, are the standpoints, the action, and reaction of people using Atatürk tattoos to communicate. This study will examine how people with tattoos communicate their self-expressions using the lens of symbolic interaction theory. In even simpler terms, what meaning could an Atatürk tattoo convey to its bearer and for the rest of the community?

This paper concentrates on the relationship between meaning and interaction as it relates to tattoos. Twenty in-depth interviews were conducted with people in İstanbul that have Atatürk tattoos and are of different ages and occupations. The main aim of the study is to examine what impact having an Atatürk tattoo made on the individuals’ experiences. Therefore, the main questions are focused on the process of acquiring, owning, and exhibiting an Atatürk tattoo as it relates to interaction with others.

This paper will begin with a brief historical view associated with tattooing and an explanation of the body as an instrument. It will be shown that tattooing is thoroughly accepted nowadays within Turkish culture. The next section will try to analyse the relationship

between one's tattoo and how people view their "self" and how others view them. Then the theoretical background of research findings will be presented. Finally, the paper will end with a discussion of where the questions of the study match with the general literature.

## HISTORY OF TATTOOS

It has been discussed that tattooing has existed in many cultures for thousands of years (Koch et al. 2005) and that tattooing is the most ancient and broadly adapted form of long-lasting body alteration (Sanders 1988). Tattooed mummies such as the Pazyryk mummies (sixth to second century B.C.) and the recently discovered 5000-year-old ice man found near the Alps (Armstrong 1991; Schildkrout 2004) are evidences that tattooing existed in ancient cultures.

Looking at the history of tattooing, in various communities tattooing has had different usages and meanings. For instance, the Greeks marked slaves and criminals with an explanation of their crimes tattooed on their foreheads (Gay and Whittington 2002). The Chinese used tattooing as a punishment and marked the outcasts of society (Gilbert 2000). The Japanese used tattooing for decorative purposes on the body (Brain 1979). In New Zealand, Maori tribes used tattoos to signify braveries and to disclose social status within tribal groups. The Maori also used tattoos to depict their ancestral lineage and rank in society (Doss and Ebesu 2009). In Paraguay, tattoos are used as a tribal distinction (Doss and Ebesu 2009). Based upon these usages and meanings, it is clear that tattooing was used as a communication practice in different contexts and periods in human history. In parallel with these usages, although a scant attention has been paid to tattooing practices in Anatolia in terms of historical perspective, some studies clearly show that tattooing was also used with traditional purposes and practices. To give an example, there were some evidences that henna was used for good luck, to protect against bad spirits in Çatal Höyük during the seventeenth century BC (Scheinfeld 2007). Furthermore, some studies indicate that the migratory cultures in Anatolia such as the Turkmens, Arabs, Kurds, Karaçis, and Sazmantus, applied tattoos for communicative purposes in both personal and communal levels (Serdaroğlu 2013). For instance, to indicate the position of a person in a community, preserving health and curing diseases, symbols of belonging, aristocracy and tribes and sexuality, fertility and beauty are some of the purposes tattooing was used for (Erim 2011).

Although the practice of tattooing has become a modernized phenomenon in today's world, in the beginning, it was considered as something adopted by lower class of society, for instance, sailors, prisoners, gang members and outlaws (Atkinson and Young 2001). In the 1800s tattooing became popular among the aristocratic community (Irwin 2001) and in the early 1900s tattooing continued to be considered as something adopted by lower-class community (Govenar 2000). By the middle of the twentieth century, people who had tattoo(s) were viewed as marginal, unreliable, and dangerous (Sanders 1985). While tattooing has been linked with a certain group of people, it has also been linked with a certain type of person. These people, by tattooing themselves willingly, presented a "mark of otherness" which was associated with criminality, mental illness, and abnormality (Kosut 2000). However, as a consequence of modernization, the practice of tattooing and its usage also transformed significantly in the twentieth century. For instance, over the years as more and more people from the middle-class community were tattooed and various artists who had formal art training became interested in this craft or profession, tattoos received new consideration and admiration (Schildkrout 2004). Thus, it is natural to see tattooing as a modernized phenomenon, dramatically ruptured from its historical context, which also incorporates a traditional perspective into a modernist one. Accordingly, tattooing is not linked with lower class society anymore in today's world, on the contrary, it is directly associated with the middle class and is evaluated as a modernized "traditional" phenomenon.

Even the academic interest about tattooing in Turkey is still at an embryonic level. Recent studies have shown that the tattooing practices in Turkey became an important phenomenon within the Turkish public sphere especially after the 1980s, which can be considered as the years when modernized and westernized life practices began to be deeply embedded in Turkish society due to the neo-liberal policies that were widely in use. In other words, westernized or globalizing cultural practices like tattooing or other performative practices that are based on consuming habits and personal interests had limited influence on the public and private spheres of Turkey until the 1980s. This is definitely related to the economic structure and politics of Turkey until the 1980s. After the military coup in 1980, the economical politics and approach of Turkey dramatically changed and neo-liberal policies began to appear in every aspect of Turkish society. In this era, westernized and global consumption patterns, which are directly based on capitalist and economic globalization, began to appear in the public and private spheres of Turkish

society. Admittedly, this can be evaluated as the second radical rupture from “tradition” in terms of a modernist perspective for the Turkish Republic after the reforms of Mustafa Kemal during the founding years of the Turkish Republic to create a holistic and national identity as a consequence of western oriented policies, in which he underlines these efforts as “attaining the levels of modern civilization” (Tanil 2003). In parallel with the effects of the neo-liberal politics of Turkey, which have been occurring since the 1980s, the practice of tattooing in the context of western practices has begun to become more prevalent in the everyday life practices of Turkish citizens since the end of the 1990s. During this period, tattooing is generally associated with western tattoo practices like music band tattoos, political images, and personal interests. In this sense, Mustafa Kemal tattoos began to appear in large numbers on the bodies of some Turkish citizens during this time. According to Turkoz (2014), the underlining reason why some sections of Turkish citizens used their bodies as a way to disclose a political message is directly related to the results of the 1990 and 1994 political elections, in which Islamic political parties won in landslide fashion. Hence, for Yegenoglu (2007), this political support for Islamic parties in Turkey’s nonreligious public spheres, which were shaped through Kemalist reforms, also increased the concerns of Kemalists and nationalists about Islamists becoming the vital power in the social, cultural, and political life of Turkey.

Consequently, tattoos have represented personal histories, thoughts, feelings, and memories of people for many centuries. It is a timeless and constant way of communicating to the outside world. But the message of a tattoo may not be perceived by others as the bearer intended. As aforementioned, there is scant literature about tattoo usage in Anatolia during ancient times. Also, there are very limited academic studies about recent tattoo images in Turkey. Especially, there is no data about the number of tattooed people in Turkey or no studies have been done to analyse the sociological and psychological aspects of Turkish tattoo bearers. Nevertheless, the observations indicate that tattooing has become popular among Turkish citizens in recent years. The proliferation of tattoo studios can be verification of this claim. The aim of this paper is to understand the decisions revolving around why to get tattoos, as well as where on the body to get the tattoo. The study especially focuses on Atatürk tattoos (portraits, his signature etc.). In addition, becoming tattooed and how this body art impacts interaction and relationship with other people will be analysed. This research question will be examined with the help of the symbolic interactionism theory perspective.

## ATATÜRK TATTOOS

The omnipresence of Atatürk in Turkey is a well-known but may not be such a noticed fact among Turkish citizens. Everyday spaces in Turkey contain various forms of Atatürk symbolism – statues, busts, pictures, and paintings are everywhere, as well as bridges, roads, avenues, cultural centres, streets, etc. are named after him. These structures and names greet the citizens every day. People are so used to living with a background image of Atatürk that these images go unnoticed most of the time. However, the tattooing of Atatürk images (portraits, his signature etc.) on Turkish people is a relatively new practice that has gained popularity in recent years. It is believed that the political power and public visibility of Islam in Turkey at the end of the 1980s and successes in the 1994 local elections, and the 1999, 2002, 2007, 2011, 2015 general elections are the significant points which should be highlighted in the current study. Accomplishments of the AKP (Justice and Development Party) in Turkey have caused some people to develop a more obsessive attachment to symbols of modern, secularist Turkey.

What makes Atatürk a common centre of interest as far as the mass mania of conspicuity is concerned? Why do people obsessively identify themselves with the “Father of the Turkish Republic”? Why do they somehow feel engrossed and trapped in the majestic image of a great figure? It would not be erroneous to claim that Atatürk has been meticulously conserved in the collective memory of the Turkish citizens since the foundation of the Turkish Republic in 1923. The creation of the Atatürk myth was not an unfounded fallacy as it has been generated through generations, in an ascending parabola, since the early 1920s. Atatürk pioneered a rarely-witnessed social, political, cultural, military and administrative changes within the newly founded Republic which was the fruit of an almost 150-years of a reformation period. His merits are concentrated in his extraordinary ability to transform a highly conservative, oriental, closed, extremely patriarchal, religious, xenophobic society into a secular, occidental, egalitarian, free, and open society. He drew a portrait of himself through his extraordinary intellectual, military and personal merits which gradually turned to be a perfect example for the whole society: an intelligent polyglot, an astonishing bookworm, a realist strategist, an admirable dancer, an exemplary statesman, a patient reformer...

According to Yeğenoğlu, from the Kemalist perspective, modernization is understood as the secularization and westernization in Turkey. Since secularization and westernization are associated with

modernization, modernization is considered as a final end (Yeğenoğlu 2007). Yeğenoğlu claims that supporters of Kemalist ideology evaluated the level of civilization according to the accomplishment level of modernization and westernization in different part of life.

Navaro-Yashin (2002) examined the image of Atatürk in her study and she referred to Atatürk as a sign of separation from religion in Turkey.

Özyürek (2004) argues that when Islam was promoted, Atatürk symbolism became privatized. However, Özyürek explains the increasing visibility of Atatürk symbolism as a commercial activity.

Nilüfer Göle (1997) referred to the continuous conflict between Secularism and Islamism in Turkey and she states that this conflict is not solely contained to the political arenas; it is also an important issue in the community. For this reason, people use their bodies in a political way to disclose their tendencies, such as through a veil or tattoo. She also says that modernizing and westernizing reforms have had a significant effect on public and private spheres and this influence has allowed Turkish citizens to self-(re)define themselves.

In light of these explanations, Atatürk tattoos are an interactive performance that are displayed on the body and create a sense of belonging and emphasize group identity. The public displaying of a tattoo is used to differentiate oneself from others (Simmel 1950). These tattoos differentiate people politically from each other and create various social dynamics that impact Turkish society.

It is important to briefly emphasize how the authors explain secularism and Islam in the Turkish community and this can highlight why people prefer to have an Atatürk tattoo. There are many studies that try to explain the national, ethnic, and religious identity connection in the current context of Turkey, it is decided to refer some of the evaluations of various authors about what an Atatürk image is and what secularism means in Turkey.

## BODY AND SELF-EXPRESSION

Along with the social, cultural, political, and technological changes, the body and its embodiment experiences have become more considerable and apparent than ever before in academia. The spread of plastic surgery or tattooing has created new sociological research areas about the body and its embodiment. In this sense, recent studies clearly show the body and embodiment relationship from different sociological perspectives, including gender, race, and death. For instance, Turner (1984) and Synnot (1993) show that bodies are

gendered. Calefato (2004) highlights the body as a fashioned “thing”. In a more complex way, Demello (2000) examines that body is a customized phenomenon by tattoos or increasingly appearing other body customization practices in contemporary societies. Accordingly, these studies consider the body as a social subject and clearly indicate the role of the body as a way of communication in various contemporary sociological contexts and interests. In parallel with the current interest in academia, this study also considers the body as a socially constructed rather than a static object and as a vehicle of communication in social interactions and tries to examine how the body is constructed through tattoos as a way of personal expression.

Although the body is considered as a given and a passive object in natural sciences, it can be evaluated as a socially constructed phenomena and a determinative factor in everyday life practices. For instance, as Baudrillard (Waskul 2006) states, the body is the site where social relations directly occur. For Baudrillard, it is not an authentic and passive “object” anymore in contemporary consumer culture. Consistent with Baudrillard, Giddens (Waskul 2006) states that the body is the way of personal expression in man’s ongoing “identity project”. According to him, the body is the reflection of our individuality as well as our group affiliations. He thinks that the human body is a part of the sphere of modern culture, not a part of nature anymore. For Foucault, the body is a social phenomenon that is ideologically and culturally constructed by historical power relations on an ongoing basis. He claims that the body is constituted through the regimes of discourse and power. Thus, the body is repressed and transmuted and cannot be separated from the regimes of discourse and power. Furthermore, Goffman (1959) also considers the body as a place for exposing the self in modern communities. According to him, the body is not an organic phenomenon; on the contrary, it is a performed character – which is continuously constituted in different contexts of everyday life – that is metaphorically presented to different audiences. Based on these theoretical frameworks, just as it is clear to see the body as a socially constructed phenomenon and a determinative factor in social relations, it is clear that the idea about the body as an objectified, customized phenomenon or a source of communication and signification, is based on different practices like fashion, tattoos, or hair styles. Therefore, tattoos or other body customization tools are important practices for analysing how the body is constructed and used for different aims such as a method of personal expression.

In this sense, the recent studies by symbolic interaction theorists argue that the body is one of the most important signification or communication sources, which occurs through social interactions (Vanini 2004). The studies are theoretically based on socio-semiotic interactionism, an approach that depends on an assumption that the body and its meanings are constructed through human interactions; the issue of how the mutual communication takes place through various interactions with different bodies on both contextual and theoretical levels is also handled (Vanini 2004). For instance, Zilman (1991) mentions that the body takes, metaphorically or not, its physical and existential forms through other bodies. He identifies this as mediated body – a body is shaped and constituted with the intentions or personality traits of other bodies. Sanders (1985) also analyses the tattoos on the human body by using symbolic interactionism theory. In light of his observations, he accepts the body as a vehicle of communication and puts forward the idea that the body has got not only physical aspects, but it also has different characteristics, which are based on human interactions, like being an aesthetic object, a canvas for resistance against social control, or a vehicle of communication. More recently, Benthall and Polhemus (1975) state that bodies are a sort of personal expression device, more specifically a medium, for expressing mental or emotional states. These studies certainly accept the body as socially constructed and as a subject occurring through social and human interactions in terms of communicative circumstances.

In short, although the recent studies focus on the mutual relation between the body and human interactions within the symbolic interactionism framework, the ontological relation of the body in a political (Atatürk) context has remained underexplored. Hence, this study develops an understanding about the body in the context of meaning production by focusing not only on the body as a fieldwork, but also concentrating on the body as a socially constructed phenomenon. Furthermore, this article will not only analyse the Atatürk tattoos, but also evaluate how the Atatürk tattoos have become a message on the human body as a consequence of social interaction. In this regard, this study offers a conceptual approach to analyse Atatürk tattoos by utilizing symbolic interactionism, which basically begins with the argument that human beings and communities are co-dependent and connected, and both are established through shared meanings. Symbolic interaction come out as an effort to comprehend social life through stimulus response. Therefore, the goal of the research is to understand the symbolic practices that make a shared reality possible (Pascale 2011).

## THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: SYMBOLIC INTERACTIONISM AND TATTOO

As in many other communication mediums, tattoos have also developed a new kind of language that necessitates attention, especially in the Turkish community. To initiate and maintain communication in a community, the tattoo bearer has to have an idea of what kind of message can a tattoo carry and disclose, and at the same time, understand the possible implications a tattoo can create on other people. A significant point to keep in mind is that this message may vary from person to person, as each tattoo may expand, constrict or rediscover language. Then it is possible to talk about the language of tattoos as well as certain messages that tattoos are used in. From this, the explanation of symbolic interaction of tattoos is seemingly in need.

The term “symbolic interactionism” was coined by Blumer (1969), to explain and develop the ideas of George Herbert Mead. Symbolic interaction theory perceived self as a social entity instead of as a psychological entity. Human behaviour is considered a social behaviour that comprises social acts. The individual is considered as active and creative in symbolic interactionism. This perspective concentrates on interaction and meaning. This theoretical approach lays special emphasis on how individuals interpret others, themselves, and their situations. Proceeding from this explanation, people act toward things based on meanings that they have developed for those things through interaction (Burke 1999; Charon 1992). In light of this explanation, people who have a cross or Virgin Mary tattoo are defined as religious, and the tattoo bearer also wants to emphasize the importance of religion for herself/himself.

Mead (1934) gives high importance to the self as a fluid and dynamic process that changes over time. Self is a significant entity in the theory. Mead considered self as a flexible, dynamic and reflexive entity that alters over time. Mead denoted “self” as both a subject and an object. In other words, self can observe and communicate with oneself and respond to oneself as others would. Consequently, self is a social origin entity and is directly affected by communication (Stryker and Serpe 1994). What this may mean for tattoo communication is that the relation between the tattoo itself and the message associated with that tattoo could transform feedback between the tattoo and the tattoo bearer. In other words, people learn more about others by watching them. People also learn more about themselves in the same way as well. Tattoo bearers, like Atatürk tattoo bearers,

distinguish their body and themselves from others (such as, Islamic people), and having such a tattoo has a deep and important impact on her/his interactions. People constantly engage in an interpretation and evaluation process from one situation to another; the meaning of these situations depends on people's interpretations and evaluation of them. An Atatürk tattoo has become a key component of the bearer's identity and their behaviour will change in accordance to who they come into contact with, another Atatürk tattoo bearer or people who do not have Atatürk tattoos.

During the internalization process, the explanations of third parties and our reactions are internalized, likewise we talk and listen to ourselves in the same way that we talk and listen to third parties. Mead refers to us as "I" and "Me", to form the basis of our self. This is a way to know ourselves and how we interact with ourselves. Although the primary interaction process of symbolic interactionism is based on face to face communication, this is named as the internalization process, sociology scholars of the body have claimed that nonverbal communication also fits in with the explanation of process of internalization (Schilling 2002). People can learn a lot from the response they received from others. In fact, when people discuss and evaluate responses and reactions, they go through an internalization process.

To have a tattoo is a conscious and deliberate decision (Bell 1999; Sweetman 1999). People either prefer to tattoo themselves or not. There is a plethora of evidence that some group of people get inked just to display their identity. For instance, prisoners, gang members (Bell 1999; Cronin 200), religious groups, etc. (Stevens 1992). Atkinson and Young asserted that the body is an "evocative social text" (Atkinson and Young 2001, 119) or "a bill board to be displayed socially" (Atkinson and Young 2001, 128). Clearly, tattoos have been used in an informative way. Further, tattoos may be located on relatively hidden parts of one's body or they may be located on more visible parts of one's body. Thus, it is important to emphasize that tattoos have the potential to be seen as a communicative tool and used for communicative intentions. People who prefer to have their tattoos on a visible part of their body are aware that others might notice their tattoos easily and form decisions about them. Roughly speaking, visible tattoos have more communicative value. This does not mean that, when a tattoo is in a concealed part of the body, it does not have communicative value. Actually, concealed tattoos also have communicative value. However, limited people are aware of them and may form a decision or a judgment about it.

It seems possible to approach symbolic interactionism theory in terms of tattoo visibility. To do that one needs to analyse the theory from the perspectives of meaning and symbolism. Blumer (1969) explained symbolic interaction theory based on three main propositions (Poloma 1993):

1. People act toward things with regards to the meaning that those things represent to them.
2. As a result of interaction people infer meaning.
3. Interpretation changes the meaning.

In light of the above items, we realize that meaning is the centre of human behaviour according to symbolic interactionism. Symbols alter the social relations of people and people give meaning to symbols and try to explain these meanings with the help of language (Tye and Tye 1992). Consequently, symbols are the main point of communication. Symbolic interactionism includes the understanding and explaining of actions because symbolic meanings might have different denotations for everyone. This explanation can be evaluated from the tattoo perspective. Tattoos also lead to the comprehension of what other people find important or meaningful. As mentioned earlier, tattoos are also a way to create meaning and a way to understand what is meaningful to others. Tattoos can have various meanings among different groups. A person with a visible Atatürk tattoo may believe that the tattoo is an expression of belief in Atatürk's principles and reforms or is a sign of a loyal supporter of Atatürk, but the same Atatürk tattoo might be accepted as a sign of rebellion or perceived as unreligious when praying in the mosque with others. Therefore, concealing a tattoo may be explained with the symbolic interactionist approach by aiming to reduce a role conflict. Having a concealable tattoo provides an opportunity to move in and out of different roles easily. People who have concealed tattoos may abstain from exposing their tattoos in some groups, in order not to hear something like "I didn't see you like that" or some similar phrases, which affect their relationship with others in a negative way.

## METHODOLOGY

This study aims at understanding the social construction of the human body through tattoos as a way of personal expression. For that purpose, the study focuses on the critical relationship between the human body and its embodiment. As Goffman (1959) points out, the human body is central to interaction with its various discourses and shared meanings. The body not only enables people to engage

in social encounters, but also connects with and differentiates from the flow of habitual activities and relationships with one's social identity. More specifically, Shilling (2002) also highlights that postures, gestures or other personal expressions are bodily activities that are imposed by society. Thus, the human body is the main fieldwork and site of this study and Atatürk tattoos will be analysed in terms of their communicative purpose. For these reasons, the data is analysed in two steps. Firstly, this study tries to reveal the emic meanings of the participants about Mustafa Kemal Atatürk and lastly focuses on the human body and embodiment relations with regards to Mustafa Kemal Atatürk references which have been examined in the first step of the analysis.

The bodily human practices in contemporary societies generally occur through symbols, words, or other personal activities. All these practices are important in making the connection between one's self-identity and one's social identity (Goffman, 1959). For that reason, it is important to analyse the human body in terms of its bodily appearance. Thus, the main research method used in the first phase, which was also the "physical" fieldwork of the study, is the semi-structured in-depth interviews with the participants who have Atatürk tattoos. This research also gives an opportunity to grasp how the emic meanings of the participants occurred and were shaped through the symbols of Kemalist ideology. In this regard, having an Atatürk tattoo and the visibility of these tattoos on the human body were the two main criteria in selecting participants for this study. These criteria are expected to reveal the emic meaning of participants about Mustafa Kemal Atatürk and the usage of tattoos as a way of human embodiment. In addition to this, the literature also supports the fact that face-to-face interviews are still a better way to understand "the other" (Davis 1982). In this context, the study is conducted via open-ended questions asked face-to-face in interviews with twenty persons that have tattoos on their bodies. The interview questions guided participants to talk about their Atatürk tattoo experiences, details about their tattoos, and how they view Atatürk. All interviews were audio-recorded and transcribed.

In-depth interviews, visual analysis, and participatory observations with people who have tattoos on their body demonstrate to what extent they can directly be associated with the embodied ethnography of human bodies. In order to analyse the Atatürk tattoos, we also need an understanding of the participants' cultural and ideological habitus that their environment is surrounded by. In this sense, given the exploratory nature of the study, qualitative research methods were also employed to analyse how tattoos are reproduced on the

human body as a way of expression. As Blumer (1969) explained, symbolic interactionism is determined by analytic induction techniques, which both depend on inductive logic and empirical proof in localized frameworks. Mostly, symbolic interactionists use textual and visual analysis and ethnography participant observation, life history, unstructured interviews and focus groups as well. Therefore, this study is methodologically based on in-depth interviews and visual analysis adopted to analyse the human body as fieldwork or as a participant of the research. Therefore, embodied ethnography provides us a more holistic understanding not only about tattoos on the human body, but also about a social construct that appears through social interactions. Following this line of argumentation, visual analysis is another major method for data collection in this research. It is employed to examine the symbolic meanings of tattoos and the social context that surrounds and shapes them. With reference to this examination, the symbols, images, or words of the tattoos are analysed to illuminate the use of one's body as a way of making the connection between one's self-identity and social identity.

During the interviews, in order to relax the participants and conduct the interviews in a chat-like atmosphere, warm and amiable interview questions, i.e. the order of questions were not rigorously followed, were asked to the participants. When interviewees went off topic, the interviewer interrupted them to manage and maintain a continuous interview.

Most of the people who were asked to meet for an interview first asked whether this was a political study or not, and which side I was on. Since most of the participants do not want to join a political study, a detailed explanation about the aim of the study was given to them. Moreover, it was highlighted that the participant's personal information will not be published anywhere. It was believed that this is a very interesting finding.

Participants were allowed to choose the location in which the interviews would take place, as well as the time and date. All participants chose public spaces such as local cafes or coffee houses like Starbucks. Participants were not given any prize or fee for participating in the study, in most cases only a drink was payed for their participation. In some cases, participants themselves offered drinks to the interviewer. All the interviews were begun at the beginning of 2018 and completed until the end of the year.

Mostly, the selection of the participants was based on the Atatürk groups on Facebook such as, Atatürk dövmesi.com, Mustafa Kemal ATATÜRK Dövmesi Olanlar!, Atatürk Dövmesi Yaptırmak

İsteyen Kaç Kişiyiz?, Atam dövmesi olanlar. An email was sent to every Atatürk group member on Facebook. The study was explained by email, and they were given a phone number to contact the author. Most of the people first wanted to see the questionnaire and then either accepted to be a part of the study or asked not to be contacted again. When the interviewer tried to contact them again, they did not respond to the emails. 75 emails were sent and only 16 people accepted to be a part of the study. The remaining four participants were reached through acquaintances. The age of the participants ranged from 20 to 42. Four of participants are females and sixteen are males. In the analysis section, real names and ages of the participants are given in parentheses.

## ANALYSIS

### ATATÜRK MEANS ...

Through human interaction, meanings of things are created over time (Blumer 1969). For symbolic interaction, the origin of meaning is collective. It is not something that can be detected and determined individually. This is the most significant point for symbolic interaction and this point differentiates symbolic interaction from analytic realism in which a table is seen as a table in and of itself. In symbolic interaction, objects and events are never solely a backdrop for interaction. According to Mead (1934) people do not just imagine the probable positions of others. People also imagine the objects and places with which they have an interaction. Therefore, inanimate objects can be considered to have a type of agency or they have a duty on effects of human responses and interactions (Pascale 2011).

According to the interview results, Atatürk tattoo bearers evaluated Atatürk as follows:

"[...] I am a big fan of Atatürk, I have an emotional attachment to him. Atatürk is a patriotic and foresighted leader. If I were under the same conditions as him, I would behave in the same way. Atatürk has left us a beautiful future [...]." (Emre, 41)

"[...] Over the years I realized that Atatürk is a führer and the Turkish community caused it to be so. My sign sensitivity changes but I am still concerned with giving a message with my tattoo. However, Mustafa Kemal is still a real leader for me [...]." (Can, 28)

"[...] I believe Atatürk is a hero and idol and that's why I want to have an Atatürk tattoo. I am supporting republicanism, secularism, nationalism, populism and reformism and Atatürk is the best way to express support for these principles [...]." (Özkan, 28)

"[...] Atatürk is a timeless and endearing leader. I believe Atatürk is the only sufficient answer to the AKP and AKP's potency. I believe Atatürk is a symbol of equality, unity and progress [...]." (Sevginar, 42)

"[...] Atatürk means freedom, leadership, being the face against injustice, respect for people, modesty [...]." (İsmail, 38)

"[...] Atatürk means love, great people, a great leader, everything to me [...]." (Afra, 45)

Generally, participants assessed Mustafa Kemal Atatürk as a great leader and they consider him to be one of the most important figures in the history of the Turkish Republic. Based on this argument, it was observed that the participants' relationship with Atatürk is established based on emotional metaphors.

A collective identity may have been first assembled by different people, for example, as in the case of the Atatürk tattoo bearer group in the Facebook communities. Collective identity relies on certain agreements and approvals by those to whom it is applied. Collective identities are declared in cultural materials-names, narratives, symbols, verbal styles, rituals, clothing, etc. Different from ideology, collective identity bears positive feelings for other members of the group. It means to be a group, and the meaning of a community consists of symbols, icons, etc. Besides, these icons or symbols of the community are one of the key elements that make it one.

From the above quotations we realize that the participants define Atatürk through common words such as "great leader", "justice", "secularism", "republic", etc. Although these words do not provide conformity among the participants, they can be evaluated as the symbolic domain of Atatürk in Turkish society.

As a result of interviews with Atatürk tattoo bearers, Atatürk is considered as a public figure that has had a significant impact on communal and social life. In this context, participants defined Atatürk through common expression. Participants have established their relationships with Atatürk over emotional messages. Therefore, in terms of the internal and social relations of the participants, Atatürk has become the main determinant in the relationship between their body and their Atatürk tattoos.

## IMPACT OF OTHERS

Whether formally structured or not, social institutions can also form and develop one's identity (Gubrium and Holstien 2003) such as a group of friends who have Atatürk tattoos and gather frequently to chat. Even if someone refers to oneself in an individualized sense

with terms such as “I” or “me,” these labels are passively taken into consideration in a social context (Gergen 2007). In other words, we cannot distinguish ourselves from our related and close environment in which they (Atatürkist, Kemalist, secular etc.) are developed:

“[...] I am a member of Kuvayi Milliye society and people in that community have had a serious impact on me to understand and love Atatürk. For us, Atatürk is a sign of nationalism. And most of the people in my society have an Atatürk tattoo. When I saw these people’s tattoos I decided to get one [...]” (Tolga, 42)

“[...] I graduated from Gazi University. During my university life my patriotism was further increased by the effect of my friends in university. My friends had a serious influence on me to get an Atatürk tattoo because 7 out of 10 of my friends have an Atatürk tattoo or an Atatürk and Turkish flag tattoo [...]” (Ercan, 28)

“[...] I learned the values and thoughts of Atatürk from my parents. All my family members are active participants in the Kemalist Thought Association and most of the people around me have an Atatürk tattoo. Even my father has an Atatürk portrait on his left bicep. I have an Atatürk signature tattoo on my left arm [...]” (Hasan, 25)

“[...] like Pınar I decided to get an Atatürk tattoo after Gezi. Actually, I did not have an idea to get an Atatürk tattoo. However, I went to the tattoo studio with Pınar and I said to myself why don’t I get one? I can say that she is the one who inspired me to get an Atatürk tattoo [...]” (Beyza, 31)

The common basic message is as follows: the interaction process both shapes and constructs what we think of as the self. Sanders (1988) argues that tattoos are symbols of being a member of an unconventional social group and these groups apply their own practices and beliefs to its members to follow. The above quotations also support the explanation about the impact of other people in getting an Atatürk tattoo.

## ATATÜRK AS A COMMUNICATION TOOL

Individual identity is inevitably associated with physical appearance. People alter or decorate their bodies and form behaviours in order to disclose information about themselves as efficiently and quickly as possible. Physical modifications (clothing or any type of physical alteration) allow people to alter their roles according to the expectations of the surrounding environment (Goffman 1959, 78). Decisions or judgments made by others according to this appearance provide a basis for social interaction (Kruglanski et al. 1993). The

concept of “embodied sociology” is analysing identity development as a physical manifestation from an outcome-based standpoint. Further, the main focus point of analysis is to reveal how individuals express themselves nonverbally instead of through verbal cues (Goffman 1959). The Atatürk tattoo design choice particularly reflects both individuality and an identity with a particular group. It serves as a means of personally connecting with others who recognize Atatürk and share the values that Atatürk’s principles and reforms embody. Some participants want to declare with their Atatürk tattoos that they are the protectors of the Republic of Turkey:

“[...] No one can disturb this republic easily when we are here is the message that I want to give with my tattoo [...].” (Ismail, 28)

“[...] I believe Atatürk is the only sufficient answer to the AKP and AKP’s potency [...].” (Sevginar, 42)

And some of them considered their tattoo as an indication of their life style:

“[...] People mostly view my tattoo as Atatürk’s signature but I believe it is an indication of my lifestyle like Kung Fu. Kung Fu is a kind of a lifestyle for the Chinese and Atatürk is a life style for me [...].” (Samet, 23)

Some of the participants mentioned that they do not care what other people think about their tattoos and some of them said that they are ready to handle any problems their tattoos may cause:

“[...] this tattoo expresses who I am and if I face any problem or trouble just because of my tattoo I am ready to handle it [...].” (Samet, 23)

“[...] I always waited for someone to say something negative about my tattoo, so I can beat them up. However, such a thing has never happened yet [...].” (Ismail, 28)

“[...] I do not care what other people say or think. Besides, I am ready to handle every type of problem and trouble [...].” (Tolga, 42)

“[...] I believe to have an Atatürk tattoo is something personal and this is nobody’s business [...].” (Afra, 45)

As a result of being in contact with others (assumedly non-tattooed or religious people), people were faced with both positive and negative reactions. According to Sanders people who have received negative reactions frequently are more careful about “whom they reveal their tattoos to” (Sanders 1988, 419). Most of the answers of the interviewees do not directly match with the explanation of Sanders. Because, most of the interviewees mentioned that they are ready to face and handle any negative response about their tattoo from other people. They just prefer to conceal their tattoos in a

business environment. However, according to the answers, interviewees are more afraid of being perceived as a rebel, rather than receiving a negative reaction. Although, interviewees gave very different responses, generally, it was understood that they prefer to expose their tattoos rather than hide them.

The quotations below try to analyse why interviewees deem Atatürk as a communication tool:

"[...] I decided to get an Atatürk tattoo after Gezi. I wanted to say or show that this country is not without a protector. I went to Taksim from the first day to the last day during Gezi and I helped people, people helped me, we shared so many emotional and unforgettable moments together. I learned to share so many things during those days. I guess during that time I understood the importance of Turkey and what Atatürk tried to do. Furthermore, I realized that I really hate the AKP government and I decided to get an Atatürk tattoo as a sign of rebellion against their dictatorship [...]" (Pinar, 31)

"[...] Atatürk is a sign of rebellion and modesty for me. I am proud to carry his signature on me because he was an educated, foreseeing leader. He challenged Islamic people and changed the destiny of the Turkish people. We can do the same thing again. We can break the light bulbs<sup>1</sup> [...]" (Hasan, 25)

"[...] Atatürk gave us this beautiful country as a gift. I believe as a Turkish young person I should also fight to protect this country. Therefore, Atatürk means to fight for the sake of my homeland for me. I believe I can express my thoughts with my tattoo [...]" (Ercan, 28)

The explanations above indicate that interviewees consider Atatürk as a valid sign to express their reactions against the government. Atatürk was also evaluated as evidence of the strength of Kemalism and of a certain life style.

## VISIBILITY OF TATTOOS

Individuals who have concealable tattoos have the strength to decide who gets to see their tattoos. Namely, when someone has a concealable tattoo that person has the ability to control and empower her/his body and also control the audience. However, it is not possible to say the same thing for the people who have a visible tattoo (Doss and Ebesu 2009). Having a visible or concealable tattoo has an important effect on the experience of having a tattoo. Tattoo bearers may face negative or positive responses with respect to the visibility of their tattoos (Kosut 2000).

---

<sup>1</sup> Light Bulb is the symbol of Justice and Development Party.

Generally, the majority of interviewees are comfortable about revealing their Atatürk tattoos to other individuals. They even prefer to get their tattoos on a visible spot on their bodies. Mostly, they prefer to get tattoos on their arms or biceps. Some interviewees try to show that they support Atatürk's principles and reforms with all their heart and that they prefer to get their tattoos on a visible spot on their bodies:

"[...] Since the visibility is important, I believe arms are the most appropriate places for an Atatürk tattoo. Also, I never feel the need to cover my tattoos [...]." (Murat, 32)

"[...] I prefer my arm because it will be easy to show it. I always wanted to have my tattoo over my heart but no one will see it if I have it there. That's why I decided to get it on my arm. I believe my tattoo clearly expresses what I want to say and gives my message [...]." (İsmail, 28)

"[...] My first inclination was to get it on the outer part of my right palm. Metaphorically, when I hit something with my fist it will be perceived as a seal. But the tattoo artist said he could not make it the way I wanted so I got the tattoo on the outer side of my wrist. So I believe when I hold my hand out it can be easily seen [...]." (Sevginar, 42)

Having a tattoo can also cause doubt, it could be perceived by some as a possible discredit to the bearer. Hence, tattooed people may want to manage who gets to see their tattoos. The majority of the interviewees though are not worried whether they will face any problem or trouble with regards to their tattoos. However, in a business environment, as some of the interviewees noted, they felt that they had to conceal their tattoos. Although, none of the participants mentioned directly why they felt that way, it is believed that the choice to expose or hide their Atatürk tattoo is dependent upon their environment and its anticipated reaction. Predicting how a business environment may react allowed for these interviewees to control the interaction process as much as possible.

Identity is tied to appearance and it is directly affected by interactions with others. When people first meet or contact one another, they may not fully perceive each other. They need to believe in internal or inherent evidence during the communication or interaction process to make meaning of their identity in relation to others (Glaser and Strauss 1967). The idea is, each interacting individual tries to understand or become aware of the identity of another and her/his own identity in the eyes of the other. Can is one of the interviewees of the project and his answer defines the relationship between a tattoo, its perception, and the interaction process very well:

"[...] when minibus drivers see each other, they honk their horns at each other. To have an Atatürk tattoo is something like that. When I see someone, who has an Atatürk tattoo, I realize that he is someone like me. People can know you or have an idea about you thanks to your signs and a tattoo is a good sign to express yourself. Hence, some people prefer to have it just to be perceived as modern or some people prefer to have an Atatürk tattoo just because it is a fad. Society takes what you give to them [...]" (Can, 28)

"[...] I believe to have an Atatürk tattoo is a kind of secret sign. When I see someone with an Atatürk tattoo, I know that we are on the same side and we can trust each other [...]" (Pinar, 31)

Awareness is very obvious in a relationship between two individuals in which certain aspects of one's identity can be manipulated based on interactional cues. When individuals first come into contact with one another, one or both of the persons who have an Atatürk tattoo may not be readily apparent or the tattoo could be concealed under clothes. Through changing their appearance, i.e. hiding their tattoos, people may also be altering their interaction with others. People spend a lot of time interpreting their own behaviour and those of others in an attempt to make sense of the situation in which they find themselves so that they can act accordingly (Hewitt 1997). As a result, since people lack the ability to know how others truly feel about their Atatürk tattoos, they need to obtain hints during the interaction experience to decide what appropriate action to take.

In light of these explanations and quotations, it is understood that the interviewees deem an Atatürk tattoo as a sign between people who have common sense and perspective. Generally, most of the interviewees consider their Atatürk tattoo to give a political message.

In societies, individuals have various roles, and according to these roles people are shaped by the responsibilities and beliefs these roles imply and as a result they revise their sense of self. Thus, these people do not have a united "personal self," but rather a variety of identities, which they utilize and alter according to the situation in which they find themselves (Tajfel and Turner 1986). Actually, the term "generalized other" used by Mead (1934) is the reference point of this explanation by which we make behavioural decisions and interpret others' actions. Symbolic interactionism emphasizes that identities have explanatory, authoritarian, and evaluative significance and are constructed by subjective belief designs. People feel under pressure to implement these categorizations for the benefit of improving common bonds and motivating self-enhancement.

The term “social scaffold” coined by Goffman (1959) emphasizes the significance of context when defining and evaluating social interaction. The term “scaffold” signifies both the delicacy and fluctuation of the metaphorical structure. Actions that fall outside of the social scaffold can break the balance. However, if those actions come to be embraced by a broad number of people, they have the potential to alter its main construction. When we evaluate this explanation with respect to the research question of this study, the social scaffold of Turkish society has traditionally banned permanent tattooing, but the adoption of this practice by those who harbour the greatest power over its structure is gradually changing this perception. The popularity of the Atatürk tattoo in recent years displays that those who have Atatürk tattoos, especially visible ones, are gradually changing society’s restrictions against them, and by doing so are using social leverage to reconstruct the scaffold in a way that ensures a more favourable perception of Atatürk tattooed persons.

## CONCLUSION

The practice of tattooing as well as the views associated with those who get tattoos has significantly changed over time in Turkish society. Whereas tattooing was associated with individuals from the lower class of society and often rejected because of religion, now there is not a definite pattern or type of person who gets tattooed as it varies by the demographic categories of age, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion and economic status (Kosut 2000; Atkinson and Young 2001).

This research provides support to the present tattoo literature and limited Turkish tattoo literature in that it emphasizes and supports many findings that have previously been discussed in relation to tattooing. Through focusing on the relationship between interaction and one’s Atatürk tattoo, this research encompasses the tattooed people’s relation to other people’s expectations, input, and the interaction process with others.

This study tries to examine and explain the role of Atatürk tattoos in three different ways. The meaning of Atatürk for the Atatürk tattoo bearers and why interviewees consider Atatürk as a communication tool were discussed in this study. Further, the issues of how their environment evaluated the interviewees’ tattoos and how they decided on where to get their tattoos were explored. These questions were examined based on symbolic interactionism.

Although views toward tattooing have become much more acceptable over the years, there are still some arguments that tattoo bearers still possess a probable discrediting characteristic (Sanders 1988). Therefore, the tattoo experience, in the study of Atatürk tattoos, has an important impact on the interaction process with others and has significant potential for changing social interaction (Sanders 1988). The research findings of the study also indicate that the design and place of the Atatürk tattoo on the interviewees' body match the tattoo bearer's self-expression. Interviewees chose the image that they did because the preferred tattoo reflected their personal and social values and identities.

The findings of this study are parallel to Sanders' research on tattooed individuals. Sanders' research on tattooing showed that individuals become involved in tattooing because others close to them have tattoos which impacted their decision to get one (Sanders 1988). The majority of interviewees were influenced about getting an Atatürk tattoo until it was brought to their attention by people close to them, or by the societies they are part of. Even though interviewees have stated that they do not care about other people's opinions, they especially have a tendency to conceal their tattoo in their business life and this practice indicates that the Atatürk tattoo bearer may be considered to possess a potentially discrediting or stigmatizing attribute. The visibility of their tattoos, and avoiding individuals and situations which would bring any negative feedback are verification of this statement. This research also emphasizes the fact that interaction is an essential and important component of an individual's self-expression, namely an Atatürk tattooed expression. As aforementioned, a tattooed identity (Atatürk tattoo identity) alters and changes over time, and it is managed through interaction with other people. Through having a stake into the consideration of other people's reactions, actually tattoo bearers have a tendency to control the interaction process and frame it positively. The research results indicate that identity and altering the visibility of a tattoo have an important engagement.

As a final word, it should be noted that the number of people with Atatürk tattoos is increasing every day. This requires the study of what people are trying to say or why they deem an Atatürk tattoo to be a communication tool, and how the interaction process is managed between people with an Atatürk tattoo and the other people in the community. This study has just begun to shed some light on the topic and further research needs to be done in the area.

## REFERENCES

- Armstrong, M. L. (1991). "Career Oriented Women with Tattoos." *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*. 2 (4), 215–220.
- Atkinson, M. and Young, K. (2001). "Flesh Journeys: Neo Primitives and the Rediscovery of Radical Body Modification." *Deviant Behavior: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 22 (5), 117–146.
- Bell, S. (1999). "Tattooed: A Participant Observer's Exploration of Meaning." *Journal of American Culture* 22 (2), 53–58.
- Benson, S. (2000). "Inscriptions of the Self: Reflections on Tattooing and Piercing in Contemporary Euro-America." In: Caplan J. (ed.) *Written on the Body: The Tattoo in European and American History*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 251–354.
- Benthall, J. and Polhemus, T. (1975). *The Body as a Medium of Expression*. New York: Penguin.
- Blumer, H. (1969). *Symbolic Interactionism: Perspective and Method*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Brain, R. (1979). *The Decorated Body*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers, Inc.
- Burke, P. J. and Stets, J. E. (1999). "Trust and Commitment through Self-verification." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 62 (4), 347–366.
- Calefato, P. (2004). *The Clothed Body*. New York: Berg.
- Charon, J. M. (1992). *Symbolic Interactionism: An Introduction, An Interpretation, An Integration*. 10<sup>th</sup> ed. Upper Saddle Ridge: Prentice Hall.
- Cronin, A. (2001). "Tattoos, Piercings, and Skin Adornments." *Journal of Dermatology Nursing* 15, 380–383.
- Davis, F. (1982). "On the 'Symbolic' in Symbolic Interaction." *Journal of Symbolic Interaction* 5 (1), 111–126.
- Demello, M. (2000). *Bodies of Inscription: A Cultural History of the Modern Tattoo*. Duke University Press.
- Doss, K., Amy, S. and Ebesu, H. (2009). "The Communicative Value of Tattoos: The Role of Public Self-Consciousness on Tattoo Visibility." *Communication Research Reports* 26 (1), 62–74.
- Erim, B. (2011). *Making the Secular through the Body: Tattooing the Father Turk*. Master dissertation, Middle East Technical University.
- Gay, K. and Whittington, C. (2002). *Body Marks: Tattooing, Piercing, and Scarification*. Brookfield: Twenty First Century Books.
- Gergen, K. (2007). "The Dissolution of the Self." In: Cahill, S. C. (ed.) *Inside Social Life*. Los Angeles: Roxbury Publishing, 411–418.
- Gilbert, S. (2000). *Tattoo History: A Source Book*. USA: Juno Books, LLC.

- Glaser, B. G. and Strauss, A. (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory*. Chicago: Aldine.
- Goffman, E. (1959). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Doubleday Anchor.
- Govenar, A. (2000). "The Changing Image of Tattooing in American Culture, 1846–1966." In: Caplan, J. (ed.) *Written on the Body: The Tattoo in European and American History*, UK: Reaction Books Ltd., 212–233.
- Göle, N. (1997). "Secularizm and Islamizm in Turkey: The Making of Elites and Counter Elites." *Middle East Journal* 5 (1), 46–58.
- Gubrium, J. F. and Holstien, J. (2003). *Postmodern Interviewing*. London: Sage Publication.
- Hancock, J. (2005). "Tattooed: The Socio-genesis of a Body Art." *The Journal of Popular Culture* 38 (5), 971–972.
- Hewitt, K. (1997). *Mutilating the Body: Identity in Blood and Ink*. University of Wisconsin Press.
- Irwin, K. (2001). "Legitimizing the First Tattoo: Moral Passage through Informal Interaction." *Journal of Symbolic Interaction* 24 (1), 49–73.
- Koch, J. R, Roberts, C., Alden E., Harms, J., Armstrong, M. L. and Owen, C. D. (2005). "College Students, Tattooing, and the Health Belief Model: Extending Social Psychological Perspectives on Youth Culture and Deviance." *Sociological Spectrum* 25 (5), 79–102.
- Kosut, M. (2000). "Tattoo Narratives: The Intersection of the Body, Self-identity and Society." *Visual Sociology* 15 (1), 79–100.
- Mead, G. H. (1934). *Mind, Self, and Society*. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Navaro-Yashin, Y. (2002). *Faces of the State: Secularism and Public Life in Turkey*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Özyürek, E. (2004). "Miniaturizing Atatürk: Privatization of State Imagery and Ideology in Turkey." *American Ethnologist* 31(3), 374–391.
- Pascale, C.M. (2011). *Cartographies of Knowledge – Exploring Qualitative Epistemologies*. Washington DC: SAGE Publications.
- Poloma, M. M. (1993). *Çağdaş Sosyoloji Kuramları*. İstanbul: Gündoğan Yayınları.
- Sanders, C. R. (1985). "Tattoo Consumption: Risk and Regret in the Purchase of a Socially Marginal Service." *Advances in Consumer Research* 12 (1), 17–22.
- Sanders, C. R. (1988). "Marks of Mischief: Becoming and Being Tattooed." *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 16 (4), 395–432.

- Scheinfeld, N. (2007). "Tattoos and Religion." *Clinics in Dermatology* 25 (4), 362–366.
- Schildkrout, E. (2004). "Inscribing the Body." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 33 (3), 319–344.
- Schilling, C. (2002). *The Body and Social Theory*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Serdaroğlu, F. (2013). *Dövme Kitabı*. İstanbul: Hemen Kitap.
- Simmel, G. (1950). *The Sociology of Georg Simmel*. New York: The Free Press.
- Stevens, J. (1992). "Tattooed Buddha: Though Often Associated with Criminals and Sailors, Tattoos have been Proudly Worn over the Centuries by Hindus, Buddhists, Muslims and Christians to Symbolize their Allegiance to the divine." *Yoga Journal* 103, 66–69.
- Stryker, S. and Serpe, R. T. (1994). "Identity Saliency and Psychological Centrality: Equivalent, Overlapping, or Complimentary Concepts?" *Social Psychology Quarterly* 57 (1), 16–35.
- Synnott, A. (1993). *The Body Social: Symbolism, Self and Society*. New York: Routledge.
- Tajfel, H. and Turner, J. C. (1986). "The Social Identity Theory of Inter-Group Behavior." In: Worchel, S. and Austin, L.W. (ed.) *Psychology of Intergroup Relations*, Chicago: Nelson-Hall, 18.
- Tanil, B. (2003). "Nationalist Discourses in Turkey." *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 102 (3), 433–451.
- Turkoz, M. (2014). "Fathering the Nation from Mustafa Kemal to Atatürk." *Traditions* 43 (1), 53–64.
- Turner, B. (1984). *The Body and Social Theory*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Tye, B. B. and Tye K. A (1992). *Global Education: A Study of School Change*. New York: SUNY Press.
- Vannini, P. (2004). "Toward an Interpretive Analytics of the Sign: Interactionism, Power and Semiosis." *Studies in Symbolic Interaction* 27 (3), 151–176.
- Waskul, D. and Vannini, P. (2006). *Body/Embodiment Symbolic Interaction and the Sociology of the Body*. London: Ashgate Publishing.
- Yegenoglu, M. (2007). "The Sacralization of Secularism in Turkey." *Radical Philosophy* 9 (145), 2–5.
- Zillman, D. (1991). "Empathy: Affect from Bearing Witness to the Emotions of Others." In: Bryant, J. and Zillman, D. (ed.). *Responding to the Screen: Reception and Reaction Processes*. Hillsdale NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, 135–167.



# DISCOURSES OF “HEALTHY” AND “UNHEALTHY” NUTRITION CONSTRUCTED BY PUPILS AND ADULTS

**ANTRA MIEZE**

Antra Mieze, Mg. sc. soc.  
PhD candidate in sociology,  
Faculty of Social sciences  
University of Latvia, Latvia  
e-mail: [antra.mieze@gmail.com](mailto:antra.mieze@gmail.com)

Antra Mieze is a PhD candidate in sociology (University of Latvia), she holds a Master's degree in sociology (University of Latvia, 2012), and a Bachelor's degree in philology (University of Latvia, 1999). Her academic interests include food, nutrition and consumer sociology, education and youth studies, also discourse theories, praxis, analytics. Along with sociological research, she has been working as a publisher and has been the author and editor of scientific, non-fiction and fiction books and articles.

## ABSTRACT

The article explores pupils' eating habits in Latvia through the research prism of the pupil as a nutrition agent. In the analysis, the emphasis is placed on the interpretation of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition meanings developed by pupils and adults. The aim of the study was to find out the conditions of the formation of food meanings in the school environment of Latvia, as well as to understand and evaluate the impact of these various food discourses on pupils' daily dietary habits.

Data from multiple case studies were analysed using a critical discourse analysis approach.

The study concludes that the concepts of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition in the interpretation of both pupils and adults are characterised by polysemous nature and constant transformation and change of meanings, depending on the situation and social context.

While defining these concepts, pupils use mostly pre-constructed interpretations of discourse on dietary practices borrowed from adults, but at the same time they place these borrowed meanings in the re-contextualisation of their dietary practices. This, in turn, determines and affects the dietary practice of pupils in both school and outside school environments, and also describes the pupil as a nutrition agent.

**Keywords:** pupil as a nutrition agent, school nutrition programme, eating habits, critical discourse analysis, re-contextualisation's praxis

## INTRODUCTION

So far, the interest of sociologists in the study of the study of dietary habits has been focused on the factors influenced by food consumption and the risks they pose for the quality of children's lives. Similarly, nutrition and the food environment of pupils in today's academic studies have been predominantly seen in the context of "healthy" and "unhealthy" diets, but only in some cases providing a detailed definition of "healthy" and "unhealthy" food. It is not possible to fully and reasonably explore the individual's eating habits and the factors that influence them without the conceptual conceptualization of these concepts, especially considering that the public as a whole tends to interpret food regulations very differently (Jertle et al. 1997; Robert et al. 2001).

In addition, the opinions about the "healthy" and "unhealthy" diet and its impact on human health in the public space are mainly expressed by adults, which also mark the presence of power and critical discourse on food and nutrition issues. Unfortunately, children's voices in organizing their food practices in the school environment in Latvia are still quiet, marginalized or fragmented, as they are manifested only in individual healthy eating initiatives organized by adults (The Actions Days of ECO-schools, organized by Environmental Fund of Latvia in 2013).

However, it is important to understand what role pupils themselves give to food, how they interpret the concept of "healthy diet" and whether they oppose it to the "unhealthy diet", and how the understanding of the role of food is reflected in their daily dietary practices. In addition, does the knowledge of this diet help them plan their daily nutrition? The answers to these questions would describe the role of the nutritional policy in Latvia and nutritional education and reveal the pupils' ability to exercise their nutrition practices on a daily basis. From the discourse of power, looking at pupils' dietary habits, it is important to understand the role of adults and the environment in which the pupil is a consumer of food.

School-age children (11–15-year or 6–9-year-old) were selected as target groups in this qualitative approach study because problems with excess body weight and obesity in adolescents continue to increase in Latvia – especially at the age of 11–13 (Pudule et al. 2015). Poor nutrition and sedentary lifestyles are mentioned as the main cause of this problem. It has been concluded that students

with obesity or signs of excess weight are a risk group not only for medical conditions, but also for psychological and behavioural problems – social stigmatization, depression, eating disorders, and other negative manifestations of quality of life (Birch et al. 2007).

It is also important that a child spends most of his/her life as a pupil at a school where s/he may be affected by peer and other pupils' perceptions of dietary habits (Salvy et al. 2012). The pupils' dietary habits are also most directly influenced by the knowledge of healthy lifestyles of adults (in the family – parents, school – teachers, etc.) and their daily food consumption habits (Davison and Birch 2002; Joffe et al. 2009), which, as the statistics show, are sooner unhealthy than healthy in Latvia (Pudule et al. 2011). The problem of malnutrition and food poverty also seriously raises the issue of food security (Tisenkopfs and Griviņš 2018). The issue of food safety is closely related to the impact of technological advances and the harmful effects of substances harmful to health on the quality of human life in industrial products. In order to avoid harmful substances in food, the consumer should have knowledge of it and be able to make alternative food choices. In addition, public opinion in Latvia is that “healthy eating” should also be taught in schools (DNB barometer 2014), not just in families with parents. For several years, schools in Latvia have been involved in various international healthy lifestyle promotion programmes, which also include pupils' educational activities, such as Eco-schools, School Milk and School Fruit and Vegetable programmes, but no extensive or in-depth research has been conducted to find out how these programmes affect pupils' understanding of “healthy” or “unhealthy” diets.

Usually, the concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” diet are mainly used as opposing various dietary practices implemented by people. In this article, the term “nutrition” is deliberately explored instead of “food”, because the term “food” includes a much narrower explanation of the meaning of “health” and “un-healthiness” for certain foods. While the concept of “nutrition” is much wider in interpretation and based on the individual's chosen dietary practices and models (including other aspects of the individual's lifestyle, such as physical activity), it also allows for the naming of certain foods in defining one's dietary habits.

In total, 44 students were observed in this study (pupils of grades 5<sup>th</sup> to 9<sup>th</sup>), and 35 adults (teachers, school directors, children's parents, cooks, nutritionists, municipal representatives, etc.). 217 qualitative questionnaires were filled out by students at the request of the author of this research.

In general, the study of pupils' dietary habits was a complex and interdisciplinary process, and it also indicates the need for longitudinal research in the future. This article has been based on the promotion work "Pupil as a Nutrition Agent" by the author of this paper.

## DEFINITION AND THEORETICAL CONCEPTUALIZATION OF THE PUPIL AS A NUTRITION AGENT

To analyse the pupil's eating habits, which are considered as the social practice of the individual, it is necessary to determine the role of this social agent in the structure of society. Any social action in its main manifestations includes the process of constructing personality and identity, and also reflects the various roles that an individual occupies in a social group or system, creating or spreading not only cultural values, but also traditions, habits and practices, including the importance of food and eating praxis. Thus, the pupil's knowledge of nutrition is his/her cultural capital, but the eating habits reflect the role assigned to self or to others (both peers and adults).

Social life is a dynamic process because society does not exist as a static unit, it is constantly being created and recreated when people interact with each other (Stryker 2006). In addition, the process of eating is associated with social interaction, the creation of symbolic values, the assignment of meanings and the distribution of roles in the social context of nutrition. For example, people can attribute both the positive and negative values to a specific food or eating practice, because food that interacts with the human body has a certain symbolic meaning assigned to it by a person. The eating habits of a person influence the roles assigned to a person and the expectations of people from them. For example, pupil's nutritional restrictions in the school environment, especially nowadays, when the importance of interpreting the topicality of health and quality of life in the context of food consumption becomes more and more important, also affect the nutritional practices of pupils.

To more deeply understand the process of forming different social roles (not only the role of the individual, but also social interactions), symbolic interactionist theories (Charon 2001; Blumer 1969; Burr 2006) focusing on how people create, interpret and perceive the values and symbols of various social phenomena in the environment will be analysed, thus, also, how it is formed, assigned and transferred to food, nutrition and eating practices.

The symbolic interactionism looks at the human being as an action organism, which means that “a person can be the object of his own action” (Blumer 1969, 12).

The fundamental condition for symbolic interactionism is that it explores society from the point of view of an individual’s actions, and cultural prescriptions – traditions, values, norms, and social structure – social status, roles that derive from the individual’s own actions. The actions result from interactions between various members of society (Blumer 1969). Referring to the concept of Mead, people communicate with each other through symbols, they are symbolically interacting with meanings, which, in turn, include the languages in use.

Language is the main tool of human communication, not only in terms of symbolic interactionism, but also in structuralism (Elliott 2013), which emphasizes that the role and effectiveness of an individual depends on his social status or position in society. Thus, in this theoretical approach, social status determines what social roles an individual should assume. In addition, based on the social status of a person, society also understands the roles that can be expected from a specific social status (Kockelman 2007). Thereby, if we theoretically assign the role of a (active) nutrition agent to a pupil, it follows from this that the social status of the pupil implies that s/he must follow the behavioural rules introduced in the school in the context of the action and should accumulate the knowledge gained by the teacher at the level of learning. Accordingly, the role of the pupil as a nutrition agent can manifest itself as an action of an agent for obedience and reception of nutritional knowledge and norms.

But how is it actually in life?

The above mentioned sociological theories have a significant drawback – they do not emphasize the existing link between the objective reality and the subjective reality constructed by the individual, that is, they do not allow individuals, while being affected by the same social structure, to explain the same social phenomena or aspects in the completely different way. For example, pupils of one class (age), while living in the same environment on a daily basis, can differently define nutritional standards.

This gap deficiency is overcome by the theoretical approach of social constructionism, which emphasizes the idea that knowledge is socially constructed and influenced not only by the institutional context and interaction between individuals, but also by the context of culture and history, because the individual’s knowledge is determined by history and culture. Vivien Burr points out that the individual’s knowledge also depends on the views of a particular group

(Burr 2006). Hence individuals' perceptions of the world are determined by categories (such as gender, the social status of a pupil or teacher, a dietary doctor or a nutritionist in the teaching profession, etc.), which also form a different field of social reality.

Also, in the socio-psychological dimension, conflicting views on the factors that influence the development of pupils' eating habits are expressed by external theorists vs. developmental researchers (for example, Benn and Carlsson 2014; Salvy et al. 2012). Conceptually, in these theoretical approaches, social responsibility for a child's eating habits is shifted, in one case, from the family to the environment, in the other case, from the environment to the family, thus making the study of the pupil's eating habits more complex and conflicting. However, in the perspective of social constructivism, interlocking not only the presence of internal and external influences in the formation of the concept of role, but also an essential element in the construction of language as knowledge, because it is the language that constructs the social reality. The language is considered to be the central and key element that creates categories and meanings, it is a means of explaining our (community's) activities (Cromby and Nightingale 1999). Therefore pupils' eating habits are also designed through the prism of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition interpretations.

In contrast, the theoretical approach developed by the critical discourse analyst Theo van Leeuwen helps to see how social practices are transformed or modified with different discourses. Leeuwen emphasizes that it is essential to see the difference between social practice and the representation of this social practice, as different discourses are the result of the re-contextualisation of social practice (Leeuwen 2008, 2009). Although this text can be used for analysis, it does not offer enough evidence to reconstruct the discourse. "Healthy nutrition", for example, in the modern social environment is used in different text types – it can be the regulations developed by the Ministry of Health for pupils' diets, a cookbook with "healthy" recipes, and a publication on a new diet, etc. In other words, the discourse "healthy nutrition" (and, conversely, "unhealthy") includes not only "the subject of the study", but also "the definition of the legitimate perspective of the knowledge agent" in the particular context (Foucault 1977, 135). Thus, discourse not only depicts what is happening, but also evaluates it by offering a goal, justifying, and so on.

Again, all in all – in the theoretical approach of social constructivism, the roles of the individual (in this case, the pupil as a nutrition agent) are formed in social reality – influencing both external structural

(normative, laws) and institutional (belonging to school, family) restrictions, as well as the individual knowledge of the person, and concepts (cultural-historical context). On the other hand, these roles are constructed in the language of the individual because it is the language of the individual (pupil as a nutrition agent) or the group of society (for example, teachers) that forms the roles of their own and other (nutrition agents).

## CHARACTERISTICS OF NUTRITION POLICY IN SCHOOLS IN LATVIA

To highlight the environment in which a healthy and “unhealthy” nutrition discourse for a pupil is developing and spreading in Latvia today at a national and institutional level, the school nutrition policy will be briefly described below: the school nutrition policy determines and influences not only the adult (as a pupils’ feeder) in Latvia, but also pupils (as recipients of food, in some cases – non-recipients of food) about what “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition is.

The current normative documents regulating the nutrition of schools in Latvia reflect and describe the situation in Latvia and how the nutrition policy in educational institutions is developed. At present, catering for students in Latvia should be carried out in accordance with the Healthy Nutrition Standards developed by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Latvia, which entered into force on 13 March, 2012. The official title of this document is the Cabinet of Ministers Regulation No. 172 “Regulations on Nutrition Standards for Educators of Educational Institutions, for Clients of Social Care and Social Rehabilitation Institutions and for Patients of Medical Institutions.”

There have also been several editions of the law, but the public counter-reaction was most pronounced in January 2016, following the amendment to this law, which caused even so-called “Buns’ wars” in Latvian educational institutions. A very active public debate began after some journalists had tried to get into a café in a school in Riga by force, to show that illicit buns, banned under the new diet regulations, were being sold there. In general, the main purpose of these Regulations is to prevent pupils from eating certain “unhealthy products” (e.g. ketchup, deep fried or fried potatoes, sausages and frankfurters containing less than 70% meat and other products) and to limit the use of salt and various artificial flavours as well as the flavour enhancers, synthetic dyes or preservatives in the cooking

process in pupils' food (refer to law). Also, this law refers to the amount of nutrients that a pupil needs with food.

In turn, the manager of the particular educational institution is responsible for and in cooperation with parents and the food service provider decides on the catering organization and exactly what the pupils' menu will be. In addition, any company that has registered with the Food and Veterinary Service and operates in accordance with regulatory enactments and regulations may become a student caterer in Latvian schools.

Since 2004/2005, the Ministry of Agriculture has started implementing "The School Milk" programme in schools of Latvia and since 2010/2011 the programme "The School Fruit and Vegetable" financed by the European Commission has been introduced. The aim of both programmes is to provide pupils with fresh fruits, vegetables and milk free of charge in order to increase their dietary intake and change their eating habits, as well as to increase pupils' knowledge of "healthy eating" and of the importance of fresh fruits, vegetables and dairy products.

Currently, various non-governmental organizations (adults as institutional pupils' nutritional agents) are active in Latvia as important and financially supported school nutrition policy makers in the Ministry of Health setting different goals in the context of pupils' nutrition.

## "HEALTHY" VS. "UNHEALTHY" NUTRITION AND ITS RECONSTRUCTION

In exploring the practice of defining "healthy" and "unhealthy" diets in different social contexts and on the basis of the theoretical assumption of pupils' practices as adult-dependent individuals, emphasis should be placed on comparing practices of adults vs. pupils' definitions of these concepts.

The results of the study show that the interpretation of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition can vary widely between adults and pupils.

First of all, let's look at the meanings constructed by adults. For nutritionists and doctors, these definitions were mainly based on their professional activities on institutional goals. The teachers, in the definition of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition created by them, use discourse construction strategies different from those of nutritionists. These are: 1) by intertextualising "healthy" nutrition – quoted by memory or indirectly referring to what a nutritionist says, or 2) by generating "healthy" and "unhealthy" diets – pointing out

the broad definition possibilities, or 3) by specifying and naming specific foods or groups of products within the meaning of the concept of “healthy” or “unhealthy” nutrition, and 4) by personifying – with particular emphasis on own individual dietary practices and adapting the definitions of both mentioned concepts.

However, despite the differences in the definition of “healthy” vs. “unhealthy” nutrition strategies used by different adults, in their interviews teachers particularly emphasize the fact that the terms “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition are too simplistic terms to include the complex nature of today’s food environment. Therefore, in their interviews teachers underline the fact that the concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition are interpreted as the appropriate definitions for the junior pupils, whereas the pupils of senior grades (7<sup>th</sup> to 9<sup>th</sup>) should already be told about the “balanced” and more extensive dietary habits, and the social importance of food should be explained to them as well. It is also important to note that, at defining dietary habits in their health categories, adult respondents use different terms, not only “healthy diet”, but also “balanced diets”, “adequate nutrition”, “moderate nutrition”, thus focusing not only on the “health” of certain foods, but also on the assessment of eating habits in general. Those adults, who define the “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition as a generic description, instead of the term “healthy” often use a different name, e.g. “balanced”, “different”, “regular”, “correct”, “full-fledged”, and “ecological”. However, the “unhealthy” nutrition is always reflected only in this one concept – “unhealthy”.

Also, the interpretations of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition provided by pupils include both extensive and generalized explanations of “healthy” and “unhealthy” meanings, supplemented by mentioning the names of specific products. At using this approach in defining nutrition, pupils often mention not only specific groups of foods and/or products, but also meals such as porridge, soups, etc., and describe the intensity of their use or non-use. Within the definition of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition pupils often include the behaviour associated with the eating process, thus indicating the social practice of defining nutrition as a description of action; often linking the definition of “healthy” nutrition to physical activity, and usually sporting.

A very common strategy for defining “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition used by pupils is to employ the description of the same actions or words (the same semiotics) – in opposite meanings, that is, through the opposite approach, thus demonstrating that the definition is lacking in-depth knowledge of the issue, e.g.: “Healthy nutrition – when not eating too much, and unhealthy nutrition –

when eating too little or too much" (7<sup>th</sup> grade student (girl), interviewed on 23 May 2015, Tukums, Latvia). This lack of nutritional knowledge for primary school children derives also from the situation that they can acquire this knowledge only during their studies in secondary school. It is therefore important to reassess the current educational programme for primary school children and encourage the inclusion of dietary training there.

The definition of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition can be influenced by a variety of external environmental factors, such as an on-site fast food restaurant. And if there are any bans or controls that prevent students from attending this out-of-school restaurant, the concepts of "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition may reflect the narrowing of the suppressed protest by reconstituting "unhealthy" as "healthy" and vice versa, e.g. "Healthy is Hesburger, but green salad is unhealthy" (7<sup>th</sup> grade student (boy), interviewed on 23 May 2015, Tukums, Latvia). Pupils sometimes do not tend to define what is "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition, but simply state what it is not. Practice shows that pupils' behaviour in relation to school nutrition (hence the understanding of what is "healthy nutrition") is very different and is often treated by adults as wrong or even punishable by nature, for example, in case a student uses a lunchtime to go to a nearby grocery store or a fast-food outlet instead of eating a meal in the school dining facility.

At the same time, shortening of lunch breaks in schools (due to various circumstances) by school administration in an arbitrary way is very critical. It promotes the wrong idea among schoolchildren that the emphasis is not on the concept of "healthy", but rather on the speed of eating. In such a way, the "healthy" dietary habits of students become "unhealthy".

In turn, the pupils' criticism of the school kitchen shows how the adult-defined discourse of a "healthy menu", whereby the "healthy" foods, such as fresh vegetables, potatoes or meat, previously named by the pupils themselves, are re-contextualised as "inedible" because of the way they are prepared (e.g. oiled, overcooked or undercooked). Thus, it shows that pupils can, by redefining food from a "healthy" to "unhealthy" product, redirect one and the same food, depending on the context based on his/her own food practice experience. In addition, when a pupil defines what "healthy" or "unhealthy" nutrition is, not only pupil's knowledge of the subject is demonstrated in this definition, but also his/her practical experience of cooking and preparing food is manifested. In this context, it is obvious in some cases that a pupil has not been given the opportunity of acquiring nutritional knowledge, as well as the elementary cooking skills.

In addition to the control mechanism established by teachers, pupils' dietary practices in the school environment are strongly influenced by school cuisine and the food offered there. Considering that Latvian schools feed their students according to specific regulations introduced by the Cabinet of Ministers (Cabinet Regulation No. 172), which adults have defined as oriented towards developing healthy and balanced dietary habits of pupils, then in many cases in order to define a "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition the pupil often uses the terms borrowed from the school kitchen menu classifying the food into "eatable" or 'uneatable', but without a deeper understanding of the motives for his/her choice in terms of health and quality of life.

Although pupils (regardless of age or geographical location of the school) construct the definitions of "healthy" vs. "unhealthy" nutrition, actively re-contextualising the nutritional knowledge of adults, nevertheless in some cases the opinions of pupils as individual and critical assessors also appear. This is not only reflected in the evaluation of the menu offered by the school, but also in the analysis of the national nutrition programmes retrospectively carried out by the pupils. For example, while an adult, creating a discourse on the School Fruit and Vegetable programme, emphasizes the need for local, seasonal, and ecological product purchases, meanwhile, as the primary criteria, pupils set the taste of the product, the way it is served, and the need to increase the variety of the product range, which includes the opposite directions – the need to use global and foreign market resources. For example, students encourage adults to offer "healthy bananas" instead of local apples. The pupils often do not eat the fruit and vegetables available in this programme (and defined by adults as "healthy") for various reasons: 1) because they are still sour and hard, or 2) not as juicy as those one buys in the shop, 3) do not taste good (not mentioning the reason why), 4) packed in plastic bags and are wet and unpleasant.

Similarly "healthy" and "unhealthy" nutrition is defined by the pupils in the School Milk programme. While adults (e.g. the Ministry of Agriculture) characterize the School Milk programme emphasizing that milk is a food that is a "fresh and healthy diet" and promotes a "healthy lifestyle", pupils often interpret this adult-defined meaning by re-contextualisation praxis. Some pupils define milk as "unhealthy" considering it as fatty, cold, etc.) and compare it to some other food products (e.g. buns, chips), which adults have labelled as "unhealthy" nutrition in the discourse of school nutrition programmes; whereas pupils call them "healthy" products: "It [milk] was tasty, but only if accompanied by buns!" (8<sup>th</sup> grade pupil (boy),

interviewed on 25 May 2015, Jaunpils, Latvia). Pupils often mention the alternative ways of using milk, such as milk as thirst quencher, as an alternative to “healthy” water, as a criterion for “health”.

The case studies, where the role of food in pupils’ cooking experience was investigated, led to the conclusion that a long-term positive impact on pupils’ eating habits can be achieved and promoted by nationally-based systematic activities (e.g. the campaign “Porridge days” for pupils of junior classes), but not by separate individually organized initiatives (as, for example, Cooking School organized by retail operator Rimi in 2012/1). Despite that due to the innovative approach to teaching new cooking habits, the latter arouse greater short-term interest (compared to e.g. “School Milk” or other national programmes), long-term effects on pupils’ dietary habits are observed) as a result of the national programmes rather than individual campaigns. In addition, by linking knowledge transfer with demonstrating cooking practically, pupils are encouraged to include specific groups of food in the interpretation of “healthy” nutrition rather than individual food products. The communicative interaction of such knowledge can also result in the re-contextualisation of the concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition.

In the approach of social constructionism, looking at the importance of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition in different social contexts and as a result of social interaction, various practices of re-contextualisation of these concepts have crystallized. However, it has to be concluded that all of these social contexts are specifically designed by adults as a pupil’s nutritional agents (including the fact that pupils are interviewed by a researcher – an adult, thus encouraging the pupil to focus on the topic of nutrition), and in some specific way they try to strengthen the concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition in consciousness of pupils.

Thereby it is confirmed in another way, that macro-cognition structures are transformed when they are used in microstructures: binary opposing knowledge overlaps, reflecting the intertextual relationship of opposition discourses (Griviņš and Tisenkopfs 2015). Consequently, the discursive practices of defining concepts such as “healthy” or “unhealthy” nutrition by pupils as nutrition agents reflect not only the pupils’ dietary practices and knowledge of “healthy” or “unhealthy” nutrition, but also provide information as a result of the social interaction of various nutritional agents, re-contextualising (newly created) nutritional knowledge and practices. In addition, the newly developed dietary knowledge and practices are in constant, intermittent interaction – both on the level of individual self-identity, so also in social relations, and in the wider collective interaction. In

this way, examples of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition in the school environment not only reflect the pupils’ nutritional knowledge and dynamics of practice, but also allow identifying the intensity of the environmental impact and the way in which the development of nutritional knowledge and practice occurs.

## CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The interest of sociologists in researching pupils’ dietary habits is mainly focused on the factors affecting the consumption of food and the risks they cause to the quality of life of the children and the future of society. In addition, pupils’ diets and the food environment in today’s academic studies are predominantly viewed as the issue of “healthy” and “unhealthy” diet.

If the main subject of the research is a pupil, it is advisable to include the influence of the social structure in the process of studying the current problem, because the pupil performs his social functions as a representative of the institution – the school. However, in the perspective of symbolic interactionism, an individual (or social agent) is not defined as a passive recipient of norms and roles created by society, but as an active constructor of meanings, who interacts to form a common understanding and knowledge. In turn, one of the most important acknowledgments of the theory of structuralism is to propose the language as the main object of research, and the social agent – the human being – who manages this language and moves (transforms) meanings through the use of language and creates a social reality that already consists from a variety of interpretations.

For a contemporary Latvian pupil as a social agent in the context of food consumption, on the one hand, there is a lack of autonomy of action and the need to integrate into the institutional control system (both family and school) and, on the other hand, to offer new opportunities to take social responsibility not only about a pupil’s dietary choices, but also about educating the surrounding community on nutrition issues.

The concepts of “healthy” and “unhealthy” nutrition in the interpretation of both pupils and adults are characterized by polysemous nature and constant re-contextualisation and change of meanings, depending on the situation and social context. Pupils define “healthy” vs. “unhealthy” diets, either specific foods or product groups, or they describe eating habits, processes and activities related to a healthy lifestyle.

While defining these concepts, pupils use mostly adults' pre-constructed interpretations of discourse on dietary practices, but at the same time, they place the meanings borrowed from other people into the re-contextualization of their dietary practices thereby using them as a means for legitimizing "healthiness" or "un-healthiness" of food.

Thinking about interventions that promote pupils' healthier eating habits, it is necessary to introduce innovative approaches to school nutrition policy. One of these innovative approaches (not only on a local level) would be obtaining of new nutrition knowledge for the pupil to be socially active and participate in cooking or preparing the school's lunch menu. Therefore, the main factors that determined the choice of the subject of this study and its relevance still remain valid. They are the inadequate nutrition knowledge of the contemporary Latvian pupil, as well as the lack of ability to behave in the school environment as a nutritional agent and manage own eating habits – which is also confirmed by the results of the study.

## REFERENCES

- Benn, J. and Carlsson, M. (2014). "Learning through School Meals?" *Appetite* 78, 23–31.
- Birch, L., Savage, J. S. and Ventura, A. (2007). "Influence on the Development of Children's Eating Behaviours: From Infancy to Adolescence." *Canadian Journal of Dietetic Practice and Research* 68 (1), 1–56.
- Blumer, H. (1969). *Symbolic Interactionism*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Burr, V. (2006). *An Introduction to Social Constructionism*. London: Routledge.
- Charon, J. M. (2001). *Symbolic Interactionism: An Introduction, an Interpretation, an Integration*. 7<sup>th</sup> ed. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Pearson Prentice-Hall.
- Cromby, J. and Nightingale, D. (1999). "What's Wrong with Social Constructionism?" In: Cromby, J. and Nightingale, D. (eds.) *Social Constructionist Psychology: a Critical Analysis of Theory and Practice*. Buckingham: Open University Press. Available at: <<https://www.mcgrawhill.co.uk/openup/chapters/033520192X.pdf>> (accessed April 2019).

- Davison, K. K. and Birch, L. L. (2002). Obesigenic Families: Parents' Physical Activity and Dietary Intake Patterns Predict Girls' Risk of Overweight. *International Journal of Eating Disorders* 26, 1186–1193.
- Elliott, A. (2013). "Self, Society and Everyday Life." In: *Concepts of the Self*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Cambridge, Malden: Polity Press, 22–45.
- Foucault, M. (1977). *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Grīviņš, M. and Tisenkopfs, T. (2015). A Discursive Analysis of Oppositional Interpretations of the Agro-food System: A Case Study of Latvia. *Journal of Rural Studies* 39, 111–121.
- Herman, C. P., Roth, D. A. and Polivy, J. (2003). "Effects of the Presence of Others on Food Intake: A Normative Interpretation." *Psychological Bulletin* 129, 873–886.
- Joffe, R., Ozoliņš, G., Šantare, D., Bartkevics, V., Mike, L. and Brikša, I. (2009). *Latvijas iedzīvotāju visaptverošais pārtikas patēriņa pētījums 2007.–2009.* Rīga: Nacionālais diagnostikas centrs, PVD Pārtikas centrs.
- Kockelman, P. (2007). "From Status to Contract Revisited: Value, Temporality, Circulation and Subjectivity." *Anthropological Theory* 7 (2), 151–160.
- Leeuwen, van T. (2008). *Discourse and Practice: New Tools for Critical Discourse Analysis*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Leeuwen, van T. (2009). "Discourse as the Recontextualization of Social Practice: A Guide." In: Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Thousand Oaks [Calif.]: Sage, 144–161.
- Lytle, L. A., Eldridge, A. L., Kotz, K., Piper, J., Williams, S., and Kalina, B. (1997). "Children's Interpretation of Nutrition Messages." *Journal of Nutrition Education* 29, 128–136.
- MK noteikumi Nr. 172 "Noteikumi par uztura normām izglītības iestāžu izglītojamiem, sociālās aprūpes un sociālās rehabilitācijas institūciju klientiem un ārstniecības iestāžu pacientiem." Available at: <[www.likumi.lv/doc.php?id=245300](http://www.likumi.lv/doc.php?id=245300)> (accessed April 2019).
- Pudule, I., Villeruša, A., Grinberga, D., Velika, B., Taube, M., Behmane, D., Dzērve, V. and Prättälä, R. (2011). *Latvijas iedzīvotāju veselību ietekmējošo paradumu pētījums*. Rīga: Veselības ekonomikas centrs.
- Roberts, S. J., Maxwell, S. M., Bagnall, G., & Bilton, R. (2001). "The Incidence of Dieting amongst Adolescent Girls: A Question of Interpretation?" *Journal of Human, Nutrition and Dietetics* 14, 103–109.
- Salvy, S. J., Haye, de la K., Bowker, J. C. and Hermans, R. C. J. (2012). "Influence of Peers and Friends on Children's and Adoles-

scent's Eating and Activity Behaviors." *Physiology & Behavior* 106 (3), 369–378.

Stryker, S. (2006). "Traditional Symbolic Interactionism, Role Theory, and Structural Symbolic Interactionism. The Road to Identity Theory." In: Turner, J. H. (ed.) *Handbook of Sociological Theory*. Springer Science & Business Media, 211–231.

Tisenkopfs, T. and Grīviņš, M. (2018). TRANSMANGO projekta politikas rekomendācijas. Available at: <[http://www.bscresearch.lv/uploads/files/TRANSMANGO\\_rekomend%C4%81cijas\\_-\\_LV.pdf](http://www.bscresearch.lv/uploads/files/TRANSMANGO_rekomend%C4%81cijas_-_LV.pdf)> (accessed April 2019).

Veselīgs dzīvesveids. (2014). *DNB Latvijas barometrs* 69, 11. maijs. Available at: <[https://www.luminor.lv/sites/default/files/docs/preses\\_relizes/dnb-latvijas-barometrs-petijums-nr69.pdf](https://www.luminor.lv/sites/default/files/docs/preses_relizes/dnb-latvijas-barometrs-petijums-nr69.pdf)> (accessed April 2019).



Daugavpils Universitātes Akadēmiskais apgāds "Saule"  
Izdevējdarbības reģistr. apliecība Nr. 2-0197.  
Vienības iela 13, Daugavpils, LV-5401, Latvija